

Meeting Notes
CALRECYCLE ILLEGAL DUMPING TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING
Wednesday, November 18, 2020 – 12:30 p.m. - 4:30 p.m.
Microsoft Teams Meeting Platform

I. Call to Order

Chair Larry Sweetser called the meeting to order at 12:35 PM, welcomed the group, and asked for roll call.

II. Introduction of Members and Guests

Members Attending

Larry Sweetser, ESJPA, Chair

Veronica Pardo, RRCC

Kathy Lynch, CRRC

Doug Kobold, CPSC

Heidi Sanborn, NSAC

Christine Flowers, KCB

Mark de Bie, CalRecycle

Tedd Ward, Del Norte SWA

Mark Patti and Taylor Grimes, Mattress
Recycling Council

Rob Hutsel, SD River Park Foundation

Terri Alex, CEAC/LA Co PW

Frank Foster, City Oakland PW

Jamaica Moon, City Oakland PW

Bill Prinz, CCDEH/City of San Diego

Nick Lapis, Californians Against Waste

Tedd Ward, Del Norte County

Maria Ferdin, Monterey Co IDTAC

Chris Lehon, Sac Regional WMA

Mark Azzouni, CHMIA

Members Absent

Larry Notheis, CCC

Vacant, CDAA

Nick Cronenwett, CSAC

Gary Harris, City LA Code Enf

Tracie Glaves, Public Member

Dave Sikich, Waste Mgt Ind./Atlas

Trent Manning, Cal Trans

Jason Rhine, League of CA Cities

Others Attending

Sharon Anderson, CalRecycle

Jim Stone, San Joaquin County PW

Jaimie Huynh, CalRecycle

Iranzu Morras, Paint Care

Alyce Sandbach, Alameda Co. DA Office

Jennifer (Kibbe) Day, SJ Co. DA Office

Erin Armstrong, Alameda Co. BOS Dist. 4

Samantha Carr, Richmond Mayor's Office

Shane Diller, City of Elk Grove

Carlos Duque, City of Elk Grove

Adriana Ornelas, LA County PW

Rebecca Oliver, CalRecycle

Paulina Lawrence, CalRecycle

Lana Lief, CalRecycle

Patrick Snyder, CalRecycle

Kelsey Orr, CalRecycle

Nevin Yates, CalRecycle

Deidre Dingman, Contra Costa Co.

Jennifer Lombardi

Yvonne Franco

Kumari Gossai, LA Co Public Health

Zuna Barker, City of Pittsburgh

Hai Phan, City of Vallejo

Jose' Avila, Contra Costa Env. Health

Arthur Watson

Stephanie Becker, CalRecycle

Steve Santa Croce, CalRecycle

Clark Williams, CalRecycle

Kate Whitney, CalRecycle

Melissa Vargas, CalRecycle

Stephanie Fernandes, CalRecycle

Bea Poroli, CalRecycle

Dustin Schaivo, CalRecycle

Jo-Anmarie Ricasata

III. Approval of June 3, 2020 Meeting Minutes

The Committee approved the minutes with no edits; moved by Doug Kobold with a second by Tedd Ward for the vote, with Rob Hutsel abstaining.

IV. Old Business/Updates

A. Legislative and Regulation Updates

Larry Sweetser cued up legislative (AB - Assembly Bill and SB - Senate Bill) and regulatory activities that could impact/increase illegal dumping.

- SB 1383 regulatory development/implementation continues. Please see this [link](#) for information. Concern that more mandatory collection services of new materials might result in illegal dumping.
- Treated wood waste provision sunsets for alternative management, and Mr. Sweetser asked programs to keep an eye out for illegal dumping of treated wood waste. With no quick resolution. Doug Kobold asked for illegal dumping collection costs of treated wood waste. Email to Doug Kobold at Doug@calpsc.org. Mark de Bie, CalRecycle, and Kathy Lynch both offered information and are collaborating with DTSC for solutions. Ms. Lynch hopes for a bridge to avert environmental problems. Mr. Sweetser also asked for any information and photos regarding illegal dumping of treated wood waste.
- Solar Panels: the Department of Toxic Substances Control plans to develop regulations for disposal of solar panels. Current data indicates little illegal disposal of them; however, the planned regulations will include panels as universal waste, which will make panels easier to manage. Mark de Bie mentioned that CalRecycle has been asked to collaborate with DTSC on this topic to get information and potential guidance out to stakeholders.

B. Update: membership and IDTAC business

The Chair asked Ms. Anderson to provide an update on membership.

Resource Conservation Districts - may need representation and Stephanie Becker, CalRecycle, continues efforts for securing a representative.

California District Attorneys Association (or similar group) - needs representation to replace Matt Carr; the IDTAC seeks possible fill-in by Alyce Sandbach and Jennifer (Kibbe) Day.

County Supervisors Association of California - when contacted, Nick Cronenwett asked to have a supervisor or a representative from the County Engineers Association.

City of San Jose' needs a replacement for someone serving as an Environmental Services representative and pondered whether Olympia Williams of the City of San Jose', and/or Gonzalo Barriga from the City of Los Angeles would step in.

League of Cities representative has yet to participate in two years.

Private hauler/disposal site representation needs representation to replace Dave Sikich of Atlas. Doug Kobold asked if groups such as Recology were represented.

Since the committee is relatively informal, Chair Larry Sweetser mentioned that existing membership appears to represent the state geographically.

Chair and Vice Chair nominations: The Chair had previously requested nominations for chair and vice chair; however, no feedback was received. The committee approved Larry Sweetser

to continue as Chair during the November 18, 2020 meeting. The Chair explained the current structure of utilizing four subcommittees to develop new recommendations and resources on illegal dumping. Tedd Ward mentioned that a vice-chair would help fill in in the absence of the Chair and that person would need to head up a subcommittee for familiarity. Doug Kobold offered to serve as vice-chair and the committee approved. Chair Sweetser also posed the question about meeting more frequently than twice per year.

C. CalRecycle Cleanup Grants

Disposal Site Grants

Steve Santa Croce, CalRecycle, introduced Rebecca Oliver of his staff who presented information on [Illegal disposal site abatement grants](#) and the [Legacy disposal site abatement partial grant program](#) (weblinks embedded)

Illegal Disposal Site Abatement Grant key points for 2020/21 FY:

- \$1 million available yearly, with \$500K maximum award per grant. Typically, CalRecycle approves four to six grant awards per cycle. The program completed grant awards for the 2019/2020 fiscal year to the following grantees: City of Yuba City, City of San Pablo, City of San Diego, San Jacinto, and County of San Diego.
- The 2020/21 FY grant cycle current during the November 18 IDTAC meeting received six applications for disposal site cleanup and one for the legacy site grants, and scoring was underway. Staff anticipates awarding grantees during January 2021.
- Question: What does that do to the status of the funds? Is there money remaining? The illegal disposal site cleanup grants gets appropriated \$1M and CalRecycle receives typically \$3-\$5M in applications, so yes; the grant remains oversubscribed, with the full \$1M awarded. Further, Steve Santa Croce explained that CalRecycle also offers a program for agencies needing cleanup assistance by using state contractors via a consultant to cleanup legacy sites at disposal sites.
- Next grant cycle might be in February if funds remain, but most likely, the next cycle will occur in the upcoming fiscal year 2021/22. For future grant applications, please contact staff to see if projects are a good fit.

Contact Steve Santa Croce steve.santacroce@calrecycle.ca.gov or Rebecca Oliver rebecca.oliver@calrecycle.ca.gov for any questions on the grant process or the process for direct assistance as well.

Farm and Ranch Grant

Stephanie Becker, CalRecycle, presented information on the [Farm and Ranch Cleanup and abatement program](#)

- Provides funding to clean up illegal dumping on California's rural lands, farmland, forest lands, and urban gardens, appurtenant easements, homeless encampments, certain illegal marijuana grows, tire piles
- Eligible applicants: cities, counties, resource conservation districts (RCD), federal tribes
- Receives \$1M annually, with \$200K per applicant, capped at \$50K per site
- Award during three cycles per year. Currently active grantees as of November 18 IDTAC meeting included: Butte County, Butte County RCD, City of Santa Cruz, Coarsegold RCD,

Contra Costa RCD, Honey Lake Valley RCD, Kashia Band of the Pomo Indians of the Stewarts Point Rancheria, Los Angeles County, Mariposa County, Pit River Tribe, San Joaquin County, Shasta County, Sutter County RCD, Tahoe RCD, Trinity County RCD, Yolo County, Yolo County RCD, and the Yurok Tribe. Ms. Becker gave details on the nature of the projects within each award.

Stephanie Becker Stephanie.becker@calrecycle.ca.gov is available to do presentations, and encourages interested parties to sign up on the listserv for updates – see [listservs](#) managed by CalRecycle.

V. Presentation/Discussions

A. Discuss Observations Related to COVID-19

1. Impact on illegal dumping frequency

Larry Sweetser cued up the discussion regarding COVID-19 impacts that appear to have some impact on illegal dumping but not quantified. Larry asked if any members had illegal dumping data related to COVID restrictions. Doug Kobold mentioned thrift collection sites had been impacted by illegally dumped materials outside their storefronts. Larry asked about quantification of that issue. Doug also mentioned that perhaps CalRecycle could have a role in education and outreach if this issue occurs in the future. Tedd Ward indicated a marked increase in single use masks and gloves found in litter. Larry mentioned that the solid waste industry appears to be returning to normal. Material recovery facilities initially had impacts due to staffing issues and increased amount of materials recycled. Peter Schultze-Allen discussed an increase in illegal dumping pickups around the area of the peninsula of the San Francisco Bay area possibly due to stay-at-home orders and residents doing spring cleaning (and subsequently dumping materials illegally and/or for curbside pickup).

2. Observations regarding cleanups

The Committee discussed an initial decline in the frequency of community cleanups; however, members indicated a recent increase in independently organized cleanups. For instance, Rob Hutsel mentioned that the San Diego River Park Foundation started doing cleanups in June with smaller crews, more staff and fewer volunteers. They saw a 600% increase in number of encampments along the river between March and April, with the amount of trash associated at 50% of all time record highs. Rob mentioned that their data is available to all. Members discussed cleanups tools and groups such as [Litterati](#) and [UnTrash It](#) as response of people doing cleanups and developing tools on their own. Doug mentioned that these tools are similar to the [311](#) reporting tools. Christine Flowers mentioned two grant projects, one of which involves the [KCB litter application](#) that received funding from a Department of Water Resources grant for a two-year project along the American River Basin.

Larry mentioned a common theme for smaller groups coming together to conduct cleanups, and would recommend establishing a folder to collect information on this topic. The Standards Subcommittee might look into recommendations for best management practices for community cleanups during COVID times. Sharon mentioned the City of Elk Grove has been working on guidance for community cleanups.

B. Presentation from City of San Jose' - COVID-19:BeautifySJ Response (Postponed)

Olympia Williams - BeautifySJ Program Manager, Paul Pereira – Senior Policy Advisor

C. Presentation on Modoc County – A Rural Illegal Dumping Perspective

CalRecycle staff, Kate Whitney and Kelsey Orr, shared an overview of illegal dumping and observations related to the solid waste system in Modoc County. The county has the third lowest population in California, and is the twelfth largest. With only one active landfill and one medium volume transfer facility, the county generates about 6,000 tons of waste per year. Although there are six limited volume transfer operations, the locations are very spread out and not convenient for all residents. Most of the County's waste ends up in Nevada; however, with many residents not able to afford trash services, illegal dumping remains a problem. Residents have been known to fill abandoned RVs and trucks with trash, or burn trash. Recycling centers are often far away from residents and some residents receive only one bin for trash. Although code enforcement can be responsive, staffing levels and funding do not match the magnitude of the problem. Tedd Ward commented that in rural areas cleanup costs exceed the value of the property and creates a downward spiral and a solid waste system that is allowed to fail. Tedd Ward mentioned that flexibility might be needed for rural jurisdictions so that they can develop something that is better than what exists. Frank Foster mentioned appreciated the presentation since he deals with urban illegal dumping. This jurisdiction might be a good candidate for CalRecycle's grant programs. Doug Kobold asked if others can help with grant application writing and CalRecycle inferred that might be possible; however, grant administration cannot be reimbursed until the grant is awarded. Local Conservation Corps, non-profits, and franchise haulers could help communities by drafting the grant.

D. Presentation from City of Vallejo Code Enforcement – [IDEAL Vallejo Program](#)

Hai Phan, Deputy City Attorney, presented an overview of Vallejo's illegal dumping program involving Code Enforcement, Vallejo Police Department, Public Works and the City Attorney's office. The city has teams of four that pick up trash five days per week at a budget of \$650K annually. The program uses multiple cameras and signage throughout the city covering both public and private property. The City Council pushed solutions of education (illegal dumping hot spot letters, door hangers, brochures, new website), criminal prosecutions, and road closures. The city's municipal code allows prosecution of these cases with punishment involves the person paying for the cleanup. 50% of the award that leads to prosecution goes to the witness, and often the "fine" involves 50-100 hours of community service that also serves as an educational component. Road closures occur for up to 18 months and has reduced illegal dumping dramatically. The IDTAC asked questions about how to get surveillance cameras on power poles. Hai Phan explained several options such as contacting PG&E, using solar, installing on city-owned poles, and/or to get permission to place cameras on private properties especially in hot spots. Additional conversation centered on methods to gain access from PG&E to use their poles, and success of cameras for prosecution and trials.

E. Update from Mattress Recycling Council ([MRC](#))

- Mark Patti provided two updates. Taylor Grimes will take over responsibilities on special projects including participation on the IDTAC.

- MRC put out a Request for Proposal (RFP) for illegally dumped materials. Identified organizations that participate in the illegally dumped mattress initiative. The RFP focuses on top twenty locations that had the highest per-capita dumping in their communities. Five applications received for the pilot projects, awards in early December 2020.

F. Review Local Illegal Dumping Initiatives

Larry Sweetser opened the conversation to discuss updates from local programs to help elevate illegal dumping best practices. Melissa Vargas of CalRecycle offered to help gather updates from local jurisdictions regarding illegal dumping via her position with Local Assistance and Market Development.

No other updates provided at this time.

G. IDTAC Workplan – Review Progress

1. Toolbox status update

CalRecycle staff continues to work on essential updates. Staff will begin planning in-depth updates to the toolbox and webpages once the full IDTAC receives information and provides recommendations about the subcommittee’s tools and resources.

CalRecycle staff, Jaimie Huynh presented the latest version of the [GeoMap](#) for reporting illegal dumping anywhere in California using contact or program information gathered from each city and county via web searches. This effort helps meet an IDTAC objective to assist the public. Comments include; make city and county outlines differing colors, add a comment section regarding waterways, share the resource among cities and counties, could the map to geolocate the user, how to make it useful for a local jurisdiction, determine maintenance allowed by jurisdictions, and comments due by December 30, 2020.

Larry also discussed the use of the Teams platform for sharing information.

2. Work plan and [Subcommittee](#) Updates

Larry Sweetser opened the discussion praising the work of the IDTAC subcommittees. He expressed that the IDTAC is not looking for a final product, but instead wishes to check in on developments. He also identified a need for communication between groups.

Working from prior guidance to the Subcommittees, the framework for the progress report includes:

- identify top two to three priorities for your subcommittee
- identify what makes those priorities important
- what’s needed for implementation (what’s the strategy that shows how to move a priority forward)
- identify needed resources for each priority
- topics that might be directed to other subcommittees
- what does success look like

a. [The Strategy SubCommittee determined at least three key priorities:](#)

1. Elevate the existing Toolbox

- Add social media and multi-agency coordination
- Make toolbox a one-click on CalRecycle/CalEPA home page drop downs

- Include the 3 E's (Education, Eradication, Enforcement) wrapped into the PACE/Outreach pillars as established by the IDTAC (elaborate on parts as expressed by members)
 - Include checklists for several components
2. Elevate and modify Homeless Encampment cleanups
 - Get more involved with groups/committees so cleanup aspects become part of policy consideration
 3. Predict future illegal dumping needs, such as move-outs as a result of COVID-19 effects on economy, housing, valuation of products and materials
 - Seek additional partners such as Real Estate Board, property management companies
 - Identify methods to value packaging and other materials and/or develop guidance to prevent materials from becoming waste/litter
- Comments:* add part about illegal dumping cleanup exceeds the cost of property. Zero Waste Council can help with campus move-outs. Larry asked if there was any need from other groups, or overlap with other Subcommittees, and yes, Outreach Subcommittee.
- Next steps:* Determine how to deal with overlap. Outline a checklist and partnerships; identify others to link with; check in with CalRecycle staff for elevating the toolbox by possibly including an icon on the main website.

b. The Outreach SubCommittee identified a key priority

What is education/outreach and how do we strengthen it?

Observations:

- Strong synchronicity between education and enforcement
- Community involvement is critical
- Education must be adapted depending on who is the audience
- Everyone needs a win!

Importance - they help create a more successful illegal dumping management program.

Success = sustainable and effective programs at the community level

Comments: Identify how to embed education into all the elements of the toolbox.

Larry expressed interest in expanding on each of the four bullets above. Identify examples of education/outreach for what works and doesn't work. Include efforts of best management practices for community organizing. Pursue restructuring toolbox to make it more accessible to the public.

Next steps: Add elements for community organizing, work with other subcommittees, identify methods to include equity in best practices.

c. The Standards/Training/Data SubCommittee developed two key priorities, training and data criteria:

Training: The subcommittee developed a comprehensive matrix of proposed training as well as a guide that explains the matrix. The draft guide is included below, and the draft matrix is available upon request by emailing [Sharon Anderson](#) at CalRecycle.

[Draft Training Matrix Guide](#)

Illegal dumping crews encounter variety of potential hazards during clean-up

activities. This Training Matrix and Guide provides a framework for potentially applicable health and safety, emergency services, and law enforcement trainings. Each illegal clean up situation should be assessed for which training are applicable. The illegal Dumping Training Matrix categorizes four major groups that are involved in cleaning up illegal dumping sites. This document provides a framework for applicable training recommendations for each group. Other types of clean up groups may exist and can utilize these recommendations as needed. Each group has specific training requirements for the staff involved in the cleanup but also additional requirements for the personnel supervising the clean-up activity. These supervisory personnel need awareness of potential situations that might require additional measures or notification of emergency services or law enforcement.

Volunteer/Community Groups

These groups are organized to conduct periodic clean ups of areas in their communities, often on a voluntary basis. These cleanups often occur in neighborhood, parks, and waterways. Training needs are basic to protect their health and safety and to recognize the need for a supervisor to determine if additional services are required to address a situation. These potential situations include: a hazardous waste collections, a crime scene, disposal of drug lab wastes, or other conditions that may jeopardize the safety of the personnel.

Public Works/Parks/Contracted

Public works personnel, parks department staff, and entities contracted to clean up illegal disposal events on a routine basis commonly encounter situations with a variety of solid wastes including trash and larger items like mattresses and furniture. These clean ups are often in response to reported incidents. The size of these range from a discrete pile to a larger areas of community dumping locations. Low level hazardous wastes are common at these cleanup sites and often include but not limited to electronics, paint, and automotive chemicals. These hazardous wastes are either removed from the site to a service yard, delivered to a Household Hazardous Waste facility, or arrangements are made for a hazardous waste contractor to collect the hazardous waste from the location.

HazMat Team

Hazardous materials teams are either contracted personnel or are agency staff that conduct cleanups of sites that are recognized as uncontrolled hazardous waste sites containing significant amounts of hazardous waste or hazardous waste that pose a risk to public health or the environment. These crews are subject to the Hazardous Waste Operations and Emergency Response (HAZWOPER) standards of California Code of Regulations. Title 22, Section 5192 (a)(1).

Homeless Encampment

Homeless encampment involve specialized cleanups due to the nature of the locations where one or more homeless people live in an unsheltered area usually without benefit of sanitary services. Clean up of these sites occurs after authorities evict the homeless tenants who may leave behind their possessions, solid wastes, abandoned vehicles, dead animals, and human waste. Some hazardous wastes may be present, but a primary hazard is human waste, possible drug related paraphernalia

including needles, and potentially infectious waste.

Training Requirements

The training requirements are grouped into occupational safety trainings to address potential issues applicable to the clean-up situation and law enforcement related trainings. Each of the occupational safety trainings has specific regulatory requirements that may apply to the specific situation or activities conducted at the site. Not all trainings are applicable, and some activities may not fit in specific regulatory requirements. Some trainings may be combined with other trainings depending upon applicability. Trainings on this list can be reviewed for applicability and then the training can be provided to the staff participating in the cleanup. A fundamental concept of under safety requirements is the General Duty Clause requiring employers to keep their workplaces free of serious recognized hazards. *Comments:* What qualifications would be needed when looking for a contractor to do cleanups, such as a demolition contractor. Regarding homeless encampments may need to rethink using the term eviction. Separate contracted aspect from actual public works employees.

Next step: how to convey all parts into a training without taking away from getting the cleanup work done.

Develop data criteria – the members recommend the following proposed basic categories for tracking illegal dumping by agencies to allow cumulating data statewide on the magnitude of cleanups. The simpler the list, the more likely it will be completed. The proposed units for each item are in cubic yards to facilitate field measurements.

- Solid waste/Trash – mixed materials that are segregated
- Metal – larger metallic items
- Hazardous waste – all types except e-waste
- E-waste – This is a significant portion and worthy of tracking
- Sharps
- Furniture – small and large items
- Appliances – range from refrigerators to table top items and may require special handling
- Tires
- Mattresses – A common item that has funding available
- Recyclables – CRV, paper
- Feces, urine – require special handling
- Dead animals - require special handling
- Other – miscellaneous category

Comments: add encampments as a data category. Have consistent categories. Possibly use FACET as a model, open portal platform. Make sure everything fits and has a home without a lot of effort on the part of the user. KCB also has data categories and will share. Geomapping would be useful to have. Data is important for planning.

Next steps: Will reach out to enforcement subcommittee. Will continue to refine the data components.

d. The Enforcement Subcommittee outlined six priorities and two recommendations:

- Develop information towards the creation of a statewide training program for illegal dumping enforcement officers: a POST-certified environmental law enforcement officer. Critical: the value of this particular training program will depend on the nature of the enforcement authority held by the agency (i.e., agencies with administrative authority only may not benefit from training programs that support officers with peace officer authority to issue citations to traffic court).
- Gather information regarding which agencies have used cameras for illegal dumping enforcement and collect key details about their programs, to help improve the use of cameras and to aid those considering buying them.
Critical: a camera program's success is dependent on whether there are resources for follow-up investigations.
- Develop a list of laws relevant to illegal dumping (including local ordinances that other jurisdictions may want to consider)
- Gather sample documents such as criminal complaints, warning letters, notices to abate, requests to contact.
- Share case studies internally to illustrate what works and doesn't work.
- All the above includes some informal networking with others in enforcement in other jurisdictions, and members developed an informal directory of those enforcement contacts.

Recommendations:

- Add to toolkit: list members of this subcommittee, as persons to contact for questions and additional materials. This would be part of short paragraph regarding what this subcommittee does. Subcommittee will submit draft proposed language.
- Support for subcommittee's creation of an enforcement general membership to help share ideas, contribute resources, lend general support to other enforcement officers around state who are grappling with same issues. Members are already in touch informally with many such as Los Angeles District Attorney staff who expressed interest in being in the loop, and has ideas to contribute on what has worked on illegal dumping legislation in past. NYC has strong enforcement program.

VI. New Business

A. Additional Items/Updates

Action items on subcommittees, Larry and Doug will discuss future items.

Will begin meeting quarterly.

B. Next Meeting – February 24, 2021 (Edited)