



July 31, 2019

To: Bob Peoples, Executive Director CARE and Scott Smithline, Director CalRecycle
From: California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee (members listed below)

**Re: Advisory Committee Recommendations related to the Draft CARE
California Carpet Stewardship Program 2018 Annual Report**

As required by the Product Stewardship for Carpets Law (Public Resources Code Section 42970 - 42983), the California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee ("Advisory Committee") has received a copy of the "Advisory Committee Review Draft dated July 11, 2019 titled *CARE California Carpet Stewardship Program 2018 Annual Report* ("Draft CARE California Carpet Stewardship Program 2018 Annual Report") required pursuant to Section 42979 from Carpet America Recovery Effort ("CARE"), the carpet stewardship organization. The Advisory Committee received the Draft Annual Report 30 days before submittal to CalRecycle as required in Section 42972.1 (b).

Included in this letter are recommendations to CARE by the Advisory Committee based on the review of the *Draft CARE California Carpet Stewardship Program 2018 Annual Report* during an in-person meeting on July 23, 2019. As required in Section 42971.1 (c), to the extent feasible the Advisory Committee's recommendations are to be incorporated into the Annual Report by CARE before being submitted to CalRecycle.

If CARE is unable to incorporate these recommendations, a written explanation must be provided to the Advisory Committee and CalRecycle. The explanation should detail whether CARE plans to incorporate recommendations into a subsequent Annual Report.

California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Members

The Product Stewardship for Carpets Law (Public Resources Code Section 42970 - 42983), requires CalRecycle to appoint an Advisory Committee to provide recommendations to a carpet manufacturer or stewardship organization and to the department on carpet stewardship plans, plan amendments, and annual reports. An additional appointee to the Advisory Committee is also made by both the Senate Committee on Rules and the Speaker of the Assembly.

The Director of CalRecycle appointed the members to the California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee according to the general stakeholder categories recommended in the statute. The committee member from the Senate Committee on Rules and the Speaker of the Assembly have also been appointed.

California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Members

Committee Members	Organizations	Representing
DOUGLAS WILLIAMS	Los Angeles Fiber Co./ Reliance Carpet Cushion	Collection and sorting, processing and manufacturing
ERIC NELSON	Interface	Carpet Mills, Collection, processing & recycling of carpet
FRANCO ROSSI	Aquafil USA	Processing & recycling of carpet, Manufacturing
GAIL BRICE	XT Green, Inc.	Processing & recycling of carpet
HOWARD SAPPER	Carpet Manufacturers Warehouse	Carpet Retailers
JOANNE BRASCH, Ph.D	CA Product Stewardship Council	Environmental Community
JOE YARBROUGH	The Carpet & Rug Institute	Carpet Mills
JOHN DAVIS	Mojave Desert & Mountain Recycling Integrated Waste Mgmt Joint Powers Authority	Local Government
JORDE OROZCO	SCOR Industries	Speaker of Assembly
NAT ISAAC	City of Los Angeles Environment and Sanitation	Local Government
RACHEL PALOPOLI	Planet Recycling	Carpet Collections/Sorting
ROBERT NUNEZ	Californians Against Waste	Environmental Community
STEVE BELONG	Carpet, Linoleum, & Soft Tile Workers Local Union No. 12, District Council 16	Northern CA Floor Covering Finishing Trades Institute Joint Apprenticeship Training Committee
STEVE LANDRETH	ProSpectra Flooring	Senate Committee on Rules
WES NELSON	GreenWaste Carpet Recycling	Carpet Collections/Sorting

Advisory Committee Plan Review Meeting and Recommendations

The California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee met on July 23, 2019 to discuss the Draft CARE California Carpet Stewardship 2018 Annual Report. All committee members attended the meeting in in-person except: Joe Yarbrough attended the meeting by teleconference but was unable to stay on the call and did not participate in the vote. A quorum was met. Members of the public also attended at the meeting and through the teleconference. The meeting was conducted in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

The Committee recommendations from the July 23, 2019 meeting regarding the *Draft California Carpet Stewardship 2018 Annual Report* are provided as Attachment 1. The committee looks forward to working with CARE and CalRecycle regarding the California Carpet Stewardship Program.

Respectfully,

Rachel Palopoli

Rachel Palopoli, Advisory Committee Chair

July 31,2019

Date

Attachment 1

California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Recommendations for the Draft CARE 2018 Annual Report

Motion 1.0

The Committee recommends that CARE makes the following changes to the Draft 2018 Annual Report:

- a) Add a row to table ES 1 and Table 1 showing the non-subsidized recycled output
- b) Add a description of the 25 million pounds of recycled output not eligible for the CARE subsidy
- c) Recalculate the reported diversion including carpet cushion
- d) Modify the narrative on page 136 to more accurately reflect the allocation of general program expenses or remove the first paragraph in section 7.3:
Cost per pound collected
- e) Identify lessons learned for major events that happened during 2018
- f) Remove references to sales tied to collection, or provide data to support statement(s) on pages 68 and 100
- g) Add a reference to the grant scoring criteria for 2018 grant recipients
- h) Add information on backstamping criteria and phase-in requirements for all manufacturers
- i) Provide missing information from Section 4.10 on Capacity necessary to review the Annual Report

Motion to Approve: John Davis

Second: Eric Nelson

Ayes (14): Eric Nelson, John Davis, Robert Nunez, Nat Isaac, Doug Williams, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Steve Belong, Franco Rossi, Wes Nelson, Steve Landreth, Jorge Orozco, Joanne Brasch, Rachel Palopoli

Nays (0):

Abstain (0):

Attended meeting, but Absent for vote: (1) Joe Yarbrough

The motion passes

Motion 2.0

Explain in more detail the impacts of oil prices, the China National Sword, and the relationship with the California overall recycling rate with CARE's performance

Motion: John Davis Second: Nat Isaac

Ayes (11): Eric Nelson, John Davis, Robert Nunez, Nat Isaac, Gail Brice, Steve Belong, Franco Rossi, Wes Nelson, Jorge Orozco, Joanne Brasch, Rachel Palopoli

Nays (3): Doug Williams, Howard Sapper, Steve Landreth

Abstain (0):

Attended meeting, but Absent for vote: (1) Joe Yarbrough

The motion passes

Motion 3.0

Acknowledge the input from Assembly Member Kansen Chu on highest recyclability on page 15 as provided in a letter to the Committee on 2/6/18

Motion: Joanne Brasch Second: John Davis

Ayes (8): Eric Nelson, John Davis, Robert Nunez, Gail Brice, Steve Belong, Franco Rossi, Joanne Brasch, Rachel Palopoli

Nays (6): Nat Isaac, Doug Williams, Howard Sapper, Wes Nelson, Steve Landreth, Jorge Orozco

Abstain (0):

Attended meeting, but Absent for vote: (1) Joe Yarbrough

The motion passes

Motion 4.0

Request that CARE asks CalRecycle to reconsider limitation on including status/projections from subsequent year in the Annual Report

Motion: John Davis Second: Howard Sapper

Ayes (3): John Davis, Franco Rossi, Joanne Brasch

Nays (8): Eric Nelson, Nat Isaac, Doug Williams, Howard Sapper, Wes Nelson, Steve Landreth, Jorge Orozco, Rachel Palopoli

Abstain (3): Robert Nunez, Gail Brice, Steve Belong

Attended meeting, but Absent for vote: (1) Joe Yarbrough

The motion does not pass

Motion 5.0

Describe the environmental impact information required associated with approving product development funding and infrastructure grants.

Motion: Gail Brice Second: Joanne Brasch

Ayes (2): Gail Brice, Joanne Brasch

Nays (9): Eric Nelson, Nat Isaac, Doug Williams, Howard Sapper, Steve Belong, Franco Rossi, Wes Nelson, Steve Landreth, Jorge Orozco

Abstain (3): John Davis, Robert Nunez, Rachel Palopoli

Attended meeting, but Absent for vote: (1) Joe Yarbrough

The motion does not pass

Motion 6.0

Address environmental concerns discussed by the Advisory Committee, such as PFAs and micro-fibers.

Motion: Joanne Brasch Second: Nat Isaac

Ayes (10): Eric Nelson, John Davis, Robert Nunez, Nat Isaac, Gail Brice, Steve Belong, Franco Rossi, Jorge Orozco, Joanne Brasch, Rachel Palopoli

Nays (4): Doug Williams, Howard Sapper, Wes Nelson, Steve Landreth

Abstain (0):

Attended meeting, but Absent for vote: (1) Joe Yarbrough

The motion passes