

July 19, 2018

To: Bob Peoples, Executive Director CARE and Scott Smithline, Director CalRecycle  
From: California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee (members listed below)

**Re: Advisory Committee Recommendations related to the *Draft California Carpet Stewardship Plan 2018-2022 (July 2018)***

As required by the Product Stewardship for Carpets Law (Public Resources Code Section 42970 - 42983), the California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee (“Advisory Committee”) has received a copy of the *Draft California Carpet Stewardship Plan 2018-2022 (July 2018)* from Carpet America Recovery Effort (“CARE”), the carpet stewardship organization, 30 days before the Plan will be submitted to CalRecycle.

Included in this letter are recommendations to CARE by the Advisory Committee based on the review of the *Draft California Carpet Stewardship Plan 2018-2022 (July 2018)*. As required in Section 42971.1, to the extent feasible these recommendations are to be incorporated into the carpet stewardship plan by CARE before being submitted to CalRecycle.

If CARE is unable to incorporate the recommendations, a written explanation must be provided to the Advisory Committee and CalRecycle. The explanation should detail whether CARE plans to incorporate the recommendations into a subsequent carpet stewardship plan or subsequent amendments to the Plan.

### **California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Members**

The Product Stewardship for Carpets Law (Public Resources Code Section 42970 - 42983), requires CalRecycle to appoint an Advisory Committee to provide recommendations to a carpet manufacturer or stewardship organization and to the department on carpet stewardship plans, plan amendments, and annual reports. An additional appointee to the Advisory Committee is also made by both the Senate Committee on Rules and the Speaker of the Assembly.

The Director of CalRecycle appointed the members to the California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee according to the general stakeholder categories recommended in the statute. The committee member from the Senate Committee on Rules has also been appointed. The committee member appointee from the Speaker of the Assembly has not yet been announced.

Agendas, meeting minutes and previous recommendations and committee supporting documents regarding the *Draft California Carpet Stewardship Plan 2018-2022* and the revised July 2018 Plan are posted on the CalRecycle Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee webpage at <http://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/Carpet/AdvisoryComm/default.htm>

Advisory Committee Members	Organizations	Representing
DOUG KOBOLD	County of Sacramento	Local Government
DOUGLAS WILLIAMS	Los Angeles Fiber Co./ Reliance Carpet Cushion	Collection and sorting, processing and manufacturing
ERIC NELSON	Interface	Carpet Mills, Collection, processing & recycling of carpet
FRANCO ROSSI	Aquafil USA	Processing & recycling of carpet, Manufacturing
GAIL BRICE	XT Green, Inc.	Processing & recycling of carpet
HOWARD SAPPER	Carpet Manufacturers Warehouse	Carpet Retailers
JOANNE BRASCH, Ph.D	CA Product Stewardship Council	Environmental Community
JOE YARBROUGH	The Carpet & Rug Institute	Carpet Mills
JOHN DAVIS	Mojave Desert & Mountain Recycling Integrated Waste Mgmt Joint Powers Authority	Local Government
KELLY MCBEE	Californians Against Waste	Environmental Community
NAT ISAAC	City of Los Angeles Bureau of Sanitation	Local Government
RACHEL PALOPOLI	Planet Recycling	Carpet Collections/Sorting
RACHEL ROSS	Tehama County Solid Waste Management Agency	Local Government
STEVE BELONG	Carpet, Linoleum, & Soft Tile Workers Local Union No. 12, District Council 16	Northern CA Floor Covering Finishing Trades Institute Joint Apprenticeship Training Committee
STEVE LANDRETH	ProSpectra Flooring	Senate Committee on Rules
WES NELSON	GreenWaste Carpet Recycling	Carpet Collections/Sorting
VACANT	To Be Appointed	Speaker of Assembly

### Advisory Committee Plan Review Meeting and Recommendations

The California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee met on July 17, 2018 to discuss the *Draft California Carpet Stewardship Plan 2018-2022 (July 2018)*, which was submitted to the Advisory Committee on July 13, 2018. All committee members attended the meeting in Sacramento except: Joe Yarbrough attended the meeting by teleconference; and John Davis and Rachel Ross were not able to attend. A quorum was met. Members of the public also attended at the Sacramento meeting and through the teleconference. The meeting was conducted in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

The Committee recommendations from the July 17, 2018 meeting regarding the *Draft California Carpet Stewardship Plan 2018-2022 (July 2018)* are provided on Attachment 1.

Respectfully,

*Rachel Palopoli*

Rachel Palopoli, Advisory Committee Chair

July 19, 2018

Date

**Attachment 1**  
**California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee**  
**Recommendations**

**#1 – HIGHEST RECYCLABILITY (TABLE 6)**

**Motion 1.1**

**The Committee recommends that CARE expand on the description and rational of the methodology used by the SPC in determining the Table 6 ratings for highest recyclability.**

Motion put forth by Gail Brice. Seconded by Kelly McBee

Ayes (10): Doug Kobold, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Joanne Brasch, Kelly McBee, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Wes Nelson

Nays: (4) Douglas Williams, Howard Sapper, Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth

Abstain: (0)

Non-Voting Members: (2)

**The Motion Passes**

**Motion 1.2**

**Original Motion: The Committee recommends that revisions to Table 6 are conducted within 6 months of Plan approval in a public process and as necessary thereafter; and that the process include coordination with DTSC to add toxics components and coordination with an independent consultant.**

Motion put forth by Kelly McBee. Seconded by Doug Kobold.

Ayes (6): Doug Kobold, Gail Brice, Joanne Brasch, Kelly McBee, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli

Nays: (8) Douglas Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Howard Sapper, Joe Yarbrough, Steve Belong, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Abstain: (0)

Non-Voting Members: (2)

**Motion Fails to Pass**

## Advisory Committee Recommendations (page 2 of 5)

**Amended Motion 1.2: The Committee recommends that revisions to Table 6 are conducted in a public process within 6 months of Plan approval and as necessary thereafter; and that the process includes coordination by an independent consultant.**

Motion put forth by Kelly McBee. Seconded by Joanne Brasch.

Ayes (12): Doug Kobold, Douglas Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, Kelly McBee, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Wes Nelson

Nays: (2) Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth

Abstain: (0)

Non-Voting Members: (2)

**Motion as Amended Passes.**

## #2 DIFFERENTIAL ASSESSMENTS

### **Motion 2.1**

**The Committee recommends that the Stewardship Organization implement a system of differential assessments, which could include a consumer rebate program, based on face-fiber type that correlates to the subsidy required to have it be economically recycled, with adequate time for implementation by January 1, 2020.**

Motion put forth by Eric Nelson. Seconded by Franco Rossi. Amended by Doug Kobold.

Ayes (13): Doug Kobold, Douglas Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, Kelly McBee, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays: (1): Joe Yarbrough

Abstain: (0)

Non-Voting Members: (2)

**The Motion Passes**

## Advisory Committee Recommendations (page 3 of 5)

### #3 SUBSIDIES

#### **Motion 3.1**

The Committee agrees with CalRecycle that because of the enactment of AB 1158, the approach CARE has taken regarding subsidies (such as for PET and Calcium Carbonate) that provide the greatest dollar amount per pound for materials that have the lowest commodity value and least recyclability no longer meets the statutory requirements.

The Committee recommends that a resubmitted Plan needs to define how CARE will determine highest recyclability and describe how it will ensure that the subsidies will incentivize recycling of these carpet materials. If CARE were to adopt a consumer rebate system, the Committee would consider that as an alternative for meeting the statutory requirements of the law to incentivize the highest recyclability.

Motion put forth by Joanne Brasch. Seconded by Rachel Palopoli.

Ayes (12): Doug Kobold, Douglas Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, Kelly McBee, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Wes Nelson

Nays: (1) Joe Yarbrough

Abstain: (1) Steve Landreth

Non-Voting Members: (2)

**The Motion Passes**

### #4 SOURCE REDUCTION

#### **Motion 4.1**

The Committee recommends rewriting the source reduction section of the Plan to include quantifiable and measurable activities addressing design for recycling. The source reduction section should also adhere to the waste management hierarchy defined in Public Resources Code Section 40051 and source reduction definition in Public Resources Code Section 40196.

Motion put forth by Gail Brice. Seconded by Nat Isaac.

## Advisory Committee Recommendations (page 4 of 5)

Ayes (12): Doug Kobold, Douglas Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Joanne Brasch, Kelly McBee, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays: (1) Howard Sapper

Abstain: (1) Joe Yarbrough

Non-Voting Members: (2)

**The Motion Passes**

### #5 Convenient Collections

#### **Motion 5.1**

**The Committee recommends that CARE, upon receipt of the convenience collection study, will share, meet and discuss the results and the potential for revisions to the Plan with the Advisory Committee.**

Motion put forth by Doug Kobold. Seconded Nat Isaac.

Ayes (14): Doug Kobold, Douglas Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, Joe Yarbrough, Kelly McBee, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays: (0)

Abstain: (0)

Non-Voting Members: (2)

**The Motion Passes**

**Advisory Committee Recommendations (page 5 of 5)**

**#6 Budget**

**Motion 6.1**

**The Committee recommends that CARE provide clarification and descriptions for the budget in line with CalRecycle’s recommendation to provide justification for allocations.**

Motion put forth by Nat Isaac. Seconded by Howard Sapper

Ayes (14): Doug Kobold, Douglas Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, Joe Yarbrough, Kelly McBee, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays: (0)

Abstain: (0)

Non-Voting Members: (2)

**The Motion Passes**