

0:11

[Music] You have more time to weigh in on California's Nation leading law to cut single-use plastic and packaging waste.

0:19

Plus local governments partner with California farmers to fight climate change -- how California is connecting farmers with the compost they need.

0:28

And building California zero waste plan for a waste free future. CalRecycle's monthly public meeting starts now.

0:37

Good morning everyone. Thanks for joining CalRecycle's April 2024 public meeting.

0:42

This meeting is for Californians by Californians as we work together to protect our communities and fight climate change.

0:50

Thank you to everyone who submitted feedback on California's Plastic Pollution Prevention and Packaging Producer Responsibility act as we

0:57

enter the final weeks of the formal rule making public comment period. Before we get an update on implementation progress,

1:05

let's take a look at some Earth Month social media messages from the Governor's Office and from California's secretary for Environmental Protection Yana Garcia.

1:15

Let's talk plastic! We're using more of it than ever before and it's polluting our land, water and oceans. For decades industries have relied on cheap

1:25

plastic while falsely promising that it's all still recyclable. Meanwhile we are all buying low quality plastic products at record rates,

1:34

resulting in an unmanageable amount of trash and less than 9% of plastic being recycled.

1:39

We have to act that's why California is getting tough -- requiring producers to slash the amount of plastic they use

1:46

and making sure their products are actually being recycled. We're designing a system that will help California recycle plastic at scale.

1:53

We have the toughest rules in the country on plastic, rules that will create thousands of jobs, while helping keep the environment and our communities clean and healthy

2:04

"Hey folks Yana Garcia here California secretary from Environmental Protection joining you in front of the Cal EPA building right here in Sacramento this year's Earth Day and Earth month are focused

2:15

on Plastics pollution Plastics versus our planet when the first Earth Day came into being in 1970

2:22

it came into being because of a fossil fuel spill and because of far too much hazardous waste that

2:28

was affecting the health and well-being of too many people across our country and across the globe today we know way too much about the harm that Plastics are causing our ecosystems our

2:37

species and our people so that's why Governor Newsom just about a year and a half ago signed

2:43

into law the most ambitious plastic pollution reduction agenda California has ever seen please."

2:50

CalRecycle Communications Director Maria West: Join us this month to learn more about this and other ways that we're driving down the plastics pollution crisis.

2:56

Californians still have time to weigh in on the new rules for this single-use packaging and Plastics industry Division of the Circular

3:04

Economy deputy director Zoe Heller is here with implementation updates. Good morning, Zoe Good morning, Maria and good morning everybody.

3:10

Good to see so many people in the room today. So as many of you know Cal Recycle has extended the deadline for Californians

3:16

and interested parties to submit written comments on the Senate Bill 54 draft regulations you now have until May 8th to send us your feedback the department

3:26

will hold a hybrid public hearing next week on April 23rd from 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.

3:32

You can attend in person in the coastal hearing room at CalEPA headquarters here in Sacramento

3:37

or you can register to participate on Zoom or tune into the live webcast an additional SB54

3:43

Workshop is scheduled for May 1st and that will focus on our updated covered material

3:49

categories timeline and list highlighting changes that were made since the documents were first

3:54

published last December we'll also be providing updates on the needs assessment development

3:59

an overview of the contracted studies process updates on proposed engagement and collaboration and a process for comment submission feedback and data we also plan to

4:11

release two requests for proposals specific to the needs assessment in April one is for our

4:17

source reduction Baseline study and the second is for the required material characterization

4:22

study to estimate covered materials disposed in California landfills we anticipate that

4:28

each will have a six week solicitation period with contract execution in early July requests

4:34

for proposal solicitations or potential bidders can send an email to to be added to the list

4:40

of potential bidders the SB 54 Advisory Board will also meet again this Friday April 19th.

4:47

Be sure to subscribe to our SB 54 list serve for email updates and announcements.

4:53

Switching gears over to SB 1013 we're in the final weeks for public comment period for the dealer cooperative regulations.

5:01

Starting Jan 1 2025 larger beverage retailers and otherwise unserved convenience zones will no

5:08

longer be able to pay \$100 a day fee to not redeem beverage container deposits instead they'll have

5:14

to redeem containers in store or join a nonprofit dealer Cooperative to provide Redemption services

5:21

on their behalf s SB 1013 requires Kel recycle to adopt regulations to Define processors to

5:28

register obl ated retailers and implement the dealer Cooperative system draft regulations

5:35

proposed by Kell recycle were published by the office of administrative law on March 15

5:41

2024 interested parties can continue to submit WR written comments until April 30th or make public

5:47

comments in person or on Zoom during our public hearing scheduled for April 30th and now to talk

5:55

about funding new beverage container recycling reforms also included new funding opportunities

6:00

to boost Recycling and consumer convenience today we're announcing \$3.8 million in Workforce

6:07

Development grants to two applicants funding will help hire and train workers to provide

6:12

convenient Redemption through Technologies like reverse vending machines and bag drop programs

6:18

you can read more about the grant recipients in the notice linked to today's agenda Cal

6:23

recycles is also awarding \$9.5 million to 395 communities is part of the beverage container

6:30

recycling City County payment program funds can be used for things like recycling projects and

6:36

underserved areas neighborhood drop off beverage container recycling programs water refill stations

6:43

CRV recycling bins and more And now switching over to tires, staff proposed leaving criteria unchanged for the tire derived

6:54

aggregate grant program The Five-Year Plan the tire 5-year plan allocate \$750,000 in

7:02

funding for the coming years to support the use of recycled tires in civil engineering projects

7:08

staff anticipates posting the notice of funds in June with applications due in August and Awards

7:13

in a October of 2024 to date the tire derived aggregate program has kept over 45,000 tons or

7:22

4.5 million waste tires out of landfill to turn them into new material for Community projects

7:30

staff proposes a small change to the criteria for the tire incentive program to increase the

7:35

maximum Grant award from \$500,000 to \$650,000 the goal is to boost crumb rubber usage and

7:43

keep more tires out of California landfills while still maintaining adequate funding in the program for grantees the draft 5-year Tire plan allocates 3.2 million for the project in

7:56

the coming years Cal recycle staff anticipate posting the notice of funds available in June

8:02

with applications due in August and Awards in October of 2024 back to you Maria thanks Zoe

8:10

a reminder for everyone the application period for the beverage container recycling Redemption

8:15

innovation and local conservation core Grant programs closed tonight Cal recycle accepts

8:21

applications year round for its greenhouse gas reduction and recycling Market development Zone loan programs moving on to 1983 implementation progress materials management and local assistance

8:33

deputy director Cara Morgan joins us now with some important updates good morning Cara

8:39

MMLA Deputy Director Cara Morgan: Good morning, Maria nice to see everyone today thank you all for being here and for those on the line thanks for being uh out there uh I

8:48

wanted to start with a reminder that our next sp383 chat with Cal recycle is tomorrow from 1:

8:55

to to 3:00 p.m. I hope jurisdictions will be listening I'm really excited about the this one because it's focused on edible food recovery we have some amazing local jurisdiction

9:05

presenters uh they're going to talk about their collaboration with food recovery organizations

9:10

so um please feel free to register online through our website to participate you know

9:16

from my perspective these monthly chats have been extraordinarily successful um they've provided an

9:22

opportunity for jurisdictions and other regulated stakeholders and calary cycle to be able to share

9:28

what's working sometimes what's not working and share um others ideas on how to deal with those

9:33

challenges so it's been uh from my perspective a huge success and I really appreciate the feedback

9:40

that we've had from jurisdictions on other tools and assistance that they find would be helpful in

9:46

really implementing fully the 1383 regulation so please jurisdictions and stakeholders keep that

9:52

feedback coming our way and uh we we uh are happy to deliver on new tools and assistance

9:59

uh next U speaking of new tools and assistance uh we're going to take a look at a new video that we

10:05

have developed that show how jurisdictions are working to meet their 1383 requirements

10:11

by partnering with California Farmers and compost industry folks food paper and yard

10:19

waste recycling is taking off as a vital part of California's climate fight as the state Works to achieve recycling targets that will cut climate pollution equal to taking 3 million cars off the

10:28

road cities and counties are forming beneficial Partnerships with California Farmers I'm a third

10:34

generation farmer we Farm predominantly tomatoes and pomegranates turning food and yard waste into

10:40

valuable new products like compost a super food for soil compost helps soil retain more water

10:46

helps plants to get more nutrients reduces the need for pesticides and pulls more planet heating carbon from the air the difference between where we put the compost and where we don't it is quite

10:56

literally night and day you just see the plants just look healthier compost is something farmers

11:01

want but can't always afford the volume you have to put it at can get expensive the cost

11:06

of compost the cost of hauling and the cost of spreading those three costs combined can make

11:14

the use of compost cost prohibitive that's where Partnerships become key cities and Counties have

11:19

targets to procure products like compost to help Drive Organics recycling in California

11:24

communities are meeting their targets by working with California Farmers to get more compost Entre lands this is called the direct service provider procurement solution we wanted

11:33

to use a procurement requirement for our city and be able to spread out the compost and use

11:39

it within our city but that was a little bit of a challenge because we didn't quite have the

11:44

manpower to be able to do that the direct service provider option gives jurisdictions another way

11:49

to meet their procurement targets through written agreements Farmers anywhere in the state can buy

11:54

compost on behalf of the jurisdiction fulfilling the city or County's procurement requirement in

12:00

turn jurisdictions help reduce the cost of compost partially or entirely making it more affordable

12:05

for Farmers Brokers help put a direct service provider agreement in place and provide the necessary records to the jurisdiction the broker moves the material out does the documenting and

12:16

reporting that can save the jurisdiction a lot of time and money you see the benefits of it but also

12:22

the benefits of being able to help farmers these new Partnerships are helping jurisdictions meet procurement targets just to be able to use direct service provider was definitely a great experience

12:32

all while getting composted Farmers to grow healthier food and protecting Californians with cleaner air better food and a waste-free future so to have a healthy environment healthy air healthy

12:43

water helps keep all of us throughout the state in all of the Cities [Music] healthy Maria thank

12:58

you to your to you and your team for making that little dream of mine happen I really appreciate

13:03

it and I hope all of you who've seen the video will help spread the word about the importance

13:09

of utilizing direct service provider agreements and helping jurisdictions meet their target a lot

13:14

of jurisdictions are utilizing this tool and it's it's really helping it's benefiting jurisdictions

13:20

it's benefiting the compost industry and it's benefiting Farmers both Urban Farmers as well as

13:26

some of our more rural agricultural you know way out there kind of farmers so it's uh it's working

13:32

and so one of the things that I like to focus on with 1383 is while it is a huge challenge we

13:38

are moving the state in the right direction and because of the procurement requirements

13:43

we have more compost that's being utilized and it's it's benefiting all of us helping us grow

13:49

healthier food so thank you so much for taking time to watch that video yes cheers to that and

13:57

it will be posted on our YouTube channel so feel free to get it out there um next um maybe not as

14:04

exciting but just as important cycle is required to review and either approve or disapprove each

14:10

countywide or Regional agency integrated was Waste Management plan five-year review report that's a

14:15

mouthful these reports are comprehensive analyses of planning documents which may be impacted by changes in demographics disposal capacities funding and diversion programs Glenn

14:26

County submitted its 5-year review report and no revisions to the County's planning documents are

14:32

necessary at this time this item has been approved by me and continuing on next I'd like to talk

14:41

about our electronic waste program every year now recycle is required by law to make sure payment

14:47

rates in the covered electronic waste recycling program cover the average net costs of collecting

14:53

and recycling discarded covered electronic devices this year adjustments must be determined by July

15:00

1 2024 the following proposals are based on the 2023 calculated weighted average net costs

15:08

per pound to recover and recycle electronic waste the estimated reasonable rate of profit or return

15:15

on investment as well as additional factors that affect the markets such as increased labor costs

15:21

which continue to rise for our ew recyclers and collectors increasing the Statewide or standard

15:27

Statewide recovery payment rate for collectors from current uh 35 cents per pound to 40 cents

15:35

per pound for all covered electronic waste so that's what we're proposing increase we're also

15:41

proposing increasing the standard Statewide combined recovery and recycling payment rate

15:46

from 98 cents per pound to A113 per pound for cathode ray tube covered electronic waste not

15:54

CRTs for short um increasing we're proposing on increasing the standard Statewide combined

16:01

recovery recycling payment rate from A110 per pound to a115 per pound for non uh cathode ray

16:08

tube covered electronic waste um I'd also like to share that we held a workshop for um stakeholders

16:16

on April 8th uh regarding the proposed rates and we didn't see receive any additional uh comments

16:22

since that Workshop uh staff recommends that the acting director approve the proposed payment rate

16:29

increases and direct staff to make the necessary F filings with the office of administrative law to

16:35

enact the recommended rate increases back to you Maria thank you cara Cal recycle has upgraded our

16:43

public comment andtake system as we've mentioned in past meetings making it easier to submit your comments here's how California wants your input on Recycling and trash pollution issues join Cal

16:55

recycle decision-making process by making a live public com M on any of today's monthly public meeting agenda items in person or by phone microphones are available for those of

17:05

you in the room with in-person comments if you're joining remotely you can call in with your comment just click the public meeting Banner at the top of our website then click the public comments

17:13

button for step byep caller instructions we will address live public comments at the end of the meeting next on the agenda is the care carpet stewardship update and Mindy McIntyre our chief

17:27

Deputy will be up updating actually Zoe heler will take this one actually no just kidding I'm

17:34

sorry all right um California's carpet stewardship Law requires a stewardship

17:41

plan to include a contingency plan that describes how program activities would be carried out by the department through some other entity such as an escro company should the plan expire without

17:52

the approval of a new plan or should the plan be revoked care submitted its revised contingency

17:59

plan Amendment and training guide on February 5th in response to the notice of disapproval signed by
18:04

Kell recycles director on December 5th 20123 Cal recycle reviewed the revised contingency
18:10

plan Amendment and determined it met not some but not all of the requirements needed for approval
18:16

our acting director conditionally approved car's revised contingency plan Amendment on April 4th
18:21

car May revised and resubmit its contingency plan Amendment within 60 days after receiving
18:27

notice of conditional approval those 60 days wrap on June 3rd 2024 the notice of
18:34

conditional approval can be found in the public notice linked to today's agenda back to you Maria now we'll move on to pending Solid Waste entire facilities permits and emergency
18:46

waivers Cal recycle has upgraded our facility permit presentation to show an aerial view of the county and then an aerial view of the specific facility
18:55

addressed here's a quick overview of California facility standards Plus a Statewide facility permit update from environmental program manager Paulina
19:02

Lawrence protecting the health of Californians and their Land Food Water and Air is a big job
19:12

local state and federal agencies play different roles to enforce public health and environmental
19:17

safety standards in California Solid Waste local enforcement agencies process applications issue
19:24

and enforce permits for solid waste facilities these include land fills transfer stations
19:30

compost facilities or similar operations Cal recycle must verify permits are consistent
19:36

with state requirements permits can only address areas within the authority of local enforcement
19:42

agencies and cow recycle check out the link below for more detailed information emergency
19:48

waivers allow temporary changes to Solid Waste permit requirements in response to local or

19:54

state disasters local enforcement agencies May approve the waivers which are good for up to

19:59

120 days and may be extended Cal recycle must review approved waivers and can condition limit

20:07

suspend or terminate them check out the link for more detailed information for Waste Tire

20:13

facilities Cal recycle processes applications issues and enforces waste Tire permits these

20:20

include requirements to make sure tires are stored and processed in a way that reduces

20:25

potential threats from fire and disease carrying vectors like mosquitoes check out the link for

20:31

more detailed information since last month's public meeting the department concurred on

20:39

solid waste facility permit action items for the city of Los Angeles the department agreed with the

20:46

local enforcement agency and concurred on March 26 2024 a modified Solid Waste facilities permit rece

20:54

WS DTLA material recovery facility and transfer station action was needed April 27th 2024 for

21:05

Riverside County the department agreed with the local enforcement agency and concurred on April

21:10

2nd 2024 a modified Solid Waste facilities permit for El sabron landfill action was needed May 21st

21:21

2024 for Los Angeles County the department agreed with the local enforcement agency and

21:28

concurred on on April 2nd 2024 a modified Solid Waste facilities permit for Southern California

21:35

Disposal Company Recycling and transfer station action was needed May 21st [Music]

21:46

2024 okay so you can find more information on any of today's agenda items just go to

21:55

Cal recycle homepage Cal recycle.com and click on the public meeting web Banner at the top of our

22:01

page or if you're not watching it live halfway down the homepage for a link to the agenda and

22:06

Associated Public Notices now it's time for public comments first we'll take comments in

22:12

the public for the public pres present in the room today at our Sacramento Cali paa headquarters and

22:19

after that we'll take comments from those participating by phone as a reminder your microphones on the phone will need to stay muted until you're called on by the last four digits of

22:28

your phone number also on the phone please mute your webcast to avoid potential feedback issues

22:34

while you're speaking so do we have any comments today in the room we have our microphone at the

22:40

front good morning Heaven Edgar Edgar Associates and the California compos Coalition I got here

22:55

early just to hear A1 the rural infrastructure for Z waste plan did I miss that or did you guys

23:01

report upon that no my apologies that was in the director's report and I did skip over it but yes

23:07

that is the RFP is going to be released mid April my apologies yeah the reason it's important I've

23:15

been up here for the last um 10 months asking about the zero waste plan and re important in

23:21

10 weeks from now on July 1st you have a really big report due and I've been mentioning it a lot

23:27

of and almost every month for the last 10 months about in quote unquote right out a statue this say

23:33

part of the Budget Trailer bill that got you to \$2 million for the zero waste plan that no later than

23:39

July 1st 2024 submit a report to the development of a Statewide zero waste plan to the legislature

23:46

which shall evaluate the effectiveness of the Department's existing programs and identify Pro

23:51

programmatic and departmental changes that are needed to improve these programs now July 1 is

23:57

10 weeks away and we're only at 42% as you as a Statewide recycling rate and we got to be at 75%

24:04

there's a big gap here and a big leap and for the last 10 months I've been volunteering information about how to get to how to get to 75% let alone zero waste I presented wood waste reports on how

24:15

to use wood waste every every August I think I go through how how to use wood waste because we lost over 800,000 tons of market share to Agriculture and chipping and grinding is not

24:26

really a market it's a process so had a lot of different plans presented and over the last um

24:31

year there' been a big movement on how to use biomass we have a over Supply and for last five

24:36

years a California compost Coalition sponsored bills try and coordinate between the urban a

24:42

and Forest sectors as you know the all the dead trees in the forest has a lot of biomass and in the egg sector they're phasing out open burning in Sanen Valley for the last five years which means

24:51

more egg biomass and of course from the urban sector we got another 2.5 million tons of wood

24:58

waste that Stills in a landfill it's the number two disposal item after food waste so there's a

25:04

lot there and Industry is trying to do the best we can somehow a lot of people from the Sierra Club

25:09

and California gets waste and think that we can compost the world and this whole this biomass we

25:15

just can't compost all that wood waste you have a CN ratio carbon nitrogen so it's not really an

25:20

option to um take all the trees and compost it or all the a waste a waste is good in a valley for um

25:28

um for bulking agents at the biosol facility so there's some Outlets there but in general

25:34

there's not enough we know Cal Trans hasn't bought much at all for 30 years I've been standing up and

25:39

trying to pass out four different laws to have calr buy mulch and that never worked where s

25:45

sp33 procurement for mulch is a good deal but we don't have enough markets for wood waste I've been asking cycle for a lot of years what is our plan we have a huge gap here and um so the biggest plan

25:56

that we've been promoting is biomass to hydrogen and there's a lot of good Technologies out there

26:01

um it's a community scale you know we're not talking thousand 2,000 tons a day some of the

26:06

facilities are 250 tons a day or 99 tons a day they the community scale facilities some with

26:12

clean food waste some with mer residuals the amount of murf residuals gone up 3 million tons

26:18

over the last 5 years because of the China because of Market specs as it should be you know we got to

26:23

make cleaner projects to export that's why not exporting is important and keep and everything

26:28

local in California for the circular economy we've been talking about is we shouldn't have to export stuff or import stuff we have all this biomass here to make energy and low carbon fuel

26:39

so it's a big gap analysis so I've been asking for workshops for the last couple months because it is a big lift um July 1st 2024 is 10 weeks away so I also looked at the selection of your consultant is

26:51

a censure two \$2 million \$1.9 million contract and as they look in their contract there's no deliver

26:58

for this no budget for this so I read the contract and July 1 2024 is coming up and I don't think it

27:04

sent your your Consultants going to do anything for this report so the question is who's doing

27:10

this report where's the stake on input there's a lot of data out there um I submitted a 75%

27:17

plan two and a half years ago with the greenhouse gas benefits that show that by 2030 the industry

27:22

would be Net Zero 10 times and right in 2018 we're 3.8 times Net Zero greenhouse gases we have a lot

27:28

of data I share we put it out there but I haven't heard anything about the zero waste plan I'm happy

27:34

the rurals are going to get their um zero zero waste plan I do a lot of work in the rurals and and it's a lot of good carbon farming out there and um so that's exciting and how does the rural

27:44

infrastructure by zero waste plan integrate with a centure plan so there's a lot of good questions

27:49

and hope to find out more about it I hope you guys have stakeholder hearings and I'm looking

27:54

forward to the deliverable on July 1st so can you please tell me is there as a stakeholder process to identify the gaps and what is needed to improve these programs to get to 75% thank

28:08

you thank you very much Mr Eder I can tell you that the information that you've

28:14

provided us will feed into this initial analysis the initial analysis as you're saying is quite a big lift and I assure you are we're working with our contractor to to

28:23

create that plan now and the plan itself in July 1 will include a stakeholder Outreach component that will feed into the January 2026 um plan as well so more to come

28:35

and I know we are meeting with you tomorrow so we'll be happy to chat in more detail
thank you hi Team U Mark Murray with the Environmental Group California's against
waste couple items uh

28:49

the first item to me is kind of exciting um sometime this month maybe even this week
the

28:55

500 billionth beverage container is going to get recycled in the state of California um
so

29:02

500 billion beverage containers from 1988 till sometime in April um want to obviously
consumers

29:12

deserve the bulk of the credit for that but I I also want to thank and express our
appreciation to the staff of the division of recycling um the leadership of the division of
recycling

29:21

everyone from Ralph Chandler 100 years ago to Amy Cameron today um this is a
compli

29:28

ated program there's lots of moving Parts there's lots of data and reports that need to
be generated

29:36

and um because this is State money public money um we recognize and appreciate
that this this

29:45

division um has to rely on accuracy and so we we support that and appreciate that um
now we know

29:54

that it's the 500 billionth container because we've been tracking in the containers and
the dollars and the scrap values since 1988 um and so my second item um is that on
behalf

30:07

of about 40 stakeholders public um and private recycling service providers um we are
asking

30:15

the dep Department the division of recycling to take a look at the comingled rate um to
utilize

30:21

the surveys that you are in the field with right now to update that comingled rate so that
we can

30:28

ensure that we we have the most accurate uh comingled rate and payments that are
feasible and

30:38

um you know you've you do these surveys year round um we've seen the numbers from 2024 the numbers

30:47

from 2020 and you've been tracking CRV what is now CRV wine and distilled Spirits since before 2024

30:56

and we see in your St sees how those numbers are moving I think it's it's kind of clear where that

31:03

number is going to be and the number that you're finding right now in your surveys is a hell of a

31:08

lot closer to accurate than the 35% rate that's in place right now um now I know that there's a

31:17

lot of stakeholders here that are concerned about the payments that result from this comingled rate and and I care about the payments but I also care about the accuracy of the recycling rate and based

31:27

on the survey surveys that you've been doing so far this year we know that about 72 million

31:33

new CRV wine and distilled Spirits containers are being collected by curbside recycling programs in

31:39

California but because of the old 35% comingled rate none of those containers are counting are

31:46

going to count towards our CRV recycling rate so I'm I'm concerned because if you don't update that

31:53

comingled rate when you unveil the recycling rate the 2024 recycling rate for the first 6 months of

32:01

of 2024 it's going to appear that the CRV the glass CRV recycling rate is plummeting so it's

32:10

not just about payments it's about an accurate recycling rate and it's about communicating to the legislature that they did a good thing when they expanded the program to include wine and distilled

32:20

Spirits now I think there's some confusion regarding the hard work that your division

32:27

of recycling staff uses and the protocols you have in place to ensure that we don't pay CRV on trash

32:35

that comes out of curbside recycling programs 10 years ago the division implemented a very detailed

32:42

uh program that requires third-party verification beneficiating processors must verify the amount of

32:49

glass that is actually received in the from the curbside recycling program your dr6 form has two

32:56

places one for the amount of material that was sent by the curbside recycling provider but then

33:03

how much was actually in that and beneficiating processors are are doing that analysis every

33:09

single day um so curbside programs aren't getting paid on all of the material labeled as glass that

33:16

leaves their curbside programs they're getting paid based on what the beneficiating processor

33:22

confirms is glass that meets ASM standards for manufacturing no other beverage container

33:30

material has to go through that verification process um I think it might be useful at a a

33:36

subsequent meeting since the legislature seems confused um about this issue it might be useful

33:41

to kind of have a presentation on how that system works so again thank you for your

33:46

attention um we provided the acting director with a copy of the letter from stakeholders urging a reassessment of the comingled rate and look forward to a response on that thanks thank

33:59

you hi good morning Veronica Paro resource recovery Coalition of California and just in

34:09

followup to Mark Murray's comments uh very well articulated the problem that we see but we're

34:15

one of the signers of this Coalition letter and it was requested by the department to

34:20

submit a letter um detailing our requests and concerns so we do hope you'll review that and

34:28

um get back to us with the agency's response and appreciate you your consideration
thank

34:34

you thank you good morning uh Lissa sesus here representing the California Waste
haulers Council

34:43

uh we also are one of the co-signers on the uh letter that Mr Murray referenced um I
want to uh

34:51

express our gratitude for the conversations that we've initially had on this issue um

34:57

as we articulated in our meetings and in the letter this is of critical importance for our
35:03

Haller members uh I hope that uh we can continue our conversations uh to figure out
uh a way to

35:11

adjust this rate prior to 2025 and um we would gladly participate in any conversations
with

35:18

regards to the quality of the glass uh that Mr Murray outlined so thank you very much
thank you

35:29

morning Michael Caprio with Republic Services uh we also signed on to the letter that
Mr Murray

35:34

uh mentioned and we're not going to repeat uh all the comments that he made but
briefly we believe that it's important that the CRV paid by our customers is used to
offset the cost

35:44

of the recycling programs that they utilize uh we believe the data is available at this
35:49

point in the year to perform an accurate assessment of the revised comingo rate
and recycling rates for glass and newly added container categories I would simply
request

35:59

uh as others did uh that coward cyle undertake a review of this information so that the
cingo

36:04

rates can be as accurate as possible as we move forward and not wait until January
2025 thank

36:10

you thank you as well and we did receive the letter this

36:17

morning and we're taking a look and we'll be responding shortly

36:28

good morning Jeff donlevy from Mings resources Eastbay and Mings recycling here in Sacramento

36:34

always a tough group to follow there um 500 billion that's pretty impressive I mean we're

36:40

we're we're definitely getting there um the 1247 recycling centers they've done a lot of that work

36:47

which is great unfortunately we've lost a lot of recycling centers uh right now and I mentioned

36:53

at the last meeting we have 6,159 Redemption locations in the state of California but we

36:59

really only promote the 1247 recycling centers that are open um Cal recycle that was awarded

37:07

a million dollar authorization I guess in the budget to promote all the Redemption locations

37:13

including the inore uh Redemption locations that are willing to take back unlimited numbers of uh

37:20

CRV containers so hopefully we can get that app rolled out soon uh hopefully next meeting there

37:26

can be an update on that where consumers can just type in their zip code and see all the Redemption locations in their area including recycling centers and and the inore Redemption

37:38

locations especially as we transition into 1013 where inore Redemption will be required with uh

37:47

that 500 billion this is such a huge number um we're looking at the circular economy the lower

37:53

recycling rate that we have here in the state the low hanging fruit on all of our programs where the

37:59

infrastructures in place right now are the the 7 billion containers that we're losing every year

38:05

from the program you know that equates to about 90 million pounds of aluminum cans 120 million pounds

38:14

of pet bottles and over 600 million pounds of glass I think I got that number right um there's

38:22

infrastructure in California the California uh plastic reclaimers they want that clean material coming through the recycling centers um Gallow Halo strategic potential the glass

38:35

uh reclaimers they want that clean material coming through so the lwh hanging fruit with the circular

38:40

economy to help promote California businesses uh is coming from the redemption centers the problem

38:49

is we just need more redemption centers that are out there um today we have the the \$40 million

38:56

and the recycling innov Innovation grants that are available in the past you know I had asked

39:02

that uh staff postpone that because the original AB 179 said that the fund should be made available

39:11

for the opening of new redemption centers and the development of new grocery co-ops unfortunately

39:17

this round is only eligible for backdrop programs rvms and mobile programs uh but we really need

39:24

more redemption centers and we need the co-ops to get going to bring that new technology out there

39:31

with this round um one of my biggest concerns with the Badd drop and the mobile programs is

39:38

both of those programs are not really defined or have regulations regarding the operating standards

39:44

so staff is saying that backdrop programs are recycling centers but they're really not mobile

39:52

programs as long as I've been in the the industry I still can't tell you what a mobile program program is or what the requirements are uh the San Diego program is in statute but that that stopped

40:06

20 years ago for numerous reasons so hopefully we can get those defined uh but more importantly with

40:14

s113 uh staff was given the task of defining what is comparable and sufficient
Redemption services

40:23

in the new program the zones have quadrupled in size so what is comparable and what
is sufficient

40:32

to the old standard that's what we really need to Define so with backdrop programs I
can see they're

40:39

an extension of a recycling center which is great but if a backdrop program is in a Zone
does that

40:48

mean the zone is served I hope not because we know a recycling center can handle
1.5 million

40:56

containers a month backdrop programs rvms and mobile programs a fraction of that um
in the

41:06

draft regulations for the co-ops that are coming out uh well done by staff on clearly
articulating

41:14

that the Redemption locations operated by the grocery co-ops do not serve a Zone they
serve

41:22

the dealer that's a fantastic clarification so hopefully in the very near future there will
be

41:28

some clarity on how many backdrop locations or how many rvms well excuse me I got
to back up on rvms

41:37

rvms are defined as recycling centers but backdrop locations or Mobile locations serve
a Zone because

41:45

we have to make sure that it's comparable and sufficient to the old standard um
recently I did

41:53

a public records request for the pilot programs um the data is pretty interesting to look
at but it's

41:59

clear there's a few pilot programs that appear to be pretty successful and could be
sustainable

42:06

and those are the ones that are in the permanent locations open the most days and the
most hours

42:12

during the week they've served the most customers up to 100 customers a day and they've collected

42:17

the most containers but it was also clear that those programs that are called mobile programs

42:24

that are open for 4 hours a day two or three days a week have served the fewest customers

42:32

20 to 30 customers a day there were some days that they they saw nine or 10 customers that it really

42:40

indicates that they did not work so it goes back to we need permanent stationary locations where

42:46

consumers can access them five six seven days a week like a recycling center or a backdrop

42:53

location or a reverse vending machine um the reverse machines that are starting to show up um

43:00

we're seeing that the popularity is there because the convenience is there they're there at 6:00 in

43:06

the morning when the store opens and they're there 9 10 11:00 at night when the store is there so

43:13

they're providing the convenience that we'd like to see so with the next round of funds to come out

43:19

hopefully in the next few months um we're going to have hopefully see the opportunity for new

43:24

recycling centers uh hope hopefully funding for grocer co-ops to get those going um sometime soon

43:33

I'd like to see the department come out with a definition of comparable and sufficient so we know

43:39

what needs to be provided because again the zones are four times as big as they were before and then

43:45

get uh draft regulations for backdrop programs and mobile programs so thank you thank you

43:58

any more comments in the room today okay seeing none we'll move to the phone uh
Lance

44:06

it looks like we have several calls today yeah we have four callers in the queue um

44:12

I'm going to start by asking caller with the last four digit 6607 to unmute their

44:17

microphone um from there you can State your affiliation and proceed with your
comment go

44:22

ahead uh thank you um this is Leonard Lang and I assist recyclers and processors
throughout the

44:32

state and have done so for years and uh I have some comments but first I'd like to say
it's

44:38

always a pleasure to get an education from Evan Edgar and Evan your hat is more
appropriate over

44:44

here in Fort Worth uh secondly uh Mr Murray talked about the uh comingled rates and
it's always

44:55

interesting to see Mr Murray disagreeing with the Department on their uh their
determinations

45:01

it's actually refreshing uh I might refer him and everybody else is concerned about
those statistics

45:07

to the audit of 2010 where the uh statistical analysis or product of the department was
clearly

45:16

delineated uh in regards to uh Mr dunlevy there is a definition of mobile recycling on
one of

45:26

the web pages however that doesn't satisfy the administrative procedures act so he is
correct

45:34

that it's not adopted uh my concern today is that I have trying to assist some recyclers

45:42

who've asked me for assistance in regards to the uh the grants and uh so I submitted a
question

45:50

just to identify all the proper documents that were required and my response from

45:57

the department was that it was too late to ask that I needed to ask that in the question
and

46:02

answer uh process uh a month ago or so I'm just asking for the documents I think it's

46:09

appropriate to be able to know that uh also in a review of those documents that I found
I

46:15

would say that most of them are implementing uh terms that are undefined uh we have
uh a

46:26

processes that are uh delineated and uh a number of issues that should be
required

46:35

by the uh APA so as I asked last month would this would these uh documents be
adopted and

46:42

I was told no uh I will submit a petition to O and to the department for determination to

46:49

determine whether they should be adopted as I believe and I thank you for the
opportunity

46:58

thank you Lance is there another caller um yes caller number 3162 last four digits 3162
I'll go ahead

47:13

and ask you to unmute and you can um State your affiliation in your comment we'll give
them a

47:19

few seconds and then move on to the next um go ahead hi this is Valerie Lake I'm with
one Earth

47:26

recycling in San Diego and I wanted to ask about the Innovation grants that are due
today if there

47:33

would be afterwards a listing posted anywhere of the applications that were received
for this Grant

47:40

and and if not if there would at least be like a a list of accounts of numbers of
applicants

47:46

received by type of application like was it just a dealer or was it a recycler it would

47:52

just be helpful for our planning Valerie thank you for that question and um you know our
general

47:59

practice with um with grants is that we will be reviewing all the applicants that that have
come

48:05

in we will be determining eligibility of um the various applicants that have come in and then we

48:11

will do our review and once we've completed our review and we have a suggestion or staff have a

48:17

suggestion for awarding they will um submit that through a request for approval which will for um

48:24

generally for our grant programs we identify the number of eligible applicants that have come in

48:30

and having um some description of the projects that we've ultimately awarded so that is our

48:36

our general practice um we'd be happy to follow up with you if there are other specifics that you'll be looking for um but this is as you know a new grant program so similar to to you all we're um

48:48

very excited to see the variety of projects that have come in and to understand the distribution

48:53

of how those funds will be disseminated once we um once we know where the interest lies thank you uh next up will be caller number uh with the last four digits 0392 I'll go ahead

49:10

and ask you to unmute right now and you can go ahead and state your affiliation and proceed with your comment hello thank you this is Susan Collins from the container recycling Institute

49:21

and I have questions in three different areas um so I'll start with the shortest one which

49:28

is a followup from the questions I asked at the last couple of public meetings about um

49:34

Cal recycles budget in the way that it was misstated in the governor's budget um has

49:40

Cal recycles budget now been fully reconciled will the May Revis Governor's budget contain

49:46

the correct fund balance as opposed to the fund balance that was previously listed in the January Governor's budget which was \$300 million too low so I'll stop

49:56

there thank you Susan um yes the go the the program has been reconciled and we anticipate

50:06

an update in the May revise fantastic thank you so much um the second question also relates to

50:14

the budget I'm confused about the number of Staff requested and granted in order to implement SB

50:20

1013 and ab 179 it was my understanding that Cal recycle asked for and received received

50:27

authorization for 59 employees last year which was a combination of permanent and

50:32
temporary positions that that was asked for and received in the budget change proposal a

50:37

year ago yet um this year there was another request for six employees and there was no

50:45

mention in that request of the 59 employees that had already been um requested and granted so I'm

50:53

wondering since the passage of s SP 1013 and a AB 179 how many new staff positions

51:00

have been granted to Cal recycle and the second question is how many of these positions have been

51:06

filled thank you again for the question and as you know we discussed the BCP um just recently with

51:15

the legislature through the the two committees and apologies since I don't have those here I don't have the details to give you but I I will let you know that the grant programs that were passed

51:25

both under AB 179 and 10133 just about doubled the work in our grant unit and there are many

51:32

aspects of 1013 and we're hiring in all of those positions um but certainly for our grants program

51:37

standing up these new programs uh bringing in new stakeholders for these Grant programs is much more

51:44

workload than we originally anticipated we did of course look at our existing staff and reallocated

51:49

as we could but there was an additional need for for Grant Management staff and again we can

51:56

get you more details on specific numbers if you'd like to submit that question I I will thank you

52:03

so much um so my third um comment is regarding the discussion at today's meeting about wine

52:11

and spirits containers and curbside programs and I just want to give some guidance based on our

52:17

history of researching these programs around the world um the first year of implementation of the

52:23

expansion of the program is a very dynamic situation the proportion of wine and spirits

52:30

containers in curbside versus redemption centers will be changing as the year goes on for example

52:37

when Hawaii started their container deposit program in 2005 residents redeemed about 20%

52:44

of the containers in the first few months of the year and by the end of the year as people became

52:50

more familiar with the program the Redemption rate Rose to 60% so that was for a brand new

52:56

program so it's a moving Target um and I also as I have at previous meetings I also

53:02

encourage Cal recycle to develop a campaign to educate the public that these

53:08

containers can be redeemed now for money that they can actually take them back and get money rather than just putting in them in their curbside program I also want to comment on the idea

53:18

that um that the curbside programs are being financially harmed at this time um they're um

53:27

the programs are currently not being financially harmed by this change that's a mischaracterization

53:34

of the situation these new payments that the curbside programs would receive would be an

53:40

addition to their existing funding for their existing work these payments are a bonus and

53:47

with that I thank you very much for um receiving my questions and for giving me the answers that you did thank you thank you we have uh one final caller with the last four digits 7717 we'll go

54:01

ahead and ask you to unmute and then uh State your affiliation and go ahead with your comment

54:07

hey uh this is John Davis I administer the Mojave Desert Mountain Recycling Authority

54:13

um in san bernardino county um one of our projects is the Victor Valley materials recovery facility

54:20

which is publicly owned privately operated so we we absolutely have an interest in

54:26

uh the glass CRV formula um as Susan pointed out we are receiving uh and recovering glass but we're

54:38

not receiving the full value when we supported SP 1013 um we had two uh expectations one is that

54:48

there would be increase value for the glass that's being recovered um and secondly that we would

54:56

be receiving less glass over time um if Susan's uh projections are correct we will be receiving less

55:05

glass uh however we are processing and paying on a monthly basis more than in some months more than

55:16

we pay for residue disposal for landfill um it's a it's a big Financial impact on the rate payers

55:25

and as you know with SP sp54 um there's Focus finally on the impact on rate payers um it's

55:33

a direct impact for us to not be receiving the value that's attached to that class so um with all

55:42

respect ask that you um adjust the formula reflect what's going on now you'll be readjusting it over

55:49

time as as circumstances change but to be paying us at a 30% rate when we're recovering the the

55:57

CRV value at 85% is is really an injustice and and an injustice to the right payers so please thank

56:06

you thank you for that comment so that's it Lance no more no more comments okay so we oh Mr Edgar

56:27

Evan Edgar on behalf of um compost Coalition and clean fleets Coalition um we've been implementing

56:33

1383 for a long time now and what we' seeing in the field the rates are going up about to get to

56:39

75% and some of the not 75% but get to that goal has been about 20% on residential and about 30%

56:47

on Commercial and that's been some of at a rate shock in more areas and we're getting it done

56:52

what's missing from the equation is a future um I've been working over at Carbon Advanced Clean Fleet and they want to Electrify um the garbage Fleet um as ZEM Mission Vehicles

57:05

what we're seeing on electrification is going to be even a bigger rate shock and that's something

57:11

I like to see as part of the zero waste plan the Zer waste plan is supposed to be a holistic plan of all cost in the future you picked a really good um contractor centure Arthur Anderson people they

57:22

know accounting so they know how to do rates so as part of the scope of work that is not part of

57:28

the um I didn't see that in a contract but start cost modeling what it takes to uh implement the

57:36

Advanced Clean Fleet rule because 75% of the cost for any company is is collection other 25% is post

57:43

collection that's a rule of thumb so we have 75% of the cost on collection and the capital x

57:50

for some of these um fleets that are battery electric is half the payload twice the cost

57:56

tastes cheap less filling but it's very expensive with regards to do so it's not that cheap we're going to see a rate shock of 100 to 200% because of fact that um we have to have

58:05

twice as many trucks at twice a rate on capital x that's a huge lift and we'll be importing these

58:13

batteries on a non-circular economy by digging up um the Congo and Canada and South America to

58:20

import and that's not a circle economy instead as part of the Advanced Clean Fleet rule there's

58:25

two two types of zero emission Vehicles you got battery electric and you got fuel cell technology

58:31

with hydrogen now if you go the hydrogen route which is zero emission vehicle we have all the biomass here we don't have to export our waste paper or export materials and import Rare Earth

58:44

minerals and batteries those blood batteries their hands are dirty it doesn't look good

58:50

instead we should be focused on the circular economy which I here you guys got a division

58:56

now and we can have all our low carbon fuel made right here in California with biomass to

59:02

hydrogen that's zero emissions it's going to be cost effective but we don't know everybody

59:08

is talking about it so as part of the one of the things I'm going to work hard on with your with your staff at Cal EPA supposed to be coordinating among the silos and I've been trying to get that

59:17

message over at carb for a while about Advanced Clean Fleet roll and the and the expense of it is going to we don't have the payload to do that so the the R spikes are going to be a lot and I think

59:28

that the public is barely handling the 30 to know 20 30% rate increase for 1383 on top of that 100

59:35

200% for battery electric is is just going to ruin the programs they can't get zero waste if

59:41

we're putting money into um you know um Cobalt batteries from from the Congo that doesn't cut

59:48

it so as part of the scope of work for the centure let's model The Collection Fleet and what it takes

59:56

to transition into zero emission vehicles with zero waste thank you thanks again okay if there

1:00:06

are no more comments we want to thank everyone who participated in today's meeting you can find the

1:00:12

videos from today's meeting uh and the April 2024 monthly public meeting recordings that

1:00:17

you saw in today's meeting on calary cycles's YouTube page and we will post them as quickly as possible well thanks again have a wonderful month and we will see you next month bye-bye