

0:13

Cutting climate pollution and creating jobs. CalRecycle's historic investment in local food and yard waste recycling,

0:19

plus new funding to make redemption easier, as California adds wine and spirits to its beverage container recycling program in Dover run

0:27

by illegal dumping, alcohol recycle grants help restore farm and ranchland.

CalRecycles.

0:33

Public meeting starts now. Good morning, everyone, and thank you for joining us.

0:39

For CalRecycle's December 2023 Public Meeting, the last public meeting of the year.

0:44

This meeting is for California and by Californians as we work together to protect our communities and fight climate change,

0:51

to serve people of differing abilities and to comply with requirements of the American Disabilities Act.

0:57

CalRecycle provides closed captions for publicly viewed meetings because live captioning requires

1:03

some voice recognition software, some errors may occur. Here is information about our Spanish language interpretation.

1:13

Language shouldn't be a barrier when it comes to protecting our air, water and land.

CalRecycle is simulcasting this meeting in both English and Spanish.

1:21

Click the public meeting banner at the top of [CalRecycle.ca.gov](https://calrecycle.ca.gov) for a link to our webcasts in English and Spanish.

1:28

If you're attending this meeting in person in Byron Shur auditorium, we have Spanish interpretation devices available.

1:34

Let our team on the left hand side of the dias know if you need one. (In Spanish) Shouldn't be a barrier.

1:46

And so CalRecycle is broadcasting simultaneously this public meeting in both English and Spanish.

1:51

You can find the link both in English and in Spanish. In the authors on the technical website.

2:02

Okay, I'll be (in

2:08

Spanish) .

2:18

Our first agenda item today is the director's report. CalRecycle Director Rachel Machi Wagoner joins us now with some important updates.

2:25

Good morning, Rachel. Good morning and thank you, Maria. And thank you all for being here today.

2:31

It is so great to have so many people in person. And for those of you that are joining remotely, welcome, Welcome

2:40

to the simulcast. We really are very excited to bring today's

2:45

final 2023 agenda to all of you and look forward to the conversation.

2:51

First and foremost, I just want to share how excited we are to get our organics recycling grants out today

3:00

and excited to talk more with all of you about how that is going to facilitate

3:06

7.7 million tons of organic waste recycling. And as we all know, the importance that that play the role that that plays in

3:16

fighting climate change and the leadership role that California has in facilitating

3:23

hopefully global change and how we look at our organic materials not as a waste stream, but rather as an opportunity

3:31

like the olive tree we were seeing earlier to grow healthier and more successful produce here in California and beyond.

3:39

We have a lot of things on our agenda today, and I know a lot of people are here to participate.

3:45

So with that, I think I'm just going to turn it right back over. I think it's to Erin, who's going to talk to us a little bit

3:52

about the legislation as we head into the 2024 year. Thank you.

4:03

Okay. And so now we'll get an update from Deputy Director Erin Rodriguez on other changes ahead.

4:10

Thank you so much, Maria and Rachel. I will go over the bills that Governor Newsom signed during the most recent

4:15

legislative session, which, if you can believe it was just earlier this year. And we will be heading into a two year session in just two weeks now.

4:24

So I'll do an overview of the a couple of the bills that were signed this year. AB 1548 AB 1548 specifies that organic waste infrastructure

4:34

such as material recovery, sorting and baling equipment are eligible expenditures under the existing grant and loan program administered by CalRecycle.

4:44

SB 568 is related to E-waste export. This bill requires exporters of covered electronic waste to declare.

4:53

In a report submitted by the Department of Toxic Substance Control that they attempted to locate an in-state e-waste recycling facility

5:01

before exporting the waste for recycling or landfill disposal. Under this DTSC Department of Toxic Substance Control

5:08

is authorized to find anyone making a false statement up to \$1,000. AB 1526 is a fun one.

5:15

It's a committee omnibus bill, and it was the Natural Resources Committee omnibus bill.

5:21

It made various technical and clarifying changes to the public resource code. But most importantly and excitingly, it did add aerosol paint to the existing

5:30

extended producer responsibility Architectural Paint Recovery program. We look forward to adding those new materials into our existing EPR.

5:38

SB 353 by Senator Dodd makes various changes to the Beverage container recycling program

5:45

to update the program, provide additional funding to a system recycling centers and a clean cleanup of statute.

5:51

For program updates, it adds all fruit and vegetable juice regardless of the container size to the beverage container recycling program.

6:00

It also modernizes the BPRP by providing more flexibility in who is considered a beverage manufacturer for wine and distilled spirits.

6:08

For funding that provides additional support to recycling centers and authorizes CalRecycle to make changes to processing payments using

6:16

either the preceding 12 or three months scrap value, whichever is lower.

6:21

It also provides rural recycling centers with funding for glass due to the increased transportation costs anticipated with the inclusion

6:29

of the new beverage container from SB 1013, which was signed in 2022. And then last, SB 613 expands the waiver for low population

6:38

jurisdictions under California's organic waste recycling law. SB 1383

6:44

It allows jurisdictions that did not meet the 2014 deadline for submission of the low population waiver

6:51

applications to submit required data and qualify for the waiver. And last, it extends the exemption date for jurisdictions

6:58

that currently hold low population waivers to December 1st, 2028. CalRecycle will be allowed to renew waivers beginning January 1st, 2027.

7:08

That's it. Thank you. Thank you, Erom. Eron Rodriguez, our legislative director.

7:15

So today, as the director referenced, CalRecycle is announcing a \$130.6 million in grant awards.

7:24

The department's. Scrutinizing organic waste as half of Californians throw away.

7:30

To help more California communities cut landfill pollution through food and yard waste recycling.

7:35

But first, here's a quick look at how organics infrastructure investments are creating jobs and cutting climate pollution across the state.

7:43

Okay, Now. Food and other organic waste is half of what Californians throw away rotting in landfills.

7:52

This organic waste gives off methane pollution, which has 84 times more climate heating power than carbon dioxide.

7:58

To fight climate change and feed Californians, nearly a half billion dollars in organics recycling and food

8:03

rescue funding is moving California to a waste free future. It's a lot of fun to be able to say that we've taken 2 million tons out of that landfill.

8:12

That's that's pretty awesome. Across the state, CalRecycle's organics recycling and food rescue grantees are

8:18

working to cut climate pollution equal to taking over 830,000 cars off the road.

8:23

With organics recycling infrastructure projects turning a major source of climate pollution into circular economy climate solutions.

8:31

That grant made a huge impact for this facility. And also allowed us to go out and get the equipment that we wanted to get.

8:37

A new storage tank, which is funded by CalRecycle, pretty much doubling the amount that we can accept helping grant recipients turn formerly

8:45

landfill material into products like biofuel to power fleets and businesses and compost to help soil retain more water, make our food

8:52

more nutritious, and to pull planet heating carbon from the air. At 100,000 tons a year, we sell out every year.

9:00

We can't make enough compost to to serve the valley right now. Now, \$130 million in new organics

9:06

infrastructure investments will help accelerate California's climate progress. Instead of those harmful.

9:11

Materials being placed into the landfill, they actually will be turned. Into valuable products that help increase our climate resilience.

9:18

Helping California lead the nation on climate action to keep food, yard and other organic waste from creating methane pollution in landfills.

9:25

As 75% of California communities now report organics collection for recycling. By recycling organic waste—paper, cardboard, food waste, green waste,

9:35

we can have an immediate impact on battling climate change. And I think that's really empowering

9:41

to know that I can actually do something about it and I can actually realize the benefits of it in my lifetime.

9:53

And now the Division of the Circular Economy. Deputy Director Zoe Heller joins us with the latest organics grant awards.

9:59

Good morning, Zoe. Morning, Maria. Good morning, everybody. I know you've heard this number a couple of times now, but we're just very excited to announce

10:06

that \$130.6 million will be going out the door to 23 applicants to support 1383 compliance.

10:14

If you look at the map, you can see the geographic diversity throughout the state and awards include seven compost, seven anaerobic digestion or codigestion,
10:23

five stand alone pre-processing and five in vessel projects. These grant funded projects will keep will cut climate pollution by over 2 million
10:32

metric tons, and that's an equivalent to keeping 445,000 cars off the road.
10:37

They also create 114 new jobs in California.
10:43

Back to you, Maria. Next, we have an SB 1383 implementation update from director
10:51

deputy director Cara Morgan, who is joining us remotely today. She's the deputy director over Materials Management and Local Assistance.
10:59

Good morning, Cara. Good morning, Maria. I'm so sorry I can't be there in person,
11:05

but I'm happy to see you all remotely. So this next agenda item concerns and SB 1383
11:12

Article two Alternative Technology Determination. I'd like to begin with a little background on the purpose and scope of Article two,
11:21

SB 1383 requires California to implement strategies to reduce greenhouse
11:26

gas emissions like landfill methane emissions from disposed organic waste. Under SB 1383, a reduction in landfill
11:34

disposal must reduce the physical presence of organic waste in landfills and reduce those associated greenhouse gas emissions.
11:44

Article two of the regulations identifies the activities and operations that meet the standard.
11:51

It also contains a process to evaluate operations or facilities not explicitly listed under Article two,
11:59

as explained in the request for action on a monthly meeting agenda and Article
12:04

two, technology determination is limited in its scope and application.
12:09

The determination allows a technology to count as a reduction in landfill disposal for purposes of SB 1383 regulations
12:19

if it achieves the required greenhouse gas emission reductions.
12:24

For clarification, Article two is not an endorsement of a technology.

12:31

It does not constitute a permit or permit approval. It does not impact existing or proposed solid waste facility permits.

12:39

It does not constitute a license or certification, and it does not mean a proposed technology deemed to be

12:46

a reduction in landfill disposal under SB 1383 would not be considered landfill disposal under other related laws.

12:55

A project would be subject to all statutory and regulatory requirements, including secure permit review and approval processes,

13:03

and must comply with all other existing statutes and regulations.

13:09

Now I'll turn to the article two Technology Determination application submitted by H Cycle in July of 2023.

13:17

CalRecycle in consultation with the California Air Resources Board, determined the application was complete

13:26

as part of CalReCycle's commitment to transparency, the H Cycle application documents were made available for public review and comment.

13:35

An email request for comments was sent via our SB 1383 short lived climate pollution ListServ.

13:42

The 30 day public comment period was held from August 15 through September 16th, 2023.

13:49

CalRecycle received 19 comment letters which are attached to this agenda item.

13:54

H Cycle's application includes operational controls, recordkeeping and reporting,

14:02

and third party verification to ensure a facility using this technology achieves

14:07

the required greenhouse gas emission reductions in practice. A life cycle evaluation the application was conducted

14:15

by CalRecycle in consultation with the California Air Resources Board. CalRecycle also included additional monitoring

14:24

and verification procedures that will be effective at determining if a facility using the technology

14:31

described in the application is achieving the required amount of greenhouse gas emission reductions in practice.

14:39

These are detailed on pages eight and nine of the request for action.

14:45

Any finding by CalRecycle that the H Cycle technology as described in the application,

14:50

constitutes a reduction in landfill disposal, is contingent upon these monitoring and verification procedures and control being in place.

15:00

If these procedures are not followed, any determination that the technology

15:05

does represent a reduction in landfill disposal will not be applicable, and any waste sent to such a facility likely will be deemed disposal

15:13

CalRecycle staff in consultation with the California Air Resources

15:18

Board, reviewed H Cycle's application and found the permanent life

15:24

cycle Greenhouse gas emissions reduction is equal to or greater than the emissions reductions from composting organic waste,

15:33

and can be determined to be a reduction in landfill disposal, under the analysis and methodology prescribed by our regulations.

15:41

In 14 CCR, Section 18983.2

15:47

the additional monitoring and verification procedures and controls that I have mentioned will allow CalRecycle to validate

15:55

that the technology described in H Cycle's application will continually achieve the

16:01

permanent life cycle reduction and green greenhouse gas emissions requirement. The application details staff analysis and public feedback are included in this

16:11

agenda item and can be found on the public notice linked in today's agenda.

16:17

Based on the information and analysis provided in the request for action,

16:22

including the additional monitoring and verification procedures and as required by 14 CCR, Section 18983.2

16:32

Action is needed by January 16th, 2024. Back to Maria.

16:39

Thank you, Cara. We have just been informed that CalRecycle's website is experiencing

16:45

technical difficulties and is not accessible at this time. The Cal EPA video player accessible through Cal EPA dot

16:52

sec.gov is still working, but we are while we are working to get this resolved as soon as possible, we want you to know that a recording of

17:00

today's public meeting will be available online in the coming days, and we'll have that in both Spanish and English.

17:08

Moving on to new laws in the new year. As California advanced. Oh, sorry. This is the part we really did.

17:16

So we're just 12 days away from the wine and spirits joining the California bottle bill.

17:22

The program has worked to keep nearly a half trillion beverage containers off of our streets and out of landfills in the past three decades.

17:29

Here's a quick look at what's changing in the new year. California, starting January 1st, all wine and liquor containers

17:37

and juice in a bottle or can will be added to the beverage container recycling program.

17:43

That's right. You can take these containers to a recycling center or participating dealer to redeem your deposits.

17:51

Here are tips to help you understand the changes. You can redeem any wine, liquor or juice bottles

17:56

with or without a CRV label on the containers. If you pay CRV when you purchase the item.

18:02

Plastic, glass, aluminum, and bimetal containers less than 24 ounces have a five cent CRV value.

18:08

Containers 24 ounces or more have a ten cent CRV value. You can also redeem wine and liquor boxes, cartons and pouches.

18:17

Those containers have a CRV value of \$0.25. Nonalcoholic beverages, boxes,

18:22

cartons and pouches are not part of the program. Bag in boxes must be intact.

18:28

Bag, box, and spigot as a single unit to be redeemed at a recycling center

18:34

or retailer found on CalRecycle's website. Help us cut litter and trash by redeeming all of these beverage containers.

18:42

Get more information at RecycleCRV.com

18:47

California's historic bottled water reforms also include new funding to make redemption more convenient for Californians.

18:54

Deputy Director Zoe Heller will share more in the next agenda item.

18:59

California has collected more than 491 billion bottles and cans since our bottle bill took effect.

19:05

We are working to push that number even higher with a \$40 million in Redemption Innovation grant funding to support innovative recycling programs

19:14

like mobile recycling, reverse vending machines, or backdrop programs. Also, support for existing and new recycling center businesses, new

19:22

opportunities for dealers and community service programs and outreach efforts. For dealers, existing and new recycling centers.

19:30

grant awards can range from \$500000 to \$3 million. For dealers, reverse vending machine projects and community service projects,

19:38

grant awards can range from 75000 to \$300000.

19:43

Projects that provide CRV redemption in disadvantaged or underserved communities will be given priority.

19:50

You can read more about the funding criteria linked to today's agenda. The grant application will be available soon this winter.

19:58

So thank you for your participation in our Beverage Container Grant webinar and providing comments to help us shape this program and others.

20:05

So speaking of others, additional support for beverage container recycling includes 10 million and grant awards for the local conservation corps.

20:13

Projects focused on beverage container litter cleanup and collection in underserved areas.

20:18

Each eligible applicant will be awarded an equal share of the \$7 million is a base grant award.

20:25

The remaining \$3 million will be production based. Applications are set to open next month.

20:32

The application for the Workforce Development Grant Program is also set to open next month for \$5 million in grant awards

20:39

to support employment and training for new workforce to provide California consumers with convenient opportunities to redeem CRV.

20:47

Applicants will be required to submit a workforce development plan. Cal Recycle will soon post more information, including

20:54

funding details, eligibility requirements and deadlines. We will be sending the criteria out on our listserv and welcome

21:01

your comments through the end of the calendar year. Up next, we're announcing a \$1

21:06

million award for California RVM Solutions for the Sacramento County Beverage Container Recycling Pilot Project.

21:14

The project will include redemption opportunities like backdrop, reverse vending machines and a traditional wait and pay method.

21:22

Consumers can print a voucher for immediate cash payment or be paid electronically through the California RVM Solutions Mobile app.

21:32

Today, we also have a new Farm and Ranch Cleanup Grant Award. The program has helped clean more than 1000 illegal dumpsites so far.

21:40

Let's take a look at a recent Yuba County cleanup before we get to the new award.

21:45

A peach orchard is flourishing again in the heart of Yuba County after a \$154,000 CalRecycle funded illegal dumping cleanup.

21:54

I would say there's easily debris out here dumped at least once a month. The piles of trash grew

21:59

so much in this orchard and neighboring properties in the Central Valley community of Olivehurst that they were visible from Highway 70.

22:06

Yuba Sutter County Resource Conservation District says it has been able to remove over 100 tons of waste to date.

22:13

We've had anything from tires, sofas and couches, refrigerators, freezers, washers, dryers, wood, scrap.

22:20

Illegal dumping with slowing down operations at the peach Orchard, threatening employee safety and raising concerns about fires and toxic contamination.

22:28

All of those waterways within orchards and next to the levee systems, they can contaminate the fish habitat.

22:36

Wildlife habitat can go into the river and on downstream. Grant funded gates, fines and surveillance cameras are now in place

22:43

to keep illegally dumped trash and spoiling the harvest. Giving the land back to farmers to feed Californians.

22:55

Today, CalRecycles announcing over \$180,000 in grants to three applicants,

23:01

including two resource conservation districts in one county. You can read more about each project in today's agenda.

23:07

Grant funds will be used to restore these lands and install signage and fencing to prevent future illegal dumping.

23:16

We're announcing 6 million in funding to 187 local governments as part of CalRecycle's used oil payment program.

23:23

Created in 1991, the program helps local governments develop and maintain used oil

23:29

and oil filter collection and recycling programs like used oil drop off locations,

23:34

oil filter exchange events, curbside collection programs and outreach events.

23:40

These programs help California recycle over 98 million gallons of used oil every year.

23:46

We are also announcing 1.5 million in household hazardous waste grant programs, awards to 25 applicants.

23:53

Since 2005, the program has expanded HHW collection programs to keep 1.5 billion pounds of household hazardous

24:01

waste out of our communities and out of our landfills. The latest round of grant awards will support local waste reduction

24:07

collection and recycling of each HHW. 29 communities will receive more than \$4.8 million to pave local roads,

24:16

using recycled tires to make rubberized asphalt, concrete or rubberized chip seal.

24:22

Beyond the environmental benefits, this material performs better and lasts longer than traditional asphalt.

24:28

It also reduces costs for local projects, since the material can usually be applied half as thick as conventional asphalt overlays and can last up to 50% longer.

24:38

California capped over 12.2 million waste tires out of landfills and communities thanks to this grant program, which is funded, funded through a \$1.75

24:47

cent fee on the purchase of new tires. All right, moving on to our loans,

24:53

we also have a recycling market development zone loan announcement today.

Pinnpack Capital Holdings will use its 3.5 million RMDZ

25:03

loan to purchase and upgrade equipment to recycle more material. The company uses recycled bottles and clamshells

25:09

to make new food grade packaging, which is also recyclable. The upgrades will increase recycled material

25:16

use from 2800 tons to over 5800 tons per year.

25:22

And I just want to acknowledge we made a lot of announcements today on grants and loans, and that's due to the commitment

25:28

of our grants and loans team and all of our supporting staff. So just a big thank you to them. This is these are big projects that make a huge difference on the ground.

25:36

Back to you, Maria. Thank you, Zoe. And I'm happy to tell you that CalRecycle's website calrecycle.ca.gov is

25:43

has been back up for the last few minutes, so we apologize for any inconvenience. I also want to give you a quick reminder about upcoming grant deadline.

25:51

Applications are due next month for farm and ranch cleanup grants, beverage container recycling, city county payment program awards,

25:59

and the community composting for green Spaces Grant Program.

26:04

To more fully engage with Californians on our monthly public meeting agenda items, CalRecycle is moving to an all live public comment submission process.

26:13

Instead of submitting written comments online, you can now address agenda items directly with CalRecycle, either in person or over the phone

26:20

during the public meeting. Here's how California wants your input on recycling and trash pollution issues.

26:27

Join CalRecycle's decision making process by making a live public comment on any of today's monthly public meeting agenda items in person or by phone.

26:35

Microphones are available for those of you in the room with in-person comments. If you're joining remotely, you can call in with your comments.

26:41

Just click the public media banner at the top of our website and click the public comments button for step by Step Color Instruction.

26:48

We will address live public comments at the end of the meeting.

26:55

It sounds like we already have quite a few callers in queue, but we will be addressing comments

27:00

in just a few minutes at the end of the meeting. So CalRecycle is working to implement historic circular economy reforms,

27:09

and I wanted to remind you that there's still time for interested parties to submit SB 54 Producer Responsibility Organization applications.

27:17

The deadline is January 1st, 2024, just around the corner. More application information is available on our website.

27:25

Draft regulations are coming soon as the department continues to host informative workshops. Sign up for SB 54 Listserv for updates

27:34

and now Deputy Director Zoe Heller will give us updates on our other extended producer responsibility programs.

27:42

Thank you, Maria. We have a brief Pharmaceutical and Sharps Waste Stewardship Program update. On October 15th, the foundation resubmitted its 2022 annual report

27:52

for covered drugs, which staff is currently reviewing for compliance. The statutory deadline

27:57

for the directors compliance determination is January 16, 2024. So more to come on that next week, next week, next month.

28:05

Be sure to sign up for the pharm and sharps listserv to receive updates.

28:11

The Carpet Stewardship Law requires a carpet stewardship plan to include a contingency plan that demonstrates

28:17

how the plan will be continued, will continue to be carried out should the plan expire or be revoked without the approval of a new plan.

28:25

CARE submitted its contingency plan on October 20th as an amendment to its 23 to 27 plan.

28:31

CalRecycle reviewed the plan amendment and determined that it does not meet the requirements for approval.

28:37

The director disapproved CARE's plan amendment on December 5th, 2023. CARE may revise and resubmit its contingency plan amendment

28:45

within 60 days after receiving the notice of disapproval. That will be February 5th, 2024.

28:51

The notice of disapproval can be found in the public notice linked on today's agenda.

28:57

Back to you. Maria.

29:04

Next, we have an update to AB 1201, which passed last year to address California's growing composting stream.

29:10

Materials Management and Local Assistance Deputy Director Cara Morgan will share the next updates.

29:18

Thanks, Maria. AB 1201 requires a public process for CalRecycle to determine

29:24

whether it would be feasible to separate the collection of products that are not acceptable feedstocks under USDA

29:32

National Organic Program from feedstocks that are acceptable. Also., would it enable efficient processing

29:40

to recover organic waste in both streams. In other words, recovering organic waste means processing

29:48

both organic streams into marketable compost and not collecting a stream that will then be disposed.

29:55

If CalRecycle determines that separate collection systems would be feasible,

30:01

the department must adopt regulations by January 1st, 2026. If CalRecycle determines separate collection is not feasible.

30:10

It will be illegal as of January 1, 2026, to sell products in California that are labeled compostable

30:17

or home compostable unless those products are acceptable. compost feedstocks under the National Organic Program

30:25

and meet other requirements. As part of our public process, on October 16th, 2023,
30:32

CalRecycle posted a discussion paper summarizing the survey results

30:37

from 34 mixed material composting facilities permitted in California. CalRecycle then
conducted a public workshop

30:45

on November 1st, 2023, and presented the results of the survey.

30:51

The survey responses indicate that bifurcated collection of products would not enable

30:57

the current solid waste processing infrastructure to efficiently process and recover
products

31:03

that are not allowable compost inputs under the national standards. CalRecycle
evaluated all submitted comments

31:11

and additional comments which you'll find attached to today's agenda. No data was
provided that demonstrates that bifurcated collection is feasible

31:20

and would enable efficient processing and recovery of organic waste using the current
organic waste processing infrastructure in California.

31:30

The request for action provides a summary of all of the written and verbal comments
that CalRecycle received.

31:36

Action is needed by January 1st, 2024. Next on the agenda, CalRecycle will be hosting
an upcoming workshop

31:47

to provide an overview of the 2022 California Waste Tire Market Report.

31:52

On January 19 from 930 to 1130 in the morning in the Coastal Hearing Room.

32:00

This report describes current markets for scrap tires in California overall and by market
segment,

32:06

which include rubberized asphalt, concrete molded and extruded products and others

32:12

civil engineering applications like tire derived aggregate and current information on
alternative daily cover use, export and disposal.

32:21

Workshop attendees will be able to participate in person or remotely.

32:27

Next, I'll talk about a covered electronic waste. Over £2.6 billion of electronic waste has
been collected and processed

32:35

in California through our covered electronic waste recycling program. To keep covered e-waste off our streets and out of our landfills,

32:44

CalRecycle is requesting required net cost reports from approved collectors and approved recyclers

32:52

in the covered electronic waste recycling program. Covering Operations during 2023.

32:59

These reports help establish payment rates for both covered e-waste recovery and recycling.

33:05

Reports are due to CalRecycle on or before March 1st, 2024.

33:11

My next item, CalRecycle is required to review and either approve or disapprove.

33:17

each countywide or regional agency Integrated Waste Management Plan Five year Review Report.

33:23

These reports are comprehends of analysis and planning documents which may be impacted by changes to demographics, disposal

33:32

capacities, funding and diversion programs. Alameda County submitted a five year review report

33:39

for its countywide Integrated Waste Management Plan. No revisions to the county's planning documents are necessary at this time.

33:47

This item has been approved. Back to you, Maria. Thanks, Cara. Now, to pending on solid waste tire facilities permit updates.

33:56

Excuse me. Here's a quick overview of California facility standards, plus a statewide facility permit update

34:02

from environmental program manager Paulina Lawrence.

34:08

Protecting the health of Californians and their land, food, water and air is a big job.

34:14

Local, state and federal agencies play different roles to enforce public health and environmental safety standards.

34:20

In California, solid waste local enforcement agencies, process applications, issue and enforce permits for solid waste facilities.

34:29

These include landfills, transfer stations, compost facilities, or similar operations.

34:35

CalRecycle must verify permits are consistent with state requirements.

34:40

Permits can only address areas within the authority of local enforcement agencies and CalRecycle.

34:46

Check the link below for more detailed information. Emergency waivers allow temporary changes to solid waste

34:53

permit requirements in response to local or state disasters. Local enforcement agencies may approve the waivers

35:00

which are good for up to 120 days and may be extended. CalRecycle must review approved waivers

35:07

and can condition limit, suspend or terminate them. Check out the link for more detailed information.

35:14

For waste tire facilities, CalRecycle processes applications, issues and enforces waste tire permits.

35:22

These include requirements to make sure tires are stored and processed in a way that reduces potential threats

35:28

from fire and disease carrying vectors like mosquitoes. Check out the link for more detailed information.

35:39

Continuing on this month's agenda for San Bernardino County is the city of Claremont Community Services Department.

35:47

This is a new solid waste facilities permit. Action is needed. January 8th, 2024.

35:54

Also continuing on this month's agenda for Orange County is Bay Canyon Greenery.

36:00

This is a compostable materials handling facility. Action is needed December 31st, 2023.

36:07

Also continuing for YOLO County is YOLO County Central Landfill. This is a revised solid waste facilities permit.

36:15

Action is needed January 19th, 2024.

36:24

New to this month's agenda for San Diego County is Otay Mesa Compost Facility.

36:31

This is a new compostable materials handling facility permit. Action is needed January 20th, 2024.

36:38

Preliminary review of the permit package indicates the following proposed design parameters.

36:43

The proposed facility will be a compostable materials handling facility that will receive green material food material, vegetated food material,

36:53

agricultural material and construction and demolition wood waste. Permitted hours of operation will be 6 a.m.

37:00

to 6 p.m. Monday through Saturday. Permitted volume will be 500 tons per day, with a permitted area

37:07

of 7.13 acres and lastly, a design capacity of 30,000 cubic yards.

37:15

Also new to the agenda for Ventura County is Mountain View. Organic Waste Processing Facility.

37:22

This is a revised solid waste facilities permit. Action is needed February 3rd, 2024.

37:30

Preliminary review the permit package indicates the following proposed changes:

37:35

updating the name and mailing address of the owner, addition of a large volume

37:40

in-vessel digestion facility activity, updating the permitted maximum land tonnage to include 100 tons per day for the vessel digestion activity

37:50

while maintaining the total maximum tonnage of 300 tons per day, updating

37:56

the permitted area to include .28 acres for the in-vessel digestion activity

38:02

while maintaining the total permitted area of 1.49 acres and the addition

38:08

of a design capacity of 104 tons per day for the vessel digestion activity.

38:15

Also new to this month's agenda for Orange County is Madison Materials Inc.

38:22

This is a modified solid waste facilities permit. Action is needed. February 3rd, 2024.

38:30

Preliminary review permit package indicates the following proposed changes: updates to the findings section, permissions

38:39

and prohibitions section, documents that describe and or restrict the operation of the facility section, the self monitoring section,

38:48

and the local enforcement agency conditions section.

38:56

You can find more information on any of today's agenda items. Just go to CalRecycle's home page, calrecycle.ca.gov and click on the public

39:04

meeting web banner at the top of our site or the public meeting section a little further down.

39:09

For a link to the agenda and associated public notices. Now it's time for live public comments.

39:15

First, we'll take comments from those participating in our Sacramento CalEPA headquarters meeting room today.

39:23

Oh, lots of comments today. After that, will take comments from those participating by phone and for those on the phone.

39:32

Just a reminder to mute your microphones, your microphone. So stay muted until you're called by the last four digits of your phone number.

39:39

Also, please mute your webcast to avoid potential feedback issues.

39:45

Good morning. Hello, Evan Edgar live from Sacramento. I'm here today on Edgar Associates, representing a Californian compost coalition.

39:52

This is the best time for composting and the worst of times for landfills. Composting, as all types of this always permits up today.

39:59

And landfills are super emitter methane. So that's why we have SB 1383. And I want to congratulate CalRecycle for furnishing \$130 million in grants today.

40:09

What that does, it leverages four to one of the private and public capital. So that had about 130 to 520 million

40:16

of of investments on a 4-1 ratio. We're getting two thirds of \$1,000,000,000 in infrastructure

40:23

and SB 1383 need all move about 8 to 9% for the 780,000 tons a year.

40:30

So it's a big move, but that's only going to eight or nine points on a 75% rate. So in the future we need more of this type of grant activity.

40:38

You guys do a great job there. What Cal EPA has has shown in CARB in their

40:43

in their annual report on cap and trade dollars is that the most cost effective program is composting at about 50 60 bucks a ton.

40:50

Zevs are about 1000 to 3000 a ton for greenhouse gas. You guys are doing the right stuff at the right time.

40:57

Plus, we know from the Cal EPA report that the benefit for disadvantaged communities, 41:02

each one of these grants awarded today had a community benefit agreement. You got five points but extra ten points for bonus points.

41:09

And all these CBAs committee benefit agreements have great community benefits such as edible food recovery, jobs training.

41:17

So you see a lot of good stuff that is coming out of this grant program and we need more of it. We also know that California's in a budget deficit for 6 to 8 billion

41:25

and next year we won't see too much money under the typical typical cap and trade program without the surpluses of past years, about 25 million a year

41:34

is what we've been going to cap and trade to the CalRecycle infrastructure program.

41:40

So that's about 50 million in two years. And on your B list, a lot of good projects on your businesses add another 58 million on a B less over the next two years.

41:48

We may be able to move our move some more tons, but the future doesn't look bright for funding

41:55

compost in 80. We may need some green bond measure. We may need a tipping fee increase at the landfills

42:01

that need some type of revenue increase in order to sustain infrastructure development to get to 75% by 2025 or 2030.

42:11

But today is a great day for Cal. Recycle the best of times for compost. Thank you for issuing the grants.

42:16

And they actually moved the needle today, so thank you very much.

42:21

Thank you, Mr. Edgar. Good morning, Nick. Collapse of Californians Against Waste actually commenting on three different items on the agenda.

42:29

And I think Mark is batting cleanup afterwards on a few of the other items.

42:34

First of all, on the item that Evan mentioned, I do want to commend you for getting the money out the door

42:40

quickly and efficiently. I know it seems easy to hand out money to the general public, but I'm very well aware of how difficult it is for you all.

42:48

And, you know, frankly, this is putting our money where our mouth is. And I think. SB 1383 was a bit of a leap of faith in terms of will there be funding,

42:57

will there be state support? And I think your ability to fund good projects and to do it effectively has been

43:06

the reason why you've gotten additional funding over the years and why this infrastructure is being built. So congratulations on that.

43:13

On AB 1201 bifurcation, I think you all reached the obvious conclusion.

43:20

I think it's frankly self-evident. Actually, you haven't said what conclusion you've reached, but

43:26

reading the the RFA, it seems pretty clear that you're headed in the direction

43:31

of reaching the obvious conclusion that bifurcation is not feasible. In my mind, that's a bit of a box checking exercise.

43:40

Like, yeah, obviously not feasible. And we still have the rest of the bill to implement and I think implementing the rest of the bill will determine

43:47

the future of compostal plastics in California, the future of commercial plastics and SB 1383 implementation

43:54

in SB 54 implementation and a variety of different programs.

43:59

And so I would just urge you to also take on the other parts of that bill, namely choosing third party certifiers.

44:07

Once you choose a third party certifier, they have manufacturers have one year to start

44:14

using that certifier, some early authority to create guidelines for labeling to reduce deceptive labeling.

44:23

Yeah, a few other other tools in the table. One toolbox that I urge you to start working on now

44:31

that the bifurcation has done. And then finally, on each cycle,

44:39

I don't think I'm saying anything I haven't said to you in person in writing multiple times, but I think some of it bears repeating.

44:48

I mean, what it comes down to is that we urge you to adopt option two to reject age cycles.

44:53

SB 1383 Technology termination. You have a clear administrative duty to implement your regulation

45:00

as it is written, and we do not believe you have done so. We've laid out a variety of issues and

45:08

most of the ones we've raised have not been addressed either in the revised application or in the monitoring requirements.

45:15

CalRecycle has added from the last go round.

45:21

Just a couple of things I wanted to flag in. Again, we've submitted multiple items, but

45:27

you know, the regulations require explicitly that we use a conservative of baseline

45:33

and there's some assumption that here they're, in my opinion, definitely not conservative.

45:39

For instance, I think the biggest emission reduction benefit in the in the whole calculation comes from product displacement,

45:47

which is replacing diesel fuel with hydrogen generated from this facility.

45:54

I think assuming that there's going to be diesel fuel through the life of this project and it's going to be used in these fleets as inconsistent with existing car.

46:02

Braggs industry practice where we're going with a zero emission fleets.

46:09

That seems like a completely unsubstantiated assumption.

46:16

I also want to highlight that there has been a serious lack of community input here.

46:22

You've had community members from all over the state ask to really talk about the specifics of where would these projects go, what the impacts would be.

46:31

The the department and the agency have standing practice to support environmental justice communities, and at the core of

46:39

that is looking at cumulative impacts on those communities.

46:44

And I realize you're not permitting a facility here, but you are making a decision that will have impacts on individual communities.

46:52

And from the ones I'm aware of where this is being proposed, they're all incredibly disadvantaged communities.

47:00

The legislature just passed a bill a year ago creating a new Office of Environmental Justice, at CalRecycle.

47:06

And in the legislation, the explicit goal that was listed was

47:11

ensuring meaningful involvement of disproportionately burden communities and department decision making.

47:18

I understand me first time around when the application was before you, you needed to act quickly.

47:23

You may have not had time to engage with the communities, but it's been a year since then and you have still not,

47:30

even though multiple people have requested that. And finally,

47:36

I did want to just point out that this is a discretionary action by the department

47:42

and it is a discretionary action being done pursuant to an EIR that was adopted when the SB 1383 regulations were before the department.

47:52

The EIR very explicitly looked at technologies and the impacts of the technologies that would be used to meet 1383.

48:00

It specifically looked at what impacts composting and anaerobic digestion would have both

48:06

negative impacts and positive impacts in terms of production of soil amendments

48:13

and in fact alternatives analysis. And the air really only looked at two alternatives

48:18

one having to do with a different scope of edible food generators, which isn't necessarily relevant here.

48:24

The other one was whether or not biomass facilities should be part of the scope of the regulations.

48:29

So and alternative analysis found. Yes. But it was very clear that the IIR looked at a specific range

48:36

of technologies and the impacts they will have relying on that IIR to approve

48:43

this determination is not appropriate. Thank you.

48:50

Thank you for your very thoughtful comments, Mr. Lapis Good morning. Julia Levin with the Bioenergy Association of California.

48:58

And I, too would like to make three points, and I'll maybe pick up where Mr. Lapis left off and say we strongly support the application of H Cycle

49:07

and believe that approving an article to a determination is completely appropriate and very much needed.

49:14

Both the governor and the President of the United States and the international climate community have all called for extremely rapid

49:21

increases in the production and use of clean hydrogen as a critical tool to achieve our climate change goals

49:28

and ensure energy reliability and protect local air quality. California recently was

49:34

awarded up to \$1.2 billion for a clean hydrogen hub in California,

49:40

which explicitly is focused on both electrolytic hydrogen and hydrogen from organic waste.

49:46

But to obtain the entire \$1.2 billion, we have to show rapid progress in the development and production of clean hydrogen in California.

49:53

And each cycle is one of the very first projects poised to meet the requirements of the California hydrogen hub.

50:00

In response to Mr. Lapis' comment that we don't know whether it will be used to replace diesel, every assessment from the California Air Resources,

50:08

Air Resources Board and the California Energy Commission and the U.S. Department of Energy has concluded that we are going

50:14

to need renewable hydrogen to replace diesel in heavy duty trucks. We're also going to need it for a lot of other clean energy applications,

50:22

like replacing diesel in backup generators for electricity reliability, long duration energy storage, and a whole host of other uses.

50:30

So if we're lucky and there are other alternatives for diesel trucks in the future to address Mr. Lapis' concern, there will still be a virtually

50:37

infinite need for clean hydrogen to replace other fossil fuels. So either way, it's going to provide enormous benefits.

50:45

It also provides enormous benefits to the local clean, really good, long lasting jobs, longer lasting

50:53

than most other forms of renewable energy because there's ongoing waste processing collection needs that don't exist with things like solar and wind.

51:00

They have a different role to play, but those are really significant economic benefits and local air quality benefits.

51:07

I live in Contra Costa Contra Costa County, where the H Cycle, the first H Cycle project is proposed as well as the Raven Project in Richmond,

51:15

and diesel trucks are the largest source of air pollution and there are several interstate highways that intersect those communities

51:21

and that are served or used by an awful lot of diesel trucks. We have to get those trucks off the road and the only viable alternative

51:28

right now is a hydrogen fuel cell truck that can run on clean hydrogen or even a hydrogen combustion

51:34

truck would be a big benefit to local air quality over diesel trucks. We can't wait for something else to come along potentially decades from now.

51:43

So we do strongly support approval of the Article two determination. And the science is absolutely behind you, as is state and federal policy.

51:52

The second point I want to make is to echo Evan Edgars comments. And thank you. Really, I don't even know how to say it strongly enough for getting this money out

52:00

the door. We're seeing other programs that are almost certainly going to be scrubbed because of the state budget deficit.

52:06

So the fact that you moved quickly on this funding and are going to be funding so many important beneficial projects, I just hope you write the checks

52:14

before the governor's January budget proposal comes out. So there's no risk to that funding.

52:19

But it is it is going to do an enormous amount of good in meeting the requirements of SB 1383 and reducing methane and other pollution

52:27

from landfills and providing compost, clean energy and other beneficial projects in its place.

52:32

And that brings me to my third and last point. I think we're all terrified of what the budget deficit is going to mean.

52:39

And I think it's incumbent on everyone in this room, and the Bioenergy Association of California would like to work

52:44

with everyone in this room to ensure that we find you new sources of funding for next year, in the coming years. Because even with the great work you've done

52:51

and what you're announcing today, we've got a long way to go. And so we've got to find other sources of funding to keep the momentum

52:58

going on SB 1383. So thank you and keep it up.

53:03

Thank you. Ms. Levin. Good morning. Veronica Pardo Resource Recovery Coalition of California.

53:10

I'll try to keep my comments brief, building off of Julia's excellent comments.

53:16

We really support the comments from Director Morgan, who describes a robust, robust scientific analysis

53:24

and the monitoring and verification and the technology that, you know, you're looking to approach in Article two determination.

53:31

You know, we support this determination today, but more broadly, during the SB 1383 process, we supported that portion of the regulations in order

53:41

to account for these, you know, burgeoning technologies or technologies like. That aren't even. Burgeoning, obviously, with hydrogen production.

53:49

But acknowledging that we have a lot of pathways needed in order to manage the organic waste that we produce in California.

53:57

And if we're going to be diverting from, you know, the sanitary landfill, we need to have these options and was as as described,

54:04

we are doing this huge transition in our transportation sector where we're going to be needing these

54:10

fuels to support that clean energy transformation. So very grateful for your comment.

54:17

The SB 1383 funds and some other comments that we'll be providing later on.

54:23

The bifurcation, determination, food and beverage container recycling program, recognizing that those comments are coming up.

54:29

So thank you so much for your time today.

54:35

Good morning, commissioners. My name is Tom Hansen and the business manager, IBEW Local 302 and the president of the Contra Costa Building Trades.

54:41

And I'm here in support of H Cycle. A speaker earlier spoke about our communities and generalization, and I'm here to tell you I represent those workers who live in those communities.

54:50

And his comments were disturbing. We are not opposed to what H Cycle is doing in Contra Costa County.

54:55

We have four oil refineries. Two of those actually just are changing to renewable diesel.

55:00

They're planning for the long run to make diesel for many years to get back the billion dollars each of those plants. But what we're looking forward to is H Cycle and companies like H cycle

55:09

coming to Contra Costa County and developing the next green technology and it is hydrogen. Not everything can be battery powered.

55:16

I'm an electrician. I know about electricity. You cannot have everything run on electricity. It's impossible. We need H Cycle and companies like H Cycle to build things in Contra Costa County.

55:25

Tim Grace, an assembly member for my area, put forward a bill called the Green Empowerment Zone. Their plant will be part of that zone in Contra Costa County.

55:32

We have what's called the Northern Waterfront Initiative. That is in that this will build in an old DAL facility site, a brownfield.

55:40

We will see cleaner technology but actually have legitimate real world jobs, not fast food jobs in that area because of H Cycle.

55:49

Not to mention the construction jobs would be created because H Cycle partnered with the building trades, so all the hours worked to build.

55:55

This plant will be built by middle class jobs with family sustaining wages with health care for themselves and their families,

56:01

and also a pension so they can retire with dignity. H Cycle is coming to town to build something good for California

56:07

and is helping the workers at the same time. So please support their initiative. Thank you so much for joining us today.

56:12

I'm sorry I didn't catch your name, too. Tom Hanson. Thank you so much, Tom. Appreciate you joining us today.

56:19

Good morning, everyone. Thank you for making time to hear all of our public comments. I'm the president of the Bay Area chapter of the Environmental Justice League,

56:26

also previously served on the board of directors in the Bay Area, just awarded the best transit case public transportation agency in the country.

56:33

So, you know, one of our big initiatives was hydrogen fuel cell, as I'm sure you know. And, you know, it's been a big impact in the Bay Area.

56:42

You know, I live in East Oakland and I'm actually here with some speakers, so you'll hear. And pollution is a huge issue.

56:48

I don't have to tell you anything you don't know. Cancer rates, asthma rates, all of the issues that went along

56:54

with redlining, putting things in black and brown communities I see every day. You know, I live in the part of Oakland where

57:02

I a national boulevard where you have lots of traffic, you have the freeways there, you have trucks going to the port.

57:09

I mean, there's a lot of pollution. And this solution that each cycle is promoting is something that we're doing in the Bay Area with hydrogen fuel cell.

57:17

And I'd love to see it in Pittsburgh. I have family there. This is not something that's theoretical. This is actually going to help.

57:22

And I didn't know about the part with the labor. I'm a huge supporter of Labor, so it's good to see that

57:27

people at the community are going to be building this facility, are going to be able to retire, as you said, and dignity with a good pension.

57:34

And, you know, H Cycle is talking a good game. Well, we appreciate it. And we just want to be partners with them

57:39

and make sure that they're following through on their commitments. This isn't something where we're just here to be a shield and say build it, and

57:44

we want to be there with them step by step to make sure, you know, everything happens. And as the gentleman before me mentioned, it's a little bit

57:51

disturbing to have someone make a comment about our communities. I mean, you look in the room, it doesn't look like a lot of people that look like me. You're here.

57:57

I people here from Oakland, we were up at 530 to be here to make these public comments. So I agree with them about public comment, having outreach,

58:05

you know, having people that are in the communities and we made our way here because we this is very important, not just for Oakland.

58:12

What do we do for Oakland, what Hiten is doing both in the entire very region and you know, all of this money coming down from DC than

58:17

from all the money that the Biden administration has made possible. I mean, this is the best of all worlds

58:23

are getting technology cutting edge technology that is going to make a difference in people's lives. That's going to be built by people from the community with union wages.

58:32

I mean, there's not much else you can ask for. I mean, look at after the moon, but we're not going to get it. So we have to live in than here now. And the practical reality.

58:40

So Department of Justice Lee wholeheartedly supports this project. We hope that you will support the project as well.

58:45

We're looking forward to meeting our facilities being built. The future. Thank you very much. And your name, sir?

58:52

Mark Williams. Mark Williams. Mark, I'd like our Deputy Director for Environmental Justice is here.

58:58

And so if you wouldn't mind leaving your contact information, we would love to. Worked with you. Excellent.

59:03

Thank you, Mark

59:09

Tester. Hello, my name is Mark Ramsey. You're his. Dad.

59:14

I grew up in West Oakland. There were Coke, Pepsi, 7UP incarnation, and many of.

59:21

Trains that were coming through the brake, dust. Coming from these trucks.

59:26

I personally believe that what you guys are doing, I'm behind 100% for the simple fact that I have asthma.

59:32

When I took my test, they stopped me after 2 hours because they said I stopped breathing 89 times an hour.

59:37

There's only 60 minutes in an hour. I stopped breathing 89 times. We need this to pass.

59:43

If anything, I appreciate what you guys are doing. Thank you so much for being here today. I appreciate you coming.

59:53

My name is Ivana Instrument and I live in Richmond and I address my concerns to Ms..

1:00:00

Wagoner. And I'm concerned about the clean air that we don't have in Richmond.

1:00:08

And the children in the parks are playing horrible air

1:00:13

carriers. So I would like to read this letters

1:00:18

that said this is regarding harassing clean oxygen for improved, improved maternal health and emission reduction.

1:00:26

I'm writing to express my enthusiastic support for the promotion of clean hydrogen as a solution that reduces fossil fuel emission

1:00:36

and contributes to improved maternal health. Maternal health is a critical concern that reflects the broader

1:00:44

state of health care systems and environmental exposure. These factors increase maternal health risks

1:00:51

for black women and their babies and also brown babies because we're predominantly

1:00:58

Mexican and blacks, or three times more likely to die during childbirth than their white counterparts.

1:01:06

The combustion of fossil fuel is a major contributor to air pollution and greenhouse

1:01:13

gas emission, leading to adverse environmental and health effects.

1:01:20

The transition to hydrogen powered transportation can have a positive impact

1:01:27

on maternal health by reducing air pollutants that poses risks to both mother and their developing fetuses.

1:01:37

Lower levels of particular matter, nitrogen oxide and other harmful emissions in the air can contribute

1:01:45

to healthier pregnancy and reduce incidence sources of respiratory issues,

1:01:50

ensuring a safe and healthy environment for expectant mothers. I strongly urge you to champion the adoption of clean hydrogen

1:02:00

technology as a comprehensive solution to address both emission reduction and maternal health improvement.

1:02:09

Thank you for your dedication to these critical issues and for your efforts to create positive change.

1:02:16

Your leadership and commitment are central and obvious in advancing this vital cause.

1:02:22

I wish I have brought pictures to show you the children with their oxygen masks trying to play. Unfortunately, I think we're all very familiar with those pictures.

1:02:30

So thank you so much for being here today. And thank you for reading your letter. Appreciate you being present.

1:02:35

And I just want to let everyone know to make sure. You

1:02:43

thank you for the opportunity to come before you. My name is Tina Flores.

1:02:49

flores. I'm from Richmond, California. I live blocks away from the Chevron Gas

1:02:59

refinery in Richmond. I grew up with all my friends and families. They either have some kind of thyroid issue or asthma

1:03:08

or some kind of blood disease from the environment. I work in West Oakland.

1:03:14

I live in Oakland. In East Oakland. I'm the president of a worldwide medical relief organization.

1:03:20

My minor is in medical anthropology, so I know a lot about the environment

1:03:26

and what is having an impact on our health. We are all calling, praying, running

1:03:37

to bring awareness to the environment. We have to save Mother Earth.

1:03:44

I want to have you really to take into consideration the cycle project that they have.

1:03:54

I believe in it. I believe that they will honor the community by including them

1:04:01

in the decision making of having that that project in their city. That town has suffered also.

1:04:10

We have a run that is every four years. I would like to compliment that run with this prayer of this meeting,

1:04:19

with the acceptance of this project for the cycle. I'd like to run with that as a victory for the state of California

1:04:28

to show the nations around the world that we are aware of the issue of Mother Earth and the destruction of that

1:04:38

is having on our young people in their health. Like my my brother from East Oakland, Mr.

1:04:44

Williams. He's a walking angel he is proof that we have these

1:04:51

medical issues that we have to address. I want this H Cycle approved at yesterday

1:05:01

there, including the community that is harming the refineries, are harming this particular community, and we have to do it now.

1:05:12

Thank you. Thank you so much for being here today. I appreciate you attending.

1:05:18

Good morning. My name is Adrian Gonzalez. I'm a statewide organizer for Environmental Justice League and I'm here in support of H Cycle

1:05:27

after getting people together in the community meetings and hearing the commitments made to them. I'm here to allow their voices to be heard and have an impact to make sure

1:05:36

that each side road keeps their commitment to marginalized communities. The immediate health impact and communities we represent

1:05:43

have suffered from the air pollution of fossil fuels. Clean hydrogen is only pollution is water,

1:05:49

and something that we can use more here in California. I've worked with congressional members, state senators and Assembly members

1:05:57

on many environmental bills to help California operate using clean energy.

1:06:02

The proof of H Cycle's application will honor California, especially marginalized communities in the Bay Area, and honor the initiative.

1:06:10

Governor Governor Gavin Newsom and President Joe Biden wants clean energy.

Thank you, guys.

1:06:17

Thank you so much for your comments. Good morning. My name is Mark Shortcut and the president and CEO of the East Bay Leadership Council.

1:06:25

And I'm a resident of Contra Costa County. The East Bay Leadership Council is a nonprofit representing hundreds of employers

1:06:32

and across the private and public sector in Contra Costa and Alameda County. Our history goes back 80 years in that community

1:06:40

and we advocate every day to strengthen our economy and improve quality of life for all.

1:06:46

E-bikes work works constructively with numerous cities in Contra Costa County who are looking for solutions

1:06:53

that will help them meet their obligations under SB 1383 as well. There are other key laws governing waste management.

1:07:01

Through this work, it's become clear that the waste industry needs additional means to comply with the mandates of 1383, Adding each cycle

1:07:10

to the hydrogen process as a compliant technology for landfill. Diversion is an important signal for the states intention to act,

1:07:18

and this decision will bring benefits on many fronts for our community.

1:07:24

I'll just close and there's lots of other folks here to speak with. Landfills are continuing to see not only methane releases but other problems.

1:07:31

As noted in a recent article in the L.A. Times regarding L.A. County landfills, the industry needs more technical solutions

1:07:38

such as exercise H cycle, and we're excited to be at the forefront of innovation with each cycle and our community in Contra Costa County.

1:07:46

Thank you for your support. Thank you so much for joining us today and thank you for your comment.

1:07:52

Good morning. My name is Anthony Askew. So and I'm a business agent for local 16 Heat and Frost Insulators.

1:07:57

And I too, I'm here to speak in favor of the H Cycle project. I represent more than 600 members who will directly benefit from project.

1:08:05

I also represent that I will also represent the apprentices. The new apprentices will be afforded a path to the middle class when this project creates those next jobs.

1:08:14

I'd like to applaud H cycle for their consideration of not only California's strict environmental standards, but also their

1:08:20

responsibility to the workers who will build and maintain their facility by executing project labor agreement.

1:08:25

They are ensuring that middle class wages will be paid to the next generation of energy workers. Many of my members risk

1:08:31

losing their careers as California moves away from Oil refinery. This project provides a just transition as the wages will remain constant

1:08:39

and the skills they have already mastered will be the same skills needed to build this project.

1:08:44

I believe this project is something that everyone should be able to support. Remember, opportunity isn't missed.

1:08:49

It simply goes somewhere else. And to that point, I'd like to comment that, you know, we do have a lot of refining in California.

1:08:56

In California, we've refined under the best standards anywhere in the world. And each cycle has the opportunity to take this same manufacturing

1:09:03

somewhere else and do it somewhere else. Are they going to do it to the same standards? We do it in California now.

1:09:09

So I strongly encourage you guys to support this. And I thank you for your time. Thank you so much for your comments.

1:09:15

I appreciate your perspective. Hi. Good morning. My name is James Ashcroft. I'm the business agent for the Ironworkers Local 378.

1:09:22

I represent 25 men and women workers that live in and around Contra Costa County.

1:09:27

We're all in some strong support of the H Cycle LLC. Yes, waste to hundreds of hydrogen process,

1:09:35

which will play a critical role in solving for organics diversion in California.

1:09:41

We support the agency's push to explore the development of the new and innovative collection and processing technology

1:09:50

with a focus on SB 1383 compliance and along with that, bringing all the new apprentices to come and build this project

1:09:58

and to maintain the hydrogen plant once it's up and running. Thank you for your time.

1:10:04

Thank you so much for your comments. Good morning. My name is Jason Lindsey. I'm President.

1:10:09

Business Aging of Ironworkers Local 378 representing those same 2500 workers that live around the different areas of the county.

1:10:17

I myself live in Antioch just a couple couple miles up the road from where this proposed project is going to be built.

1:10:24

The standing and strong support of it. There's no silver bullet, right? We all realize that.

1:10:29

There's no silver bullet that's going to help that's going to fix this problem. We can't on one hand, say there's an existential threat to the planet

1:10:40

and then sit back and say, oh, well, we need to look for the perfect solution. We need to explore every idea that's out there.

1:10:48

And those that are proven like this one need to be deployed. I'm conflicted.

1:10:54

I stand here as a building trades guy who's made my career working in the oil refineries.

1:10:59

You know, in 2019, there was over 160 million worker hours reported in California's refineries.

1:11:06

Is a whole lot of families being fed, a whole lot of careers being built along with whatever they build in those refineries.

1:11:15

Right. So it's very hard for me to stand here and say, let's get away from that and go to something else.

1:11:21

There's also all these terms that people throw around, like just transition

1:11:27

this project and others like it or the just transition that everybody's throwing around.

1:11:32

They're we need to build them. We need to employ and deploy

1:11:40

every opportunity we can to clean up the air. So thanks for listening to me.

1:11:47

Thank you so much for being here and for your comments. Good morning. My name is Timothy Jeffries.

1:11:53

I'm the International representative for the Boilermakers for the state of California and still stand with the building trades.

1:11:59

I'm also executive member of the Contra Costa Building Trades, and it's been said before, so I'll just kind of keep it brief and short that these are

1:12:06

the jobs that that high paying jobs, middle wage jobs, building local economy around for northern California,

1:12:13

that our brothers have already spoke about previously here. So supporting H Cycle and

1:12:19
we are all want to be if we're not, we should want to be environmentalist. And instead of going down just one path, allowing that to be many,

1:12:27

a path that should be available to us should be different direction moving forward in. And I commend you for what I assume going to support this measure of H cycle.

1:12:35

Thank you. Good morning. My name is Mark Molnar.

1:12:41

I am the Northern Regional director of the State Building and Construction Trades Council. I'm a big supporter of H Cycle.

1:12:50

The state building trades represents 14 affiliates, and our affiliates represent 500,000 union construction workers, 83,000 which are state accredited apprentices.

1:13:01

When you're talking about a green just transition, it's got to be multifaceted. It's got to be carbon sequestration, it's got to be hydrogen.

1:13:10

The oil refineries right now, the two of them, the Phillips 66, they are they are getting rid of crude oil conversion and going to biodiesel.

1:13:17

That's because everyone's paying attention. Our members represent

1:13:23

construction workers. That's who we represent. And They go out there and make a living in these refineries and in these new technology jobs.

1:13:31

And they want a middle class wage. They want an opportunity for their children to be able to get into the trades

1:13:38

and they want to be able to give and live in the communities that they work in. With this new technology going to be built over there,

1:13:44

this is going to open the door for a lot of other entities to continue to convert.

1:13:50

And I can tell you right now I drive a diesel. I love my diesel. And until the technology gets to where I can do the same life

1:13:59

with with the new technology that I can currently do with my diesel, I will be and I'm 53 years old, I will be one of the first people

1:14:06

in this industry to convert over to that hydrogen industrial commercial vehicle.

1:14:12

If it does what I needed to do and it won't unless

1:14:17

we continue to move forward. Right now we're moving forward together. Union jobs, union

1:14:24

skilled in apprentices and journeyman and new technology to clean the environment and help us with global warming.

1:14:33

I just want to say we are once again in support of this project. State building trades. Thank you.

1:14:39

Thank you so much for joining us today and for your comments. Good morning.

1:14:44

Madam Chair. Board members, My name is Chuck Leonard. I'm the political representative for Plummer's esteemed Fitters, Local 342

1:14:53

I currently have over 1000 members working in four oil refineries.

1:14:59

30 of my 40 over 30 of my 40 years in this union has been with hard hat and work boots

1:15:07

in this industry, and it's kind of a unique place that we're in. I stand in support of the H to Cycle project.

1:15:15

We built oil refineries 40 years. We've been building oil refineries.

1:15:21

And now I find that my grandson is fourth generation and he's building plants

1:15:26

in those same refineries that are now replacing oil.

1:15:31

And it's going to take a lot of courage to move forward and it's going to take a lot of courage from everybody to move forward

1:15:39

as we work toward carbon neutrality, a net zero by 2045. And so partnership with the environmental, the environmental justice community,

1:15:49

with our legislators, with labor, with everybody, we're all working toward the same goal.

1:15:55

And so I would strongly encourage to recognize the value and the benefits

1:16:02

that this project will do for the members that for my members, for the community.

1:16:09

Unintended consequences is when we do nothing. And I mean, let's be clear, the thousand workers that I have working in oil today,

1:16:18

they are the fence line. They are from the fence line community. They are the black and brown community.

1:16:24

These are the opportunities that render and give folks that.

1:16:30

I didn't graduate from high school, but I'm living proof who you are in the end doesn't have to be who you are in the beginning.

1:16:37

If you have opportunity and hope. It comes in many shapes, fashions and forms, but it also comes in the job,

1:16:45

a job that's linked to an education, a job that's linked to health care, a job that's linked to retirement.

1:16:52

And so my members that I and I promise you that my members are not the affluent folks that are living in Contra Costa County.

1:16:59

My members that are working there are have the same needs of everybody.

1:17:04

And we're worried where our next job is going to come from. So that's that's the challenge.

1:17:09

But with many challenges, there's opportunities. So once again, I stand in support and hope

1:17:15

that you'll put a lot of thought when you render your decision. Thank you. Very much.

1:17:20

Appreciate you being here and thank you for thoughtful comments. Good morning.

1:17:25

My name is Sarah Belafonte. I'm the assistant to the city manager for the city of Pittsburgh, and I manage our environmental services division.

1:17:32

Pittsburgh is one of the disadvantaged communities that was spoken about earlier today, where about 75,000 residents

1:17:41

and as historically industrial community, you know, we look forward to

1:17:46

businesses like H Cycle coming in and helping the evolution of industry in Pittsburgh

1:17:54

continue the like I said, evolution of the industry towards green hubs, towards

1:18:02

sustainable tech and continue the employment of local people.

1:18:07

In Pittsburgh, we are we also look forward to opportunities that H Cycle brings for

1:18:15

diversion of local organic waste. We have both a recycling and transfer station

1:18:21

and a landfill sited in Pittsburgh, so those opportunities are exciting for local organics to be diverted out of the landfill.

1:18:30

Lastly, the city just adopted its first climate action plan and responsible and innovative solid Waste management are absolutely integral to helping us

1:18:40

reach our the goals that we've set in line with the SB 1383 diversion mandates. So obviously speaking in support of the Article two application today.

1:18:51

Thank you. Thank you so much for being here and for your comments.

1:18:59

Hello, welcome. My name is Joe Gatlin. I'm the founder and vice president of the NAACP for the Los Angeles

1:19:07

Harbor area and recently appointed by Los Santos Mayor Karen Bass.

1:19:13

As a harbor commissioner. I'm right here in full support

1:19:18

for support of 1383, and

1:19:24

for many reasons. Our family was of the first to even sue the port

1:19:29

for environmental reasons and also our jobs. Over 50 years ago, I've been fighting this fight for a long time.

1:19:37

I also want to mention that I had the privilege of representing one of the world's number one environmentalist for over 50 years.

1:19:48

I was a Western United States representative for Dr. Jane Goodall. Again,

1:19:54

environmental causes is something that's important to me right now,

1:20:00

the jobs it will create, the environmental needs myself.

1:20:05

For example, I didn't know what asthma was until three years ago. Then I found out that I have bronchial asthma because I live in this zone.

1:20:13

To have an organization such as H Cycle who help clean up the air,

1:20:20

it's overwhelming to me. So I support it 100%. And do we can do and then also create good jobs

1:20:28

for our community and stop this. I call it environmental racism.

1:20:33

We've been living under. There's those in our community are forced to live close to

1:20:42

refineries or the port of L.A. because of jobs and transportation.

1:20:48

To have someone like this organization

1:20:54

to work to stop this is this is so emotional for me. I'm trying to calm down, but this is so great.

1:21:00

And I want to thank you for your time. Thank you for being here. And I'm sorry I didn't catch your name.

1:21:09

My name is Joe Gatlin. Thank you. Thanks, Joe. And if you wouldn't mind introducing yourself to Katrina as well,

1:21:17

we'd love to get your contact information so we can stay in contact with you.

1:21:22

We will have you even better here. Well prepared.

1:21:29

Thanks, Joe. Thank you so much for being here. Morning, Director Wagoner.

1:21:34

Zoe, good to see you. Staff Quentin Foster I am the Vice President of Policy

1:21:41

and Government Affairs for H Cycle. I will say for the record that we are supportive of the staff analysis.

1:21:48

And for the record, I really want to appreciate Cara Morgan and her team.

1:21:53

I have been very fair and impartial in working through this process to get to this point.

1:22:00

I had a whole list of notes here that I was going to use, and I prepared it and took time and was excited to speak to it. But

1:22:08

I was inspired by a lot of the comments that were spoken here this morning. And so really briefly, I just want to provide a personal anecdote.

1:22:17

I think that what kind of book in some of this, for those of you who know me and I've worked with many of you

1:22:24

in this room before and some of you sitting up there, I grew up in Watts, Los Angeles, a stone's throw where the 105 freeway was built.

1:22:33

I, too, as a kid, wondered why my nose was bleeding when my friends and I were outside playing football in the street.

1:22:40

Often time having to run around trucks that were sitting right across the street from my house.

1:22:45

Ayling didn't know at the time what that was, but learned later in life

1:22:50

what we were dealing with and those impacts that had an invariable imprint on my life and why I've done the work that I've done,

1:22:59

I get a lot questions asks What made you join each cycle? Why that company?

1:23:06

For the majority of my career, I've been fighting for many policies that we've been fortunate enough to move and push in environmental

1:23:13

justice and environmental arena, some of which I very strongly believe in

1:23:19

and many of which were predicated on the ideal that we would be contributing

1:23:24

to a circular economy, job creation, environmental benefits that would leave communities behind as we progressed.

1:23:33

And yet here we are still talking about some of those green jobs and that circular economy and you've heard multiple voices tell you

1:23:41

that many of that have not matriculated into those communities just yet.

1:23:47

I was attracted to this opportunity because. I saw a the potential for me to actually put into practice

1:23:55

what I've been advocating for for multiple years here to be part of a solution that actually create jobs,

1:24:05

provide environmental benefit, exploring and incentivizing the transition to hydrogen

1:24:12

fuel cell from diesel trucks, which we know, based on what Mr. Gallon said, is a huge component of the pollution impact

1:24:20

and also to the ability to create a local impact where the community

1:24:27

would actually benefit in this economy from these facilities. I'll be honest with you, when I first heard about it, I was skeptical.

1:24:35

Is that real? That sounds too good to be true, Matt, but follow the science, right?

1:24:41

Your staff did that in conjunction with the Air Resources Board, they followed the science, they vetted the data.

1:24:49

And the recommendation is what you have before you as a result of that vetting and that process.

1:24:57

And it's why I trust it. And I'm asking you to trust it and. Let me just say to everybody in this room, I am so grateful

1:25:06

and appreciative for all of you, including my friend Mr. Lapis, who I worked with

1:25:11

when I was the climate director for Environmental Defense Fund. His heart's in the right place.

1:25:16

I think he's wrong on this, but his heart's in the right place. And so I look forward to working with you all

1:25:25

and for you to hold us accountable. That's what this is all about.

1:25:30

We are extremely supportive of the verification measures that are in the analysis.

1:25:37

We want to make sure that we are held that standard. We're not shirking it, which is why we're going through the local

1:25:44

ER process and through secure and taking all the steps we need to take

1:25:49

and being transparent about it because we don't want to,

1:25:54

I don't want to be part of an ideal that isn't accountable

1:26:01

in delivering what many of these folks stood here to talk about today. So thank you, including you, Mr.

1:26:07

Lapis for your comments. Director Wagoner and Staff, We look forward to working with you

1:26:13

hopefully as we continue to go throughout this process. But I just wanted to provide that personal anecdote for you so.

1:26:19

You know, where I'm coming from, this is both a great professional opportunity, but it is personal for me

1:26:28

and a personal implication as a result of what I've gone through in living

1:26:35

what many of these people talked about instead of just talking about it is why I'm up here and why I'm proud and excited to be a part of this process.

1:26:45

So I really appreciate the time. I appreciate your staff. I look forward to answering questions if you have them.

1:26:50

I have a subject matter expert with me and hopefully working through the rest of the process with you to address

1:26:57

a growing environmental need and a problem we hope to be a solution to. Thank you.

1:27:04

Thank you, Mr. Foster. I appreciate you sharing your story with us as well as being here. Good morning.

1:27:10

John Kennedy with the rural county representatives of California. We represent 40 of the state's 58 counties.

1:27:16

I'm here on a different issue, the AP 1201 bifurcation feasibility analysis.

1:27:22

We as as world local governments have been on the forefront of 1383 implementation.

1:27:27

We are very concerned and think that bifurcation of organic waste is not feasible.

1:27:34

A determination that bifurcation is feasible would massively complicate and increase the costs of our 1383 organic waste

1:27:41

recycling collection and recycling efforts. I again will be brief because we submitted pretty

1:27:47

extensive comments on this justifying our decision and finding that this is not feasible, both from the processing perspective,

1:27:56

which I think your staff spent a lot of time on, but also from the collection and sorting perspective as well,

1:28:03

which we think would also support that finding of not being feasible. Thank you.

1:28:09

Thanks, Mr. Kennedy. And we have seen your comments.

1:28:15

Director Wagoner, team, Mark Murray with the environmental group California's Against Waste. I also think Mr.

1:28:20

Lapis heart is in the right place. I really appreciate the spectrum of issues

1:28:26

that you folks have to deal with at these meetings and really your thoughtfulness and patience in terms of listening to all of us

1:28:34

with all of our various concerns is is very much appreciated. I have three non-Hcycle

1:28:41

issues that I wanted to just kind of bring follow up on my two of my letters in the last 24 hours.

1:28:49

So number one on the I'm going to call them the orig grants.

1:28:55

We appreciate 99% of the grants that you've announced today and really appreciate all the work and time that's gone into those.

1:29:02

We think that this particular grant proposal is not ready for prime time. We'd ask you to press the pause button on that and meet with stakeholders

1:29:11

one more time to see if we can refine that proposal to better reflect the

1:29:17

what I think are the the market needs for the recycling collection community

1:29:22

and hopefully modify those those proposals so that it can better support the existing recycling community

1:29:31

so that they expand their operations to the sites where we need them. And I think that that's a finite problem that needs to be solved.

1:29:39

We know the regions where we need these recycling centers. We know the the stores that need reverse vending machines.

1:29:46

And I think a more focused and targeted grant program that is more right sized for the recycling community

1:29:54

would be more effective than the outline that's been proposed thus far.

1:29:59

Just one example is I'm not there's a minimum grant. 500,000 is a huge

1:30:05

amount of money for a recycling center. I think maybe a maximum grant right sized for a buyback

1:30:13

recycling center for a reverse vending machine would be appropriate. The second item, the plastic development incentives payments.

1:30:23

I'm going to keep calling them incentives, plastic market development incentives. You know, you guys do a fabulous job

1:30:29

of workshop ing issues and getting input from folks. I must have missed it on this one.

1:30:35

You've proposed a substantial change in the pmta incentives, and I wasn't aware that there was any kind of discussion about that.

1:30:44

Number one, I think that your instincts are pretty good in terms of thinking that there's an opportunity to update that program

1:30:52

to make it more responsive to market conditions. We've had a super up and down market with regard to PE.T.

1:31:00

What happens to PET. We used to say this about aluminum, that what happens to aluminum makes or breaks

1:31:05

the recycling infrastructure. Today in California, what happens to PET recycling makes or breaks the infrastructure.

1:31:13

Two years ago, the value to the recycling community of PET was more than \$105 million for the year.

1:31:21

Now it's \$33 million. You're having to make up that this disparity

1:31:27

with increased processing payments. Which came out this week. And we really appreciate the increased processing payments for PET.

1:31:36

But if we can get the market to work better, we can get back to the days when 50% of the cost of recycling

1:31:44

petit was covered by the scrap value for that material. So again, I think that the the proposed

1:31:52

plastic market development incentives are not ready for prime time as they've been outlined some of the language in them.

1:32:01

I'm not even sure that your division of recycling staff would actually understand it because it's it's mixing.

1:32:07

It seems to be mixing certified process with Reclaimers. So I think it could go with another run through before it becomes official.

1:32:17

The final item may be a question, but that is that current law with regard to program payment rates,

1:32:24

the commingled rate requires an annual adjustment in that the Department is required to

1:32:30

do not less than once a year but more frequently is necessary. Looking at 2024,

1:32:38

it is definitely necessary to update the co-mingled rate for collection programs and curbside recycling programs.

1:32:45

The statute gives you has a April 1st date and annually thereafter.

1:32:50

So if it is your intent to make that adjustment ahead of April 1st of 2024, I think folks could live with that.

1:33:00

It might be nice if the payments were retroactive to January 1st. We recognize it may be necessary to go out in the field

1:33:07

to conduct new co-mingled rate analysis to determine what's actually happening.

1:33:13

But just to know, in the past, you've actually calculated the amount of wine spirits in your co-mingled rate calculations.

1:33:22

So the past co-mingled rate assessments that you've done have had that number in it.

1:33:27

So, you know, that could have helped informed a co-mingled rate that could go it could have gone into effect on January 1st.

1:33:35

So maybe that's a question. Are you thinking you're going to adjust that program rate the comping rate

1:33:43

for 2024? Thanks, Mr. Murray. And as always, appreciate your thoughtfulness and detail

1:33:52

and would be happy to have discussions on all of these points with you and happy to set up a time to to

1:33:58

to go through the specifics. We did make a consideration of that, but because we anticipate

1:34:04

that the wine and distilled bottles will hopefully be funneling through our redemption centers,

1:34:11

we think that the amount coming through blue bins should very hopefully decrease significantly.

1:34:19

So with the addition of the the glass, but also the other materials that will be coming through

1:34:27

with the 353 additions of the the larger size juice containers,

1:34:32

we think we need to go back and do evaluations of that stream coming through the blueprint before setting that co-mingled.

1:34:41

Right. And I think we. Are. Having a hearing today.

1:34:46

That hearing is on for the 2025 rate. Yes. So what are we going to do in 2024?

1:34:52

We're holding the rate as it is for 2024. I'm looking forward to having a conversation.

1:34:58

We're happy to have a conversation with you, Marcus. Yeah. The statute authorizes you

1:35:05

to not do a co-mingled rate under these circumstances. Again, we don't have because of the change of statute,

1:35:13

we don't have a sense of what the materials will be coming through the redemption centers versus the blue.

1:35:20

But anyway, we can have at the time to chat. Always happy to do that. What

1:35:28

Christie of his Stoney Waste Connections, Happy holidays and what a great day to be here to hear all of this good conversation about the future and clean hydrogen.

1:35:37

And I know our heavy duty fleets that are going to be hauling materials across the state are going to need

1:35:43

hydrogen to, get their job done, and also provide clean air in all our communities no matter where you live.

1:35:52

I just wanted to comment again about, the bifurcation. I did comment on this at the hearing on November 1st.

1:36:00

I did not send in the letter. I've been a composter for most of my adult life, 35 years.

1:36:08

I actually do some of the certification with CDFA and Armory,

1:36:13

so I understand how my vacation would be super cost prohibitive and I don't know how

1:36:21

we would buy vacate our compost field and all of the equipment. So To me, it just doesn't make sense.

1:36:26

It's also, I believe with SB 54, we're going to get to a cleaner

1:36:32

product as far as packaging, I think the packaging industry is going to

1:36:38

learn how to make compostable materials that are truly compostable and more

1:36:48

synergistic with, if that's a word, with the soil. Okay, so the last thing we want to do is

1:36:55

spread pea fires and other chemicals back in the in the soils that we're growing our vegetables and fruits.

1:37:00

And so really important. And I think through that 54 process, we'll get there.

1:37:05

Lastly, I've commented a few times on this bottle bill reform in the rulemaking.

1:37:10

I've sent multiple notes back and forth. Sometimes I'm getting answers, sometimes I'm not, and sometimes it's evolving through the process.

1:37:18

But we operate and have operated multiple small. I'm going to use the coin small buyback centers throughout California,

1:37:28

in rural communities like Calistoga, Mammoth to him, El Dorado.

1:37:34

And I know that we're talking about adding a half a trillion new products to a program where the facilities

1:37:42

have been reduced in half and now we're at 1200 sites. We're going to add another half a trillion products to it.

1:37:50

And I just can tell you right now with our team, we're very concerned about where we're going to put this stuff

1:37:57

and how we're going to process it and if we're going to move to 2,000 pounds of one ton of glass per customer,

1:38:04

our facilities will not be able to comply with this requirement. And so unless you can come up with a tiered, you know,

1:38:11

we're a one or two or three small, medium, large, our size center, I don't know how we'll keep up.

1:38:18

And so we may have to convert some of those centers to bag drops because we will not be able to compete with what's going to come our way.

1:38:27

As specifically, we operate in rural communities that are located in wine countries all throughout the state.

1:38:33

So it could be potentially very problematic for us. And lastly, I wish the new container types were part of SB 54

1:38:41

because they're multilayer packaging, which is what SB 54 is all about. And so we currently don't have markets for that, which means Kao Recycle

1:38:49

is now in a wish recycling place. You're you're AB January one.

1:38:54

We're going to you're going to be part of the wish recycling movement. So I'd just like to say I'm not sure what we can do about that, but

1:39:02

it'll be interesting to unfold. Thank you. I so, so, so appreciate your comments.

1:39:09

Kristi, can we set up a time to to talk specifically actually, on all of these points?

1:39:14

And I would like to just put a fine point not to add to your comment, because I don't typically do that. But on

1:39:20

on compost, not only not having that degrade our compost,

1:39:26

but shouldn't everything that go into what goes into our competition it be an additive that we want in our compost

1:39:33

as opposed to just the fact that it can break down and compost? Shouldn't it be something that's positive?

1:39:40

So that's that. That's what we want to work with all of you on. And it's how do we make you know, you talk about being from the wine country.

1:39:48

I envision California compost as being the the California wine of compost.

1:39:55

It is how do we create a new market that every state,

1:40:01

every country wants California labeled compost. So anyway, sorry, I, I should be in an advocacy position, but I just I couldn't resist.

1:40:13

I am George Canterbury Conservation Management. I just want to echo what Mark Murray said

1:40:21

on the redemption for buyback, not for buybacks, for curbside and collection programs.

1:40:29

I think it's very important that they're able to get the additional redemption on these products

1:40:35

because you have people that are going out and collecting from bars and restaurants and the bulk of that material from them, in many cases, at least by wait,

1:40:44

is the the wine and liquor and what you're saying is that for a whole year

1:40:51

they won't be able to get any redemption on that. It will be at the same rate. And the same thing goes for most people that recycle today.

1:41:00

Buybacks will continue to and they will bring wine. Most people that don't use their blue bin will continue to it

1:41:07

in their blue bin regardless of what that container is. This is over 50 years of experience

1:41:14

for me in this business of helping write AB 20 20 years ago and working in it for many, many years.

1:41:22

So I just comment and I appreciate what everybody had to say. I learned a lot here today. Thank you.

1:41:30

Thank you so much for being here today. Appreciate the comment.

1:41:36

Are there any other comments in the room today? Okay. So now we'll go to the call in comments.

1:41:42

And again, if you're calling in, your microphones will stay muted until you're called on by the last four digits of your phone number.

1:41:49

Also, if you're calling, please mute your computer sound before you start speaking so that we don't have an echo.

1:41:55

Do we have any callers? Yes, Maria, we have about 12 calls in the queue.

1:42:00

We'll take them in the order they were received. CALLER with the target is 40 to 200.

1:42:05

I'm going to ask you to unmute right now. Please state your name and affiliation.

1:42:11

Next up is going to be caller who's labeled iphone exclamation point. So, caller, with the last four digits,

1:42:17

go ahead and state your name and affiliation. Hi, my name is Demos Johnson a third.

1:42:24

I am a district representative for supervisor federal Glover here in Contra Costa County.

1:42:29

And I just wanted to thank you for the opportunity to express strong support for H Cycle waste, a hydrogen process

1:42:36

which will play a critical role in solving for organic diversion in California. We support the agency's push to explore the development of new and innovative

1:42:44

collection and processing technologies with the focus on SB 1383 compliance,

1:42:50

multiple reporting sources say that the state's waste haulers and processors working with municipalities will continue to face difficulties with organic

1:42:58

diversion, primarily due to limited capacity of feedstock contamination impacting and anaerobic digestion and composting.

1:43:07

As SB 1383 tools, we are excited to work with a cycle to help construct world class solutions that will tackle several California goals.

1:43:17

Of utmost importance to the environment. Namely, SB 83 and SB 32

1:43:23

and the state's goal of carbon neutrality by 2045, adding the eight cycle ways to hydrogen process as a compliant technology

1:43:32

for landfill diversion is an important signal to the states intention to act. And this decision will bring benefits on many fronts, including reduction

1:43:41

in landfill methane associated with mixed organic and in the post MRF MSW streams otherwise heading heading to landfills.

1:43:50

We believe H cycle complements the existing composting and anaerobic digestion industries.

1:43:56

A cycle creates green hydrogen using non combustion thermal and thermal technology, which will help too,

1:44:04

which will help hard to decarbonize industrial and transportation sectors. Lower emissions, and can also help municipalities comply

1:44:12

with the procurement provisions of SB 1383 a cycle. Projects will make significant investments in clean infrastructure

1:44:21

benefitting the host communities with tax revenue, jobs and help curb pollution from heavy duty trucking over

1:44:29

excuse me, over 175 average local union construction jobs over a course of 15 months.

1:44:36

Landfills are continuing to see not only meet their release but other problems. As noted in recent articles in the L.A.

1:44:43

Times regarding L.A. County landfill, the industry needs more technical solutions, such as a cycle.

1:44:50

These solutions are distinctively circular and with waste. Otherwise going to landfill being repurposed, they hope fossil ized,

1:44:59

substantial and industrial sources and heavy duty diesel trucks with a clean alternative to fossil fuels,

1:45:06

which will help improve local air quality concerns. We strongly urge car recycle to move swiftly and as the termination

1:45:13

of a cycles Article two designation and approved is much needed pathway to addressing a critical growing and environmental rate risk.

1:45:22

Once again, this is the most Johnson representing supervisor Federal Glover here in Contra Costa County

1:45:28

and he wholeheartedly supports this project. Thank you.

1:45:34

Thank you so much. Next up, I'm going to ask iPhone, exclamation point to unmute.

1:45:39

And next in the queue is Clifford Post

1:45:52

iPhone exclamation point. Go ahead with your name and affiliation if you can hear me.

1:45:58

All right. Next, we're going to go with Clifford Post. I'm going to go ahead and ask you to unmute as soon as you're unmuted.

1:46:03

Go ahead and share your name and affiliation.

1:46:13

Yes, my name is Kurt Post and I am with our planet Earth. However, this is a little out of order.

1:46:20

The person that will be speaking on. Our planet Earth. Is by David Duke, and his phone number is Engine 4250.

1:46:29

4250. Let me look for him here.

1:46:34

I'm sorry. It's 2450450. I'll go ahead and ask him to on mute right now. Thank you.

1:46:51

All right, go ahead. When you're ready.

1:46:58

Hi, this is Bob Duke, and I am the co-founder of the company Our Planet Earth.

1:47:04

We're completely vertically integrated, recycler and manufacturer of recycled pet containers for the food and beverage industry located in the city of Vernon.

1:47:13

Today, I'll be making comments about the proposed use of the recently appropriated funds for the Plastics Market Development Payment Program.

1:47:21

I'm speaking on behalf of my company and several of the other pet reclaimers operating in the state.

1:47:28

Grave concern with the changes to the Plastics Market Development program and have a lot of questions.

1:47:36

We would like the opportunity to provide input and formally ask for a workshop

1:47:41

before the department implements the changes, reducing market development payments in some of the proposed tiers

1:47:48

to RECLAIMERS and manufacturers below the current levels will further undermine

1:47:53

a historically weak market for PC or PET in California.

1:47:59

While seemingly creative and well-intended, the proposed payment tiers appear to misunderstand

1:48:05

current market conditions that have lasted for well over a year and will likely result in a further loss of California Reclaimers

1:48:13

and use markets. Last week, the department's tracking of pet scrap prices showed

1:48:19

they are at a historically low level of \$147 per ton,

1:48:24

highlighting the extremely weak market demand from the beverage and thermal farm industry For recycled pet,

1:48:31

the prices are 40% below the average for the last decade. We strongly support a greater investment and development

1:48:38

of California markets for recycled PET. However, the specifics do matter.

1:48:44

This new payment system seems to hurt the companies most in need of these market development payments.

1:48:50

All the California Washington operators are struggling with each company in the sector doing its best to survive in a very challenging environment

1:48:58

where low cost virgin and recycled pet imports from Asia have have depressed pricing and dealing with operating costs

1:49:06

that are much higher than out of state or out of country reclaimers due to much weaker than expected demand that has forced each reclaimers

1:49:13

to make very difficult decisions, including reducing run hours and unfortunately having substantial layoffs of personnel during the year.

1:49:23

The plastics that go through this program can be recycled multiple times,

1:49:29

including thermal form containers. My company purchases post-consumer curbside bales that contain thermal form container.

1:49:36

They may contain up to 20% thermal forms, recycle the bottles and thermal forms together in a flake form and make new, recycled pet

1:49:45

reforms for the beverage industry and thermal forms for food, produce, drinking cups and other types of applications.

1:49:51

Bottles made from our free forms contain recycled post-consumer thermal form content.

1:49:56

It is very important and we believe that Cal Recycle should encourage the recycling of all of pet containers.

1:50:03

Our goal and the state's goal via SB 54 and other legislation is to close the loop on all plastic

1:50:11

and not favor one at the expense of others.

1:50:20

All right. Thank you. Bob. I have a few more comments.

1:50:25

We urge the following four manufacturers to be eligible for the higher Tier one payments for exceeding the minimum PCR content requirements specified in 8793

1:50:36

100% of its purchases must be from California generated process and manufactured PCR PET.

1:50:44

There should be equal payments for both manufacturers and reclaimers of \$20 million each, with no distinction between RECLAIM

1:50:51

or PMD payments for processing A-grade, which are deposits or bails or B-grade bails which are curbside bale and equal payments

1:51:00

per ton for the manufacturers of bottles and thermal forms. The statute under PRC 145492.

1:51:09

The Department shall consider the minimum funding level needed to encourage interstate washing and processing of empty plastic beverage containers collected

1:51:17

for recycling in the state. Given the current and expected market conditions, the reclaimers need a pmta

1:51:23

that is at a minimum consistent with a tier one payment of \$75 per ton to be able to stay competitive over the years.

1:51:32

Californians with a number of recyclers and related businesses failing, including Carbon White, go two and replant

1:51:41

redemption centers, which closed several hundred redemption centers and will 750 jobs

1:51:47

without a strong base of reclaimers to process the large amount of post-consumer plastic that's collected in the state,

1:51:53

the material will end being shipped out of state for processing or being landfilled if there are no buyers for it.

1:52:00

Both are outcomes that are diametrically opposed to the state's enviable of having and growing a circular economy.

1:52:07

The department has a history of being open and transparent. We urge Cal Recycle to withdraw this substantial change a proposed PNB

1:52:15

payment structure until the Department has convened a public meeting or workshop with stakeholders so that any new payment structure

1:52:22

is workable and responsive to market conditions and program objectives. Thank you very much for your time

1:52:29

and allowing me to speak today. Thank you so much. And can I ask, you had some very substantive comments,

1:52:36

so could you make sure to send those directly to the department

1:52:42

and to the beverage container recycling program?

1:52:49

Thank you so much. Of course, we'll gladly follow up with that.

1:52:56

Thank you. Clifford, Post any additional comments?

1:53:04

It does not appear so. Next, I'm going to ask caller 47272 unmute.

1:53:10

So I'll go ahead. And then next up will be poly.

1:53:17

CALLER 4727 Go ahead when you're ready with your name and affiliation. Yeah, thank you.

1:53:23

My name is Eric Pasquale. I'm with the San Francisco Environment Department.

1:53:29

My comments aren't necessarily tied directly to today's agenda, so just want to make sure that I'm submitting them correctly.

1:53:36

First. We open the public meeting to obviously anything on our agenda, but if there is anything directly

1:53:45

related to the work that Cal Recycle is currently doing, please feel free to comment.

1:53:51

Okay. Thank you. Again, my name is Eric Cassar with the San Francisco Environment Department. I am the zero waste coordinator for Construction and Demolition

1:54:01

in support of California Green Building Standards Code and the Mission of Recycle

1:54:06

to Reduce, Reuse and Recycle California Resources. San Francisco has developed local ordinances to oversee the collection

1:54:15

and processing of construction and demolition surplus materials. This has evolved over the years from a primary focus

1:54:23

on downstream material recovery rates to an increasing recognition

1:54:28

of the importance of upstream decisions and closed loop recovery systems, and is an important part of this evolution.

1:54:36

Was the understanding that C and D facilities were often asked to provide project teams with minimum recovery

1:54:43

rates of 65% or higher. San Francisco adopted a regulatory framework

1:54:50

that required all C and D facilities to be registered with the city and have their recovery rates verified by a third party.

1:54:59

The result has been diversion rates for mixed C and D processing, generally falling below the 65% threshold.

1:55:08

Therefore, in order for construction projects in San Francisco to meet minimum recovery requirements,

1:55:15

they need to work with facilities to deliver source separated materials. One example of this effort

1:55:22

is the recycling of gypsum drywall in a return to manufacturer program.

1:55:28

San Francisco already partnered with pilot projects and our facility network to support this model with positive results.

1:55:37

Our cycle is uniquely situated advance these efforts through its partnership and influence across the state.

1:55:44

We Hope to Recycle explores funding mechanisms to support facilities to invest in source separated material recovery programs

1:55:53

like the gypsum return to manufacturing effort. Thank you.

1:55:58

Thank you so much for participating today. Next up, I'm going to ask Paul Lee to unmute.

1:56:06

And next up is the caller with the last four digits, 2724. So, Paul, you go ahead, unmute yourself.

1:56:11

State your name and affiliation. You'd like to make a comment.

1:56:20

All right. Next up is going to be 2724. I'll go ahead and ask you to unmute, state your affiliation.

1:56:27

Your comment. Hello. Thank you. My name is Janice Schroeder and I'm a core member of the West

1:56:35

Berkeley Alliance for Clean Air and Safe Jobs for Grass Organization.

1:56:41

And the Alliance is also a member of the California Environmental Justice Coalition.

1:56:47

I became involved with the struggle for reducing air pollution in 1980

1:56:54

and continued to be actively involved in that. I'm calling today to urge you

1:57:01

to reject approval of the so-called plan to build five incinerators,

1:57:07

which will burn waste and make it into hydrogen. I'm calling for you to reject that approval

1:57:14

until there is further analysis and an additional EIR done.

1:57:21

The additional environmental impact report is needed to assess the potential harms and impacts

1:57:28

and also including environmental justice impacts to already overburdened communities.

1:57:36

Communities that will be impacted by an eight cycle facility have not given their input.

1:57:44

This facility is a transformation facility and what is proposed to be burned.

1:57:50

This is my big concern. What is proposed to be burned will release extremely

1:57:56

toxic hazardous air polluting emissions. Therefore, I urge that more analysis be done

1:58:05

and is needed before the Department can determine that the technology

1:58:10

will be a reduction in landfill emissions comparable to composting.

1:58:17

Thank you very much for taking my comments. Thank you, Mrs. Schroeder, for your participation today.

1:58:24

Appreciate your comments. All right. Next, I'm going to ask caller 3911 to unmute and the next will be

1:58:31

caller 3352.

1:58:42

All right. Go ahead. 3911 with your name and affiliation. Oh, thank you. This is Heidi Sanborn.

1:58:48

I'm with the National Stewardship Action Council. We are an advocate for an equitable and circular economy.

1:58:55

And I have seen four things I'd like to touch on real quickly. One is

1:59:01

support for the H Cycle project. We normally align with a lot of the environmental groups

1:59:07

that signed on to the letter, but we have a climate emergency and we need to get these organics managed in California.

1:59:17

And so we're excited to see a project that's going to help the local community.

1:59:23

And we want to thank all those people who came all the way from the Bay Area to speak. It was very moving

1:59:30

and to provide a just transition for the people that want to continue to work but just need to find jobs outside of oil and gas.

1:59:39

So again, there's no silver bullet, there's only silver buckshot. And this is a great project just to cut our teeth on.

1:59:46

And we really encourage that. And support the H Local project.

1:59:52

The next one is the bifurcation. We want to support John Kennedy's comments, and I believe it was Christy Brewer as well said this, that

1:59:59

we don't know how this is going to apply for creation of the organics. There's so much cost already and burden on the local governments.

2:00:08

We just don't think that's going to work. We'd like to also comment on the carpet, and we want to thank Hal Recycle

2:00:15

for the disapproval of this contingency plan.

2:00:22

It was a very thoughtful analysis and it's taken a lot of staff time, I'm sure, to to review and provide all the comments.

2:00:30

But that contingency was actually required by a bill that we sponsored 87 to 9 in 2019 by David Chu

2:00:37

as a response to Care's unsatisfactory performance, including multiple planned approvals and fines for noncompliance,

2:00:45

as well as the need to put in safeguards to ensure that the residents have uninterrupted

2:00:52

to the program should another entity need to step in and take over for the implementation of the project program.

2:01:00

Even when the requirements are clearly spelled out in statute, Care still manages to submit inadequate plans, which is befuddling to us.

2:01:09

Moreover, through the contingency plan amendment, there are multiple references to Cal Recycle having a contract with care.

2:01:17

Or. Paying care for its consultation, which quite frankly, we find offensive.

2:01:22

After a decade plus of failure to act, we feel in good faith requiring Cal Recycle to spend an outsized amount of

2:01:31

overseeing a visible fee program. This is not the kind of EPR we want. We want to see internalize costs, and we'd like to suggest that care,

2:01:40

contact, product care or any other successful stewardship program to get some help

2:01:47

in implementing this program. And the contingency plan, since CARE is once again failed to meet the standards of the law.

2:01:53

We're sad to say, but we do support the directors decision to disapprove the contingency plan and hope that they will get some help

2:02:02

complying since they seem to have a consistent problem doing so. Regarding Sandia, I want to support San Francisco comments.

2:02:10

We've been working with multiple stakeholders regarding Sandy and more specifically gypsum recycling, but have concerns that date

2:02:18

back to June of 2021, when the Statewide Recycling Commission, which I chaired, adopted a recommendation on Sandy.

2:02:27

We're seeing a lot of concern around reporting this, and we feel that third

2:02:33

party certifications are very important to ensure accuracy. We think the diversion rates are higher than actually that they should be.

2:02:43

And so we'd like to see some sort of funding, especially to pilot gypsum, because we have gypsum manufacturers in the Bay Area in L.A.

2:02:52

and several of them are very eager to get more clean gypsum back for recycling and use a new board.

2:02:59

But they need some help. So we would like to see Culver Cycle consider some some funding for that.

2:03:06

And lastly, we would like to support Bob David's comments that, you know, it's always good to have good public meetings

2:03:16

and lots of good discussion like we've had here today before rate structures are imposed that may cause undue burden on different businesses.

2:03:24

It's a very complicated time and lots of market changes. So we want to wish everybody also happy holidays.

2:03:30

It's been a very long year. A lot of hard work for everybody, especially Cal Recycle. So thank you so much for allowing me

2:03:35

to make the comments and wishing you a happy holidays. And there Happy holidays, Heidi. Thank you so much for your

2:03:44

as always thoughtful comments. Have a very, very happy holiday.

2:03:50

You call our last word in just three, three, five to state your name and affiliation. Color number seven, 954. You're up next.

2:03:58

Yeah, this is. Can you hear me? Yes. Okay. My name is John X Whitaker.

2:04:04

I'm with the Grace Neighborhood Council. I need to oppose the H cycle proposal.

2:04:11

Our community is a disadvantaged community in Grayson, California. We were home to the Wesley Tire incinerator.

2:04:19

We currently have one of garbage incinerators in Crow's Landing. We had had these proposals, these so-called clean technology

2:04:28

proposals thrown us, and they're not clean at all. It's greenwashing. Hydrogen is new.

2:04:35

There's been explosions in Bakersville and in Ohio. We we have two proposals.

2:04:41

The Stanislaus County Board of Supervisors is planning at Crow's Landing enable based some form of this hydrogen thing over there.

2:04:49

And there's a company called Emeritus in riverbank communities of color who historically have had

2:04:56

pollution issues. And that's the areas these are not going to be in ink.

2:05:02

And white neighborhoods, let's call it like it is. This is going to be in the same disadvantaged communities you need.

2:05:08

We need community hearings by gallery cycle to come out to our communities

2:05:16

and to give us notice so we can get people to these meetings to really talk about how this is going to affect our communities.

2:05:23

We're tired of coming in with this so-called new technology. I know labor is for labor is for all jobs.

2:05:30

I'm I'm a labor person. For years, all my jobs have been labor jobs. I understand their want for jobs, but

2:05:37

I would just caution them to say that a lot of times it comes on. You can build it in like that, but let's see how long you stay

2:05:45

on those jobs with this new technology. Now, the other thing I just want to say is we want community meetings

2:05:52

in all of these five locations or excuse me, I think it's eight facilities.

2:05:57

A plan. We should have community meetings, go recycle, come out, organize those and have and will do that, getting people there.

2:06:05

And let's really have a talk. Nobody's came out to our community to tell us about what was proposed

2:06:11

and when we go to the county and the city meetings, you know, we get turned a deaf ear and the other thing I'll say and I'll close is I find it

2:06:20

really interesting that some of the callers are like

2:06:25

Joe from L.A. and Mark from from the Bay Area were asked to contact you guys and talk to you guys later.

2:06:33

But you didn't ask Nick Lapis who was against it to call and talk to you. And I seriously doubt that you'll want to talk to me.

2:06:41

Thank you for your time. Well, actually, I was going to ask that you submit your contact information

2:06:48

directly to recycle and to our Environmental Justice office as well.

2:06:55

And You know, I'm sorry, Nick. I'm more than happy as

2:07:02

Nick is a regulator communicator with the department and and is here in Sacramento often.

2:07:12

And so he knows that he can always reach out to us. So just to clarify, we are in regular communication with Nick when he's here.

2:07:23

But thank you. Thank you very much for your comments and it is not

2:07:29

that is very much to the purpose of having this public meeting where we are and

2:07:36

and why we have additionally had the simulcasts and have been able to expand our simulcast now to have phone in

2:07:43

so that we are able to bring members from every California community

2:07:48

into our meeting and to have these comments. So thank you for your comment and for participating.

2:07:54

I'm color with the last four digits 7954. Please state your name, affiliation and public comment.

2:07:59

Up next is going to be color 81747954. Please go ahead.

2:08:05

Thank you. Good afternoon. My name is Bianca Lopez. I am a committee member here in Stanislaus County.

2:08:11

I wanted to say I appreciate John's the last comments

2:08:17

that were made. It is it does seem like this is a rigged system.

2:08:25

Often we've we've communicated with Cal Recycle as well, along with many organizations who have reached out to Cal Recycle

2:08:32

about these solutions like eight cycles proposals. And they know that we care about this.

2:08:39

They know that we're a grassroots organization and they put these things on the agenda and don't reach out.

2:08:45

So these these processes are intended to leave community voices out.

2:08:51

Fortunately, there are some community organizations who are backed by industry

2:08:57

who are able to attend and participate in such as today.

2:09:02

But as a grassroots organizer in Sarasota County, I want to share some of our perspective with these false solutions.

2:09:10

We have one of the last operating waste to energy incinerator. The other one is in Long Beach and actually soon to shut down

2:09:18

because it's no longer economically feasible. It will. Their contract ends and at the end of January of next year,

2:09:26

the Santos Covanta incinerator is in a disadvantaged community, predominantly Latino Spanish speaking farmworker communities.

2:09:33

Since 88, Covanta has regularly emitted numerous harmful pollutants,

2:09:39

including nitrogen oxides, sulfur oxides, particulate matter, ammonia and lead, among other toxic materials and hexavalent chromium.

2:09:50

Covanta is one of the leading stationary sources of air pollution in our communities,

2:09:56

according to EPA's enforcement database. Covanta Stanislaus has had a high priority violation of its air

2:10:03

permit requirements for the last four quarters. In addition, the facility exceeded emission limits for nitrogen oxide,

2:10:10

sulfur oxide and carbon monoxide March 2020 and exceeded nitrogen

2:10:16

oxide and carbon monoxide emission limits again in August of 2020.

2:10:22

As our community been fighting this incinerator for over 20 years, this year,

2:10:27

we were successful at producing a zero waste plan to community engagement that has implemented a true just transition from waste to energy

2:10:36

to community based, community led programs that have the potential to create true local and well-paying jobs

2:10:43

and promote community owned businesses. As we continue to fight against this incinerator,

2:10:49

we learn about other technologies that are being proposed to our local government and the state that are unfortunately led by fossil fuel

2:10:56

industries like Chevron and Exxon, which also paint communities of color and unions against other.

2:11:03

As we see here today, we want jobs, we want to just transition,

2:11:09

but we don't want to compromise our health and our food and the future of, our children.

2:11:15

We have to have some standards. Rite Aid cycle has previously proposed eight facilities

2:11:21

in the state of California. Two of them are proposed to come to the Central Valley, where our communities have been overburdened

2:11:27

by not just oil refineries and oil extraction, but also from other fossil fuel products like pesticides that have contaminated air

2:11:35

or water, our food systems and our health. We urge you to reject Exxon

2:11:42

AIDS Sacco's application for the proposed hydrogen facility based on these compelling concerns.

2:11:48

It's a crude it is crucial to prioritize the well-being of our communities, adhere to environmental justice principles, and ensure transparent

2:11:55

and thorough evaluations of technologies with potential environmental and public health impacts.

2:12:01

The underlying premise that cycles technology provides greater greenhouse gas reduction than composting lacks substantiation.

2:12:10

The latest application fails to provide comprehensive data supporting this claim, raising questions about the completeness or of information and analysis.

2:12:21

Crucial issues related to emissions, soil health, carbon sequestration and material streams

2:12:26

must be thoroughly addressed before any approval is considered. Our skepticism regarding the viability and success of eight cycles proposed waste

2:12:35

gasification process is grounded in a track record of high profile failures, safety concerns and financial losses

2:12:44

associated with similar high temperature thermal processing reports on waste to hydrogen technologies further highlight

2:12:51

potential environmental risks and inefficiencies. Approving eight cycles.

2:12:57

Technology could set a dangerous leading California down a potential harmful

2:13:02

path of high temperature incineration and waste to energy approaches. Drawing parallels with the European Union shift away from incineration

2:13:11

due to pollution concerns, We caution against adopting technologies with substantial environmental and public health risks.

2:13:18

We Firmly believe that additional analysis is imperative before the department can reasonably determine that age cycles.

2:13:26

Technology offers a reduction in landfill emissions comparable to composting a more comprehensive environment.

2:13:33

Environmental impact analysis is necessary before granting approval for the proposed technology.

2:13:42

I am a mother of two boys. My son, my oldest son was six and I have asthma.

2:13:49

I live in Riverbank. We're right next to a Superfund site. Our communities are tired.

2:13:55

We're literally dying as people on the ground are expressing today from Richmond in the Bay Area.

2:14:03

That is true of all people of color, low income communities and the state of California and across the country.

2:14:11

We cannot keep buying into these false solutions just because they promised jobs.

2:14:17

Well-paying jobs are great, but at what expense?

2:14:23

These systems are not vetted properly. They will still emit emissions and they will continue to kill us

2:14:30

because of Chevron and Exxon who are backing these practices. And we're falling, falling for

2:14:38

yet my staff, not in my community, not in my backyard, not in my hood for the sake of my health and the health of my children.

2:14:47

And the children of my children. Thank you.

2:14:53

Thank you, Ms.. Lopez, for your participation today. We appreciate your comments.

2:14:59

And if you wouldn't mind reaching out to the the

2:15:05

department directly with your comments, that would be helpful as well. As we continue our conversations.

2:15:13

Thank you. Next is caller 8174. I'll ask you to unmute, state your name, affiliation and comment.

2:15:20

Up next is color 24508174. Please go ahead if you're ready.

2:15:26

Thank you. Good afternoon and happy holidays. My name is Melinda Girardi. I serve as the executive director

2:15:32

at the Association of California Recycling Industries. Actually actually represents businesses that are committed to protecting

2:15:39

the rights of independent recyclers and promoting free market competition for recyclable materials.

2:15:44

Thank you for allowing me to comment today. First, I want to acknowledge the new processing payments that were released this week.

2:15:50

I supported SB 353. The update released. So the success of this effort to better cover the cost of recycling

2:15:57

plastics in the current market. We look forward to the continued success of this updated formula.

2:16:02

Thank you. Next, I would like to speak to the proposed no change in co-mingle rates for equity members.

2:16:09

This will be problematic and needs to be changed without delay with changes to the recycling program defined in SB 1013 and SB 353.

2:16:17

We believe curbside operators work and other collection programs and buyback will see significant increases in co-mingled products.

2:16:25

We are asking the department to conduct a co-mingled study in the first quarter of next year to ensure the state's recycling partners like our members

2:16:32

are accurately compensated for any commingled materials collected. We respectfully request an opportunity

2:16:37

to meet with the Department to discuss these imminent impacts further. And finally, we're asking, with a permit to postpone action

2:16:44

on the Recycling Innovation Grant program, this winter and power cycle can convene further stakeholder workshops.

2:16:50

We believe from our association and other industry stakeholders would provide valuable insight when looking at areas of investment

2:16:57

in the industry and existing recycling infrastructure. After you've committed to being a partner for the department,

2:17:03

we'd like to be a resource in your success. Our Board of Directors and members would be glad to meet with the department

2:17:09

or share written feedback given the opportunity. Thank you for your time today.

2:17:16

Thank you so much for your comments. And we, if you wouldn't mind sending those directly to the BCP

2:17:23

as well, that would be helpful. Thank you so much for participating. Up next is color 2450, followed by color 6171.

2:17:31

So color two, four or five zero. Please state your name, affiliation and comment.

2:17:37

Yes. Hi. Hi. This is Bob Devereux and I made the comments right after clip posted.

2:17:45

So I'm. I'm finished. At it. Thank you. All right. So color 611.

2:17:51

I'm going to ask you to unmute. You're going to be followed by color 7250.

2:17:59

Hello. Yes, thank you. Emily Garcia with Natural Resources Defense Council calling on behalf of thousands of members across the state

2:18:07

to express our great concern for the decision being made about recycle. We don't believe the application has met the criteria required for approval

2:18:14

and options. One is not consistent with the statute or regulations, and further analysis is needed to determine the negative impacts on.

2:18:22

The environment and. Public health. Thank you.

2:18:27

Thank you so much for your comments. All right. Up next will be calling 7250, followed by Melinda Gray,

2:18:37

who I believe already spoke and then followed by 21687250. Please say your name and your comment.

2:18:45

Yes, thank you. This is Alice Trillo with the Biodegradable Products Institute or BPI. I hope you can me All right.

2:18:51

First, we'd like to disagree with the determination that bifurcation is not feasible. I think it's worth noting that almost 40% of the respondents

2:18:59

agreed with us responding that bifurcation was feasible. I want to stress, though, I heard composer today

2:19:06

and we understand that bifurcation could be expensive. And so I'd like establish a couple of things. One, that composers wouldn't be forced to bifurcate if determined feasible.

2:19:14

And second, we and others fought for funding to be 54, including such that our members, makers

2:19:20

of certified, composed of products would pay fees towards compost processing. So very much putting our money where our mouth is.

2:19:27

And so we were disappointed that those funding opportunities weren't divulged in the survey and that composers may have responded differently had they known.

2:19:34

We're also disappointed that no clear threshold for determining classification feasibility was ever established so it's a little unclear to us

2:19:41

how the determination was made. We'd love clarification there. I also wanted to respond directly to Director Wagner.

2:19:47

You talked about composite inputs providing value to the finished compost to create a high quality product.

2:19:53

And we agree with you at BPI, we test our products rigorously for disintegration and biodegrade

2:19:59

and eco toxicity and a P4 scheme that has served as the basis for state laws across the country.

2:20:05

Now, it's also why we filed a petition to the National Organics Program to allow compostable products to be allowable inputs for organic eggs so that composers in California

2:20:13

can maximize their diversion, can get higher prices for their product. So let's talk value composer What products have been shown to help divert

2:20:21

tons of food waste that would otherwise go to landfills and create methane? I think that's all you right there. We also know from studies

2:20:27

that compostable product can provide beneficial structure in piles. That's something I've heard directly from composters,

2:20:33

and they don't negatively affect the nutrient content of finished compost that's been studied as well. But one of the thing I want to mention is that the bifurcation study

2:20:40

perpetuates what we fear is a habitual misidentification of contaminants. We believe

1,000% that composters correctly

2:20:48

identify contamination as a concern and they don't intentionally misinform. But we know that there's no reliable way

2:20:54

to identify the composition of contaminants in compost without laboratory characterization and without it, contaminants

2:21:01

may be assumed to be compostable, which perpetuates a false assumption that those materials don't break down and compost conditions.

2:21:07

Despite all the laboratory and field testing to the positive. And we actually know that

2:21:12

this is routinely the case because we've conducted over testing that identified contaminants that were thought to be compostable plastic,

2:21:20

but we're noncombustible plastic. This has happened over and over. And so we hope that covers that goal, reconsidered this determination.

2:21:27

And equally as important, that any future data collection informs that informs such determinations rely on more scientific means.

2:21:36

Because, again, we believe the commercial products provide value. And then that's been shown again and again,

2:21:41

especially compared to noncombustible counterparts that are known contaminants and generators of microplastics and finished compost.

2:21:48

But we want to be clear value is determined by science and not perception. And we're of course, more than happy to talk.

2:21:53

We want to have an open dialog recover cycle and we hope to send thanks for the opportunity. Happy holidays.

2:21:59

Thank you so much and appreciate the comments and your participation. Happy holidays.

2:22:05

Next is color to 168. Please unmute your mikes, state your affiliation. Go ahead. That's followed by call 0872, two, one.

2:22:13

Please go ahead. Good morning, Director Wagner and the other esteemed members of Counter-cyclical.

2:22:19

My name is Paul Bahu and I am president of Global Plastics Recycling. We are a petit wash line located in Paris, California.

2:22:26

Though we've all spoken before and know each other, I hope all is well with you during this holiday season. As for me, my business is struggling like before.

2:22:34

My comments are in regards to NDP program. For those who don't know what that is.

2:22:39

The MVP payments are. An incentive structure meant to keep California's recycled PET bottles in state to be processed into finished goods.

2:22:48

So as I mentioned in the past, we all need to work. Together to recycle and the state's recycling stakeholders.

2:22:54

We all want same thing. A functional and successful circular economy for better consumer

2:23:00

packaging can recycle even mentioned as much an hour ago. You want a circular economy?

2:23:05

I want a circular economy. The people want a circular economy. It's one of the few things people can largely get behind in this age of strife and division.

2:23:13

Yet here we are unable to connect the dots. As my colleague Bob Davidson from our Planet Earth mentioned,

2:23:18

the whole thing is resting on shaky ground right now. The economy isn't great. What winter last year wrecked California's Berry, leading to decreased.

2:23:26

Demand and cheap imports. Are flooding in from East Asia. Those imports, mind you, are being. Sold at less.

2:23:32

Than our domestic industry's cost of production. Every company from recycling centers to manufacturers are feeling it.

2:23:38

And we've been feeling it ever since September 2022. We've been collectively limping along for five quarters.

2:23:45

You've heard a lot of people talk about it, and we're still in it. So in the last three months, I've had to lay off over 40% of my workforce.

2:23:53

The other wash line are no different. Having instituted massive. Layoffs to contend with the. Constricted avenues still available to us Sonoco one of the biggest companies

2:24:03

in this ecosystem, even closed their Exeter plant two months ago, taking with them California jobs and opportunities for end market.

2:24:10

When I asked them why they were closing their plant, the answer I received was imports.

2:24:16

In addition, Republic Services just opened their wash line plant in Las Vegas. We now have to contend with another player in the market who has advantages over

2:24:23

California businesses. This company will be going up directly against California wash lines and yet cal recycled new pump guidelines made sheet and.

2:24:31

Thermoforming end users even. Less likely to buy our fleet as their. Incentive payments have been cut.

2:24:37

I struggle to understand the rationale behind short. Paying these companies. As I have. Stated in the past, the pump is the only way of leveling the playing field.

2:24:46

Outside of President Biden changing his Trans-Pacific trade policy. Now I seem to have lost his phone number.

2:24:52

Perhaps you guys can give him a call and ask on our behalf. If not, here we are.

2:24:58

The house is on fire and pump is the fire hose. Yet, rather than target that money towards blaze, the funding

2:25:05

which was procured through reclaim or lobbying seems largely to be pointed at the perfectly fine house next door.

2:25:11

The bottlers are an integral part of closed loop system, yet they are in no danger of closing their doors.

2:25:16

If that's. So. Why then. Is the majority of the pump funding being funneled towards them?

2:25:22

The \$150 per payment is about \$0.78 per pound in real terms.

2:25:27

Yet the current distance between imported resin and California's output material is close to \$0.20 pound.

2:25:34

It's a math problem that doesn't pencil out as it is laid out. I do not believe that this new structure will help.

2:25:39

And in fact may. Harm the recycling ecosystem in California. Further. I humbly request the time where we can all get in the same room

2:25:47

and try to hash out some collaborative solution. This has been. Centuries when. A solution.

2:25:54

Okay, If it's in the state's interest for a circular economy to exist, then it is in the state's interest

2:25:59

to ensure that one third of that loop doesn't disintegrate before our eyes. This is not hyperbole.

2:26:05

I have zero post-consumer washed like orders through the rest of the year. Zero. Imagine that that is never happened in the history of me doing business

2:26:12

in this industry. Yet here we are. A lot has been mentioned during this meeting about funding rural collection and how to address that issue.

2:26:19

But what's the point if there's nobody left to process those bottles once collected? Director Wagner, please.

2:26:24

I'm asking you help us. We need to pump funding towards Reclaimers to increase.

2:26:30

It's bad out here. So that being said, I have some questions in regards to the new NDP guidelines.

2:26:36

I'm going to read them off all at once and if you can answer them, that'd be great. So number one is that 40 million allocated for pump

2:26:44

only for the calendar year of 2024 for two years or through 2027.

2:26:50

Question number two are the payment. Amounts. In each tier. Allocated to equal. Quarterly payments or first come first served until they are exhausted?

2:27:00

Number three, underemployment. Tier three. Is this. In reference to HD.

2:27:06

Caps and PPE labels? And if so, do California Petty. Reclaimers get any incentive.

2:27:11

Payment for selling their copied label material to California based HDB and BP processors?

2:27:18

My fourth question was about, you know, why we didn't buy input with thought from stakeholders.

2:27:23

But between Mark Murray and everyone else asking, I think that that point came across.

2:27:29

So I'll leave it at that. Once again, I hope to work together in the near future. I really see an opportunity to do some great things.

2:27:37

Happy holidays to everyone to call, recycle. And thank for hearing me out.

2:27:49

Hypotheses. Amy, thank you very much for your comments.

2:27:54

So the the money is first come serve for the tiered system.

2:28:00

It is not like the current methodology of splitting the pie equally per ton

2:28:06

until the tiers run out, and we are committed to updating participants with the balance of the tier every quarter.

2:28:17

Your second question or your first question was about the time this was to meet with the statute deadline of June.

2:28:26

I believe it's July 1st, 2026. So two years.

2:28:32

Thank you for your comments. I need to check in with staff about your HTP. And that question.

2:28:38

And thank you for your other comments.

2:28:44

Next up, we're going to color 0872, followed by 21010872. Please go ahead.

2:28:52

Hi, Yes, this is Jeanette Hannah commenting on AB 1201 on behalf of BASF,

2:28:57

which has nine facilities and 300 employees in the state of California. Thank you for the opportunity to comment on deprecation.

2:29:05

We agree with the comments from BPI and wish to highlight a few points we made in our written comments.

2:29:10

We note that the survey conducted by Cal Recycle shows that by application is possible based on composter response.

2:29:17

While there are costs involved, funding from SB 50 will go to supporting any additional costs incurred by compost or.

2:29:24

Who choose to accept. And process certified compostable products. We highlight that there is no mandate for any compost or to accept certified

2:29:31

combustible products, nor participate in a bifurcated program. It has been shown that the use of organic waste collection bags,

2:29:38

for example, reduce contamination and increase participation in residential organics diversion programs.

2:29:44

It does not make sense to prohibit a complex company from accepting combustible products if they wish to do so

2:29:50

by directly prohibiting a composability claim. We hope that can recycle, accept the sooner and agree

2:29:56

that bifurcation is possible so that competitors and residents have options

2:30:01

for tools that help divert organics from landfill and achieve California's climate goals. We ask the Cal Recycle, not look backward at existing limitations for composting

2:30:09

certified compostable products. We ask that instead. We all look forward together using any tools that are useful and available

2:30:16

to us for creating robust solutions for a sustainable future in California. Thank you for your time.

2:30:23

Thank you so much for your comments. And lastly, we're gonna have callers 2101

2:30:29

and 6414 and the final caller is 7068. CALLER 20 121, Please go ahead.

2:30:35

Yes, hello. This is Jean Williams and the executive director, California Communities Against Toxics.

2:30:41

And here to testify on each cycle issue. So California has not relied on incineration as a waste.

2:30:49

Management strategy except for at two of its. Facilities. For many decades now.

2:30:56

And the reason is because we have some of the air pollution in the country.

2:31:02

The PM. 2.5 and PM10. Air pollution in California is some of the worst in the world, as well as some of.

2:31:10

The ozone levels and, The. Other other kinds of next problems that we've got national ambient

2:31:17

air quality standards. And so it's going to be. Extraordinarily difficult. Us as a matter of public policy to trade.

2:31:25

Methane emissions. From. Landfills. And try to say that putting particulate matter and NOx

2:31:31

and other ozone precursors into the air is going to be a solution for green waste compost, which should be green waste composting.

2:31:42

I find it just, you know, extraordinary that we're we're in this position largely due to the outdated warm model.

2:31:50

To say that. Combustion of waste is going to be a solution as a matter of public policy to any waste problem in California.

2:31:58

So I want to urge Cal recycle to. Rethink.

2:32:04

What it's doing here. You know that these facilities are going to go into environmental justice communities,

2:32:10

more wealthy, more well-off communities just won't accept them.

2:32:16

They are incinerators. It doesn't matter if you're making it into hydrogen and using the advanced credits in the Inflation Reduction Act,

2:32:25

they're still going to be considered incinerators for the purposes of the federal Clean Air Act,

2:32:30

and they're going to have to comply Section 129. And so, again, I urge Recycle to cal recycle to to.

2:32:38

Rethink this. And to be extremely mindful where these facilities. Are going to be sited.

2:32:44

Thank you so much for the opportunity to speak to this issue today. Thank you so much, Ms..

2:32:49

Williams, for your participation. CALLER 6414.

2:32:54

Please go ahead. Yes, Hello, Everybody hear me? Yep.

2:33:04

Thank you. Thank you. Director Wagner, Everyone there? My name is Tom Helm. I'm the co-founder of Valley Improvement Projects, a social

2:33:11

and environmental justice in the Northern Working Valley, also calling for Cal Recycle to reject age cycles, application

2:33:22

and strongly agreement with the last commenter about combustion as a strategy to deal with our waste and the pollution

2:33:29

in the San Joaquin Valley, where I live. A 19 region for air pollutants.

2:33:35

I agree with with comments made early on in the meeting about the fact that the analysis done is assuming that diesel

2:33:44

trucks would not be used if it not for the hydrogen created here. There's other ways to do that.

2:33:53

I agree also with comments that the original air did not look at this hydrogen technology and a new for the air is needed.

2:34:03

I agree with the comment that there has been a lack of community outreach

2:34:09

around this issue. I know that our organization and other age groups have reached out

2:34:17

about this particular application and have not heard back.

2:34:23

A number of environmental justice groups that we work with have been working on

2:34:29

a very slim, acceptable way to use only green hydrogen

2:34:34

made from truly renewable energy in a very limited use. The age cycle model does not meet that standard.

2:34:43

We don't want biomass combustion, municipal waste, combustion, no increasing

2:34:48

air pollution in disadvantaged communities and no gasification.

2:34:54

We are a community based environmental justice group. I was raised here in South Los County, where we started, the organization,

2:35:02

we've been around for over ten years. We're home to one of the last two trash incinerators in the state of California,

2:35:09

and we've been working very past five years to move our local knowledge away from combustion to deal with waste

2:35:17

and actually implement a zero waste plan that can be a model for the state

2:35:23

because there is having to be reliance on this incinerator. Since the eighties

2:35:30

and we feel that a waste a hydrogen type facility could really incentivize the production of more waste.

2:35:39

That has been a great concern for us that's come with the incinerator. Maybe a reason why the city of Modesto here in South Los

2:35:46

was without curbside recycling for 30 years as. Well, recyclable material

2:35:51

went to be burned at the for profit incinerator that required 800 tons of waste every day to maximize their profit.

2:36:01

Back in the eighties, that technology was also sold as this

2:36:06

new type of pollution to waste here.

2:36:12

And and what we got was less recycling and more pollution in a disadvantaged community that's nearly 80% Latino farmworker

2:36:20

communities, as was planned by this Bourelle report before that incinerator was built, which is if you want

2:36:26

to put these facilities somewhere, you put them in rural areas where English is not the first language spoken, where where education rates

2:36:36

and poverty rates or education rates are low, poverty rates are high.

2:36:41

People that work in ranching, mining and farming, even mentioning Catholic communities basically

2:36:48

these Latino farmworker communities without coming out and saying it. And then a year after that report comes out, they decide to build the incinerator.

2:36:57

And we're worried that is the same legacy of environmental racism. Now that there's already a facility,

2:37:03

there will just be an area to to keep putting the newest facility, the newest thing that's being greenwash and called a new clean technology

2:37:14

back. We do support all the points of many of the community members

2:37:19

that were made earlier about being tired of being poisoned by fossil fuels

2:37:25

in their communities. We we relate to that. But I would just ask who's behind this new technology.

2:37:34

It is it is the oil companies. It's or it's businesses like Chevron that are behind this.

2:37:41

It's their new way of greenwashing themselves that they continue to operate, continue to make money.

2:37:47

And I don't know how you can trust an oil company after the decades long deceit and greed that they've shown.

2:37:57

And but but I do think that those community members have their heart in the right place as as like was said about that.

2:38:04

I just happen to disagree on this point that the solution to our communities

2:38:09

is is hydrogen like was mentioned earlier, where explosions have already happened in disadvantaged communities in the San Joaquin Valley, like in Bakersfield,

2:38:19

where they are experimenting on us with all of these unproven new technologies like hydrogen and and carbon capture and and bio fuels.

2:38:29

We also support labor as well. We like to see an investment in zero waste jobs that can create a large amount of jobs.

2:38:36

But California is choosing to invest in hydrogen and these other false solutions.

2:38:42

This is just coming from government investment so they can choose to invest it somewhere else.

2:38:49

One last point about projects. We are founded the California Environmental Justice Coalition.

2:38:56

We have over 80 small grassroots, community based organizations from all around state.

2:39:03

Dozens of them are in the Bay Area. None that I am aware of. Support this project

2:39:10

and join operations like Arches, which is the state owned hydrogen

2:39:17

industries working together, and none of them have directors or leadership that used to work

2:39:25

for the Department of Energy or for the governor's office in offices.

2:39:31

The cultivator relationships between government and industry like hydrogen.

2:39:38

So feel free to definitely reach out to me. You'd like to speak with environmental justice groups

2:39:45

who have an opinion on this matter. I thank you for your time.

2:39:53

Thank you. Thank you so much for the comment. We have callers 7068 and then followed by a new caller.

2:40:00

95547068. Go ahead.

2:40:05

Hey, this John DAVIES, administer the Mojave Desert Mountain Recycling Authority in San Bernardino County.

2:40:13

And I just want to follow up on the comments, the curbside

2:40:18

co-mingled route, you know, freezing the CRV percentage on glass through 2024

2:40:27

just doesn't seem to it seemed like a good idea. We've been looking forward to

2:40:33

beginning to get some added benefit for recycling glass, which is a huge cost.

2:40:43

Victor Valley Mirror, It's a publicly owned move, so we're well aware of

2:40:48

what it's costing now and the inclusion of wine spirits gave us hope that we'd begin to get

2:40:55

some relief from rate payers. So, you know, we may there

2:41:00

may well be volume over the next year, but to assume that there's going to be a change

2:41:08

in the proportion of wine and spirits closed just doesn't doesn't sit well

2:41:14

you know work out the your your rate studies going forward but please help else

2:41:22

I want to remove separate speed forms we one of the works in California

2:41:28

that does that and I hope that you can find a way to

2:41:34

adjust the curbside payments for those clean bales that that are being sent for for bottled water recycling.

2:41:43

You know who saw that there was incentive payments back in 22.

2:41:48

So it's easy enough to to identify both the process that you used at that time and also the facilities

2:41:57

that have a much higher percentage of the containers in those bills. So

2:42:04

thanks for listening. You know, it's been a long meeting. Thanks.

2:42:11

Thank you very much for your comments. Next is color 9554, followed by 5270 and.
2:42:18

We have a new color joining the line as well. So next up, nine five, five, four. Please go ahead.

2:42:26

Good afternoon is Neil Edgar, an executive director of the California coalition.

2:42:31

Want to weigh in on the AB 1201 bifurcation determination? A number of callers have alluded to the fact that it's possible

2:42:40

to bifurcates the waste stream and collect an organic rating with packaging that's not organic or non-organic program

2:42:49

or national organic program compliant versus non-organic program compliant and.

2:42:54

And that's all well and good that there's some mythical opportunity to create a possible system at some distant future.

2:43:04

But the fact you need to weigh in with a determination on what's occurring, current packaging that's being sold into the state,

2:43:14

the composting infrastructure that is being asked to deal

2:43:20

with this packaging, currently packaging and there it is largely unidentifiable.

2:43:28

It's indistinguishable as whether it's compostable or noncombustible, it's certainly not identified with national organic program

2:43:36

compliant versus non-organic program compliant and feasible. It means that there are significant economic, environmental,

2:43:46

social and technological implications that would have to be overcome,

2:43:53

reasonable, reasonable cost and all the aspects that would have to be

2:44:00

agreed upon and occur in a successful manner in a in a in a reasonable amount of time.

2:44:08

And that just doesn't seem to be the case, given the exorbitant costs that are being absorbed

2:44:15

already for organics collection systems that are managing one way

2:44:21

stream, putting additional drugs on the street, fuel costs, labor costs,

2:44:26

the environmental costs are completely

2:44:32

overwhelming. And to implement an additional collection system to take that on at this point in time.

2:44:41

Busy day. I'm happy to wrap up with those comments and look forward to seeing your determination.

2:44:47

Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Edgar, your additional comments.

2:44:53

Next caller 5270 followed by the final caller 7663.

2:44:58

So call it 570. Go ahead. Good afternoon. My name is Bradley Angell and I am the executive director

2:45:06

of Green Action for Health and Environmental Justice. And our organization. We are based in frontline communities that are impacted by environmental

2:45:16

injustice, environmental racism and health disparities.

2:45:21

And these are communities that call EPA and, you know, through Caligari Screen and other

2:45:27

analytical, you know, the facts are disproportionately impacted by pollution, are targeted

2:45:34

for polluting facility we would never see in rich white communities and h cycles proposal is more of the same.

2:45:43

They are communities of color and working class communities have seen for decades

2:45:48

and as my colleague Tom Helm from Valley Improvement projects in the California Environmental Justice Coalition really pointed out and wonderful comments

2:45:56

that I won't take your time to repeat, but we endorse all of them. The fact is that these technologies which we've been tracking for years

2:46:04

now generally don't work, pollute or disincentives for real solutions and are not safe.

2:46:12

And I want to point out that California EPA and Cal Recycle have environmental justice policies.

2:46:20

They talk a lot about environmental justice. There's even some groups at the meeting today claiming they are environmental justice.

2:46:28

But we need to hear from the communities and follow the,

2:46:33

you know, the call from frontline communities where people are dying, people are sick from pollution and it's continuing.

2:46:40

So if Cal, EPA and Cal Recycle really want to uphold your mandate

2:46:45

and your mission to comply with environmental health and justice, reject age cycles, Application for Health and Justice.

2:46:52

Thank you very much. Thank you for your comments. Mr. Angel.

2:46:58

I'm the final caller. Seven, six, six three. Please go ahead.

2:47:04

Yes, my name is Monica Wilson. I'm calling in from Bayer, the Global Alliance for Incinerator Alternatives.

2:47:09

We're a global network based in California, and I think I've met many of you over the years.

2:47:16

I really want to echo those comments just now. We have seen over and over across California and across the country

2:47:23

that bipoc communities get targeted by incinerators, by gasification, by these types of AI

2:47:31

technologies, which cause pollution which don't prevent the problem, but actually create a new problem.

2:47:38

And the idea that our methane action. Should be built on. Combustion is not a climate solution.

2:47:46

That is that's a scam, frankly. So I you know, we've all submitted comments, but those of us

2:47:52

who are concerned about this idea that methane action and keeping methane

2:47:58

out of the atmosphere should be replaced by burning something have all submitted multiple comments on each cycle over the past years.

2:48:05

I won't repeat all of that, but I just want to sum it up. We can't be destroying natural resources.

2:48:11

To. Address SB 1383. That was never the intent. We need the context.

2:48:16

We need to return nutrients to the soil. We need to prevent food waste in the first place

2:48:21

And building new burners across the state for a nonexistent hydrogen economy,

2:48:29

frankly, is a boondoggle that I think we should be embarrassed that we're even considering right now when there are so many so many better,

2:48:36

safer, healthier, more sustainable options already on the table, already being. Practiced across across.

2:48:42

California. Thank you. Thank you.

2:48:47

And really appreciate you participating.

2:48:52

But is that still the last comment. That's super calls? Yes. Okay. We have a couple more comments back here in the room.

2:49:02

Thank you again, Julia Levin with the Bio Energy Association, California. And I'm now speaking as a former commissioner from the California

2:49:09

Energy Commission because so many commenters, I think, misunderstand the technology that each cycle is using.

2:49:16

If you go to the California Energy Commission website, there is a very clear definition of pyrolysis.

2:49:22

And in that definition, which is consistent with the U.S. Department of Energy's definition and the International Energy Agency,

2:49:29

Pyrolysis is a high temperature thermal chemical reaction that happens in the absence of air or oxygen.

2:49:36

And I want to underscore, in the absence of air or oxygen, you simply cannot have, it is physically impossible to have

2:49:44

combustion also known as incineration in the absence of air or oxygen.

2:49:50

So pyrolysis and combustion or incineration or burning, whatever pejorative term you want to use.

2:49:56

And I agree we shouldn't be combusting waste of any kind. So we all agree to that.

2:50:02

But Pyrolysis is physically incompatible. It is mutually exclusive with incineration or combustion.

2:50:09

And I urge Cal recycle and everyone who is concerned about incineration or combustion of trash to look at the California Energy Commission website.

2:50:18

Even better, look at the U.S. Department of Energy website. There's a very clear explanation of why neither pyrolysis nor

2:50:26

gasification are the same as combustion, but Pyrolysis in particular, because it is defined by happening in the absence of air oxygen.

2:50:35

It's really important that people understand what the technology is before commenting on it. And this a very clear distinction here.

2:50:42

So I just wanted to add that and I urge everyone involved go to the expert technology agencies to see what the definitions of these technologies are.

2:50:50

Pyrolysis is not combustion, period. Thank you,

2:50:58

Evan Edgar. Edgar Associates. On behalf of the California Compost Coalition, we represent most of the organic composters in California, mostly

2:51:05

using clean food, green waste, and certified organic. You heard Kristi Bastoni talk about her 30 years of experience

2:51:11

getting certified by Omri, getting certified by CFA. So we are the organic industry that really care about soil health.

2:51:18

We also represent almost all the independent MURF operators in the state and the independent reef operators create these Murf residuals

2:51:24

and if you follow here, staff report on waste characterization. Over the last three years, the amount of Murphy's eligibles has increased by

2:51:33

about 3 million tons over three years, partly due to the China story and partly due to all the wishful recycling that kind of makes it through the system. So

2:51:43

so we're here today to support that cycle application in order to take these.

2:51:49

Murphy Residuals are basically the recycling of last resort. They have nowhere else to go.

2:51:56

Can recycle is embarking upon a zero waste plan as part of that zero waste plan. You got to look at all materials and Murphy's residuals.

2:52:03

Not only have they gone through one process that would end up in the landfill, otherwise, once a cycle application

2:52:10

takes up material to go through another Murphy's as well, to remove a lot other contamination. So to Murphy process.

2:52:16

So I'm here today representing soil health in order to not have these Murphy residuals go to compost.

2:52:22

The California Compost Coalition does not want Murphy residuals. You cannot compost.

2:52:28

It is bad for soil health. And if you look in the amount of people I represent,

2:52:34

I'm not here representing big oil at all. I'm here representing big soil because big soil is what we need in order

2:52:41

to have natural working lands and have the carbon sink out there. So you heard so many people talk about today about soil health.

2:52:50

The complex coalition believes in that quite well. So on behalf of the California Compost Coalition, we support the age

2:52:55

cycle application. Thank you. Mr. Edgar and Slevin. Thank you for the additional comments.

2:53:02

Thank you all for your very, very thoughtful participation today. All of the thoughtful comments. As per usual, I am really impressed with stakeholders that are involved

2:53:11

in Cal Recycle business and how thoughtful and respectful you participate

2:53:17

with those on the other side of an issue. So thank you so much for being here today.

2:53:22

Thank you for your participation. Thank you for. All of the comments that will very much go into

2:53:29

the consideration of all of these issues as we move forward. And with that, I will wish everyone a very happy, happy

2:53:35

holiday and holiday season. Excuse me, and we will see you in the New year.