



August 2, 2021

To: Bob Peoples, Executive Director CARE  
Rachel Machi Wagner, Director CalRecycle

From: California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee (members listed below)

**Re: Advisory Committee Recommendations related to the Draft CARE California Carpet Stewardship Program 2020 Annual Report**

As required by the Product Stewardship for Carpets Law (Public Resources Code Section 42970 - 42983), the California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee ("Advisory Committee") has received a copy of the "Advisory Committee Review Draft dated July 13, 2020 titled *CARE California Carpet Stewardship Program 2020 Annual Report* ("Draft CARE California Carpet Stewardship Program 2020 Annual Report") required pursuant to Section 42979 from Carpet America Recovery Effort ("CARE"), the carpet stewardship organization. The Advisory Committee received the Draft Annual Report 30 days before submittal to CalRecycle as required in Section 42972.1 (b).

Included in this letter are recommendations to CARE by the Advisory Committee based on the review of the *Draft CARE California Carpet Stewardship Program 2020 Annual Report* during a Zoom Video Conference on July 22, 2021. As required in Section 42971.1 (c), to the extent feasible the Advisory Committee's recommendations are to be incorporated into the Annual Report by CARE before being submitted to CalRecycle.

If CARE is unable to incorporate these recommendations, a written explanation must be provided to the California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee and CalRecycle. The explanation should detail whether CARE plans to incorporate recommendations into a subsequent Annual Report.

### **California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Members**

The Product Stewardship for Carpets Law (Public Resources Code Section 42970 - 42983), requires CalRecycle to appoint an Advisory Committee to provide recommendations to a carpet manufacturer or stewardship organization and to the department on carpet stewardship plans, plan amendments, and annual reports. An additional appointee to the Advisory Committee is also made by both the Senate Committee on Rules and the Speaker of the Assembly.

The Director of CalRecycle appointed the members to the California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee according to the general stakeholder categories recommended in the statute. The committee member representing the Senate Committee on Rules has also been appointed. The committee member position appointed by the Speaker of the Assembly is currently vacant.

**California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Members**

<b>Committee Member</b>	<b>Organization</b>	<b>Representing</b>
<b>DOUGLAS WILLIAMS</b>	<b>Los Angeles Fiber Co./ Reliance Carpet Cushion</b>	<b>Collection and sorting, processing and manufacturing</b>
<b>ERIC NELSON</b>	<b>Circonomey Innovations</b>	<b>Independent Industry Expert</b>
<b>FRANCO ROSSI</b>	<b>Aquafil USA</b>	<b>Processing &amp; recycling of carpet, Manufacturing</b>
<b>GAIL BRICE</b>	<b>XT Green, Inc.</b>	<b>Processing &amp; recycling of carpet</b>
<b>HOWARD SAPPER</b>	<b>Carpet Manufacturers Warehouse</b>	<b>Carpet Retailers</b>
<b>JEN JACKSON</b>	<b>San Francisco Department of the Environment</b>	<b>Local Government</b>
<b>JOANNE BRASCH, Ph.D</b>	<b>CA Product Stewardship Council</b>	<b>Environmental Community</b>
<b>JOE YARBROUGH</b>	<b>The Carpet &amp; Rug Institute</b>	<b>Carpet Mills</b>
<b>NAT ISAAC</b>	<b>City of Los Angeles Environment and Sanitation</b>	<b>Local Government</b>
<b>RACHEL PALOPOLI</b>	<b>Aquafil USA</b>	<b>Carpet Collections/Sorting</b>
<b>STEVE BELONG</b>	<b>Carpet, Linoleum, &amp; Soft Tile Workers Local Union No. 12, District Council 16</b>	<b>Northern CA Floor Covering Finishing Trades Institute Joint Apprenticeship Training Committee</b>
<b>STEVE LANDRETH</b>	<b>ProSpectra Flooring</b>	<b>Senate Committee on Rules</b>
<b>SUNA BAYRAKAL</b>	<b>Product Stewardship Institute</b>	<b>Environmental Community</b>
<b>WES NELSON</b>	<b>GreenWaste Carpet Recycling</b>	<b>Carpet Collections/Sorting</b>
<b>VACANT</b>		<b>Speaker of the Assembly</b>

## **Advisory Committee Plan Review Meeting and Recommendations**

The California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee met through a Zoom Video Conference on July 22, 2021 to discuss the *Draft CARE California Carpet Stewardship 2020 Annual Report*. All the current members of the committee attended with the exception that Joe Yarbrough and Steve Landreth were not able to attend. Rachel Palopoli had to leave during the meeting. A quorum was met. Members of the public also attended the meeting through the Zoom Video Conference. The meeting was conducted in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act with COVID-19 modifications per Executive Orders N-25-20 and N-29-20 signed by Governor Newsom on March 12, 2020 and March 17, 2020, respectively.

The Committee recommendations from the July 22, 2021 meeting regarding the *Draft California Carpet Stewardship 2020 Annual Report* are provided as Attachment 1, listed in priority order. The committee looks forward to continuing to work with CARE and CalRecycle regarding the California Carpet Stewardship Program.

**Respectfully,**

*Joanne Brasch*

*8/2/21*

---

**Joanne Brasch, Ph. D**  
Advisory Committee Acting Chair

---

Date

## Attachment 1

### California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Recommendations for the Draft CARE 2020 Annual Report

#### COLLECTIONS

##### Motion 1.0

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE add an explanation as to why the pandemic led to fewer public drop off sites recruited in 2020.

Motion to Approve: Nat Isaac      Second: Jen Jackson

Ayes (9): Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal,

Nays (3): Doug Williams, Howard Sapper, Wes Nelson

Abstain (0):

Absent (2): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth

**The motion passes**

##### Motion 2.0

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE explain what is done to verify the on-going participation of collection sites. Please include the frequency of the verification and how it is conducted.

Motion to Approve: Jen Jackson      Second: Nat Isaac

Ayes (12): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal, Wes Nelson

Nays (0):

Abstain (0):

Absent (2): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth

**The motion passes**

### **Motion 3.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE expand on what objections CARE heard from potential collection sites, such as supply-houses, as to why they don't want to participate as a collection site; and that information be provided to all local collectors and the Advisory Committee to address those limitations in that geographic region.

Motion to Approve: Wes Nelson Second: Gail Brice

Ayes (12): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal, Wes Nelson

Nays (0):

Abstain (0):

Absent (2): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth

**The motion passes**

## **REGIONAL OUTREACH**

### **Motion 4.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE expand on why some of the regional areas showed less collections when compared to other regions.

Motion to Approve: Nat Isaac Second: Joanne Brasch

Ayes (7): Eric Nelson, Gail Brice, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal,

Nays (3): Doug Williams, Howard Sapper, Wes Nelson

Abstain (2): Franco Rossi, Rachel Palopoli

Absent (2): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth

**The motion passes**

## **DIY EDUCATIONAL OUTREACH**

### **Motion 5.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE describe outreach efforts in more detail on working with big box stores to educate their customers on carpet recycled content and recycling opportunities.

Motion to Approve: Wes Nelson                      Second: Steve Belong

Ayes (9): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal, Wes Nelson

Nays (0):

Abstain (2): Franco Rossi, Nat Isaac

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion passes**

## **FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY**

### **Motion 6.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE please clarify how carpet sales are monitored, if any are audited, and how they are verified to be part of the decline of sales in California.

Motion to Approve: Franco Rossi                      Second: Steve Belong

Ayes (10): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal, Wes Nelson

Nays (1): Howard Sapper

Abstain (0):

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion passes**

### **Motion 7.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE make the statistics concerning the nationwide sales of carpet available to the Advisory Committee so they can be compared to sales in California.

Motion to Approve: Franco Rossi                      Second: Steve Belong

Ayes (8): Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal,

Nays (3): Doug Williams, Howard Sapper, Wes Nelson

Abstain (0):

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion passes**

**Motion 8.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE should consider the negative impacts to the program if they don't reconsider or limit the funding to expand processing capacity outside of California. The report should project the metrics of funding given the current rate of processor expansion.

Motion to Approve: Franco Rossi      Second: Eric Nelson

Ayes (5): Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong

Nays (2): Gail Brice, Howard Sapper

Abstain (4): Doug Williams, Jen Jackson, Wes Nelson, Suna Bayrakal

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion does not pass**

**CARE PARTICIPATION IN ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETINGS**

**Motion 9.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE be available during the meetings to participate and engage with the Committee.

Motion to Approve: Gail Brice      Second: Franco Rossi

Ayes (11): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal, Wes Nelson

Nays (0):

Abstain (0):

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion passes**

## **DISCARDS WEIGHT/FORMULA**

### **Motion 10.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE describe the carpet weight survey (on page 28, number 8) which implies that the carpet weight has changed. Provide more of an explanation as to why and how that weight changed.

Motion to Approve: Eric Nelson                      Second: Gail Brice

Ayes (10): Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal, Wes Nelson

Nays (1): Doug Williams

Abstain (0):

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion passes**

### **Motion 11.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that as the 21% recycling rate is based on recycled output divided by discards and as CARE acknowledges on page 97 that there is a current dispute regarding the discards formula, therefore any claim of a recycling rate of 21% in the Annual Report should have an asterisk and disclaimer.

Motion to Approve: Gail Brice                      Second: Franco Rossi

Ayes (8): Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal,

Nays (1): Doug Williams

Abstain (2): Howard Sapper, Wes Nelson

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion passes**

## **PROCESSING CAPACITY**

### **Motion 12.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE should direct more processor subsidies to processors in California, as the plan allows them to do, once there is enough processor capacity in California to meet the legislated goals.

Motion to Approve: Howard Sapper      Second: Gail Brice,

Ayes (3): Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch

Nays (6): Eric Nelson, Jen Jackson, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal, Wes Nelson

Abstain (2): Doug Williams, Franco Rossi

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion does not pass**

### **General Suggestions/Edits/Comments**

The Advisory Committee recommends that the following suggestions, edits and comments be considered by CARE:

1. Compliments to CARE on the regional collection approach.
2. Compliments to the educational material on recycled content of carpet.
3. CARE should increase the educational content to consumers on recycled content in carpet to promote more sales and offset the consumer transitions to hard surfaces.
4. Retailer outreach should be focused more on carpet retailers, and CARE should provide more information to other flooring surface retailers.
5. CARE and Gigantic Studios are doing a good job with marketing, especially for construction and demolition sectors.
6. Work with manufacturers to improve recycling messages on the back stamp of carpet, such as including CARE's phone number.
7. CARE should send the draft report to the Advisory Committee with more than one week notice for the members to read the entire report.
8. Consider editorial methods to shorten the length of the annual report.
9. Appreciation for including the pounds on the tables with the financial information.
10. On page 85, CARE commits to an update on the in-and-on ground application guidelines in 2021 to ensure safe and legal use of materials, including PC4 and fiber. CARE has submitted these to the Advisory Committee in the past and should also do this for the 2021 guidelines promised in the annual report.
11. Appreciation for CARE on their swift COVID-19 action plan.

Ayes (11): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal, Wes Nelson

Nays (0):

Abstain (0):

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion passes**

### **Clarifying Question**

1. Why did CARE decide to not participate in today's meeting? Please provide an explanation to the Committee and consider participating in the future.

Ayes (11): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Jen Jackson, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Steve Belong, Suna Bayrakal, Wes Nelson

Nays (0):

Abstain (0):

Absent (3): Joe Yarbrough, Steve Landreth, Rachel Palopoli

**The motion passes**

**Additional topics listed during the meeting without specific motions that do not require a response provided for information only:**

1. Reuse strategies for broadloom and tile
2. Format and structure of the report
3. Performance metrics